



National Institute for Public Health
and the Environment
Ministry of Health, Welfare and Sport

Consumer products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims: indications for adverse health effects?

**Consumer products with health, environmental
and/or sustainability claims: indications for
adverse health effects?**

RIVM letter report 2023-0409

Colophon

© RIVM 2024

Parts of this publication may be reproduced, provided acknowledgement is given to the: National Institute for Public Health and the Environment, and the title and year of publication are cited.

RIVM attaches a great deal of importance to the accessibility of its products. However, it is at present not yet possible to provide this document in a completely accessible form. If a part is not accessible, it is mentioned as such. Also see www.rivm.nl/en/accessibility

DOI 10.21945/RIVM-2023-0409

H. Proquin (author), RIVM
M. Saleh (author), RIVM
H. Hendriks (author), RIVM

Contact:

Hester Hendriks
Veiligheid Stoffen en Producten/Consumenten en Product Veiligheid
Hester.hendriks@rivm.nl

This investigation was performed by order, and for the account, of The Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority, within the framework of assignment 9.1.84 ('Inventarisatie Ecologische consumentenproducten').

Published by:
**National Institute for Public Health
and the Environment, RIVM**
P.O. Box 1 | 3720 BA Bilthoven
The Netherlands
www.rivm.nl/en

Synopsis

Consumer products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims: indications for adverse health effects?

Statements such as 'natural', 'organic' or 'vegan' are becoming increasingly common on consumer products. These are referred to as health, environmental and/or sustainability claims. Consumers often think that products with such a claim are healthier and/or safer. The question is whether that assumption is correct, or whether these products can still be harmful to health. For the human body, it makes no difference whether a chemical substance is manmade (synthetic) or natural.

Due to the wide range of consumer products on the market, RIVM has focused on personal care products with words such as 'natural', 'organic' or 'vegan' on the packaging. It identified which chemicals (ingredients) are present in these products. The 35 most common ingredients were investigated further.

For most of these ingredients, it is not expected that normal use of the product containing them will have adverse health effects. However, RIVM does have concerns about 'botanical ingredients' in personal care products. These ingredients come from plants and may contain substances such as linalool and limonene. Linalool and limonene can cause an allergic reaction. Furthermore, there are concerns that botanical ingredients may contain pesticide residues and heavy metals. For many botanical ingredients, there is very limited hazard information available. More research should clarify whether these concerns are justified.

RIVM has also listed which labels are often found on consumer products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims and what they mean. For personal care products, these are mainly COSMetic Organic and Natural Standard (COSMOS), NATRUE and Vegan. In the case of claims such as 'non-toxic', 'free from...' or 'hypoallergenic', it is often not clear to consumers what they mean. Moreover, some claims appear not to comply with the applicable regulations and legislation. Further research could focus on whether the claims investigated in this study comply with regulations.

RIVM considers it important that the meaning of labels and claims on packaging becomes clearer to consumers. It therefore recommends making more information available about this, for instance on the website waarzitwatin.nl.

The European Commission recently presented a draft directive to tighten the regulation of new labels and claims.

Keywords: consumer products, personal care products, claims, labels, botanical ingredients

Publiekssamenvatting

Aanwijzingen voor gezondheidsrisico's in consumentenproducten met claims over gezondheid, milieu en/of duurzaamheid?

Op steeds meer producten staan woorden als 'natuurlijk', 'biologisch' of 'vegan'. Dit zijn zogenaamde gezondheids-, milieu- en/of duurzaamheidsclaims. Consumenten denken vaak dat producten met zo'n claim gezonder en/of veiliger zijn. De vraag is of dat klopt, of dat ze toch schadelijk kunnen zijn voor de gezondheid. Voor het menselijk lichaam maakt het namelijk niet uit of een chemische stof door de mens (synthetisch) of de natuur gemaakt is.

Vanwege het grote aanbod aan producten heeft het RIVM zich gericht op persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten waarop woorden als 'natuurlijk', 'biologisch' of 'vegan' staan. Denk aan shampoo en zeep. Het heeft in kaart gebracht welke chemische stoffen (ingrediënten) erin zitten. De 35 ingrediënten die het meeste voorkomen, zijn verder onderzocht.

Voor de meeste van deze ingrediënten geldt dat normaal gebruik van de producten waar ze in zitten geen schadelijke gezondheidseffecten heeft. Wel heeft het RIVM zorgen over 'plantaardige ingrediënten' in persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten. Deze ingrediënten komen uit planten en kunnen stoffen zoals linalool en limoneen bevatten. Linalool en limoneen kunnen een allergische reactie veroorzaken. Ook zijn er zorgen omdat botanische ingrediënten resten van bestrijdingsmiddelen en zware metalen kunnen bevatten. En van veel botanische ingrediënten is weinig bekend over hun gevaarseigenschappen. Meer onderzoek moet duidelijk maken of deze zorgen terecht zijn.

Het RIVM heeft ook op een rij gezet welke keurmerken vaak staan op consumentenproducten met gezondheids-, milieu- en/of duurzaamheidsclaims en wat ze betekenen. Voor persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten zijn dat vooral COSMetic Organica and Natural Standard (COSMOS), NATRUE en Vegan. Van claims als 'non toxic', 'vrij van...' of 'hypoallergeen' is vaak niet duidelijk wat ze betekenen of wat de fabrikant ermee bedoelt. Bovendien lijken de claims soms niet te voldoen aan de regels en wetten die hiervoor gelden. Meer onderzoek is nodig om te kijken of de producten voldoen.

Het RIVM vindt het belangrijk dat het voor consumenten duidelijker wordt welke keurmerken en claims waarvoor staan. Het raadt daarom onder andere aan meer informatie hierover te geven op de website waarzitwatin.nl. Op Europees niveau wordt gewerkt aan een richtlijn over claims op producten en regels waar milieu-keurmerken aan moeten voldoen.

Kernwoorden: consumentenproducten, persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten, claims, keurmerken, botanische ingrediënten

Contents

Summary — 9

Samenvatting — 11

1 Introduction — 13

2 Definitions of commonly used claims and legislations — 15

- 2.1 Definitions of commonly used claims — 15
 - 2.1.1 Biobased — 15
 - 2.1.2 Natural — 15
 - 2.1.3 Ecological — 15
 - 2.1.4 Organic — 15
 - 2.1.5 Biodegradable — 16
 - 2.1.6 Vegan — 16
- 2.2 Legislations — 16
 - 2.2.1 General Product Safety Regulation (GPSR) — 16
 - 2.2.2 Unfair Commercial Practices Directive (UCPD) — 16
 - 2.2.3 REACH Regulation — 17
 - 2.2.4 Classification Labelling and Packaging (CLP) Regulation — 17
 - 2.2.5 Biocidal Product Regulation (BPR) — 17
 - 2.2.6 Cosmetics Product Regulation (CPR) — 17
 - 2.2.7 Detergents Regulation — 18
 - 2.2.8 Production and labelling of organic products — 18
 - 2.2.9 EU Ecolabel Regulation — 18
 - 2.2.10 Green Claims Directive — 18

3 Mintel GNPD search strategy — 21

- 3.1 Mintel GNPD search strategy — 21
- 3.2 Product information in Mintel GNPD — 21
- 3.3 Ingredients found in Beauty & personal care products — 22
 - 3.3.1 Achillea millefolium (yarrow) — 36
 - 3.3.2 Benzophenone-3 — 36
 - 3.3.3 Benzophenone-4 — 37
 - 3.3.4 Boron nitride — 37
 - 3.3.5 CI 77220 (Calcium carbonate) — 38
 - 3.3.6 Citrus aurantium amara — 38
 - 3.3.7 Citrus grandis — 39
 - 3.3.8 Lavandula hybrida abrial/grosso herb oil, flower water — 39
 - 3.3.9 Litsea cubeba — 40
 - 3.3.10 Rosmarinus officinalis — 40
 - 3.3.11 Salix alba — 41
 - 3.3.12 Squalene — 41
- 3.4 Case study: comparison of two shampoos — 42

4 Labels and certifications — 43

- 4.1 Claims and labels found on products in the Mintel GNPD — 43
 - 4.1.1 Claims — 43
 - 4.1.2 Labels — 47
- 4.2 Other labels and certifications — 51
 - 4.2.1 EU Ecolabel — 51

- 4.2.2 Nordic Swan Ecolabel — 52
- 4.2.3 Cosmos Cosmébio — 52
- 4.2.4 BDIH (Bundesverband der Industrie- und Handelsunternehmen) — 53
- 4.2.5 Certified Sustainable Enterprise — 53
- 4.2.6 Certified Vegan — 53
- 4.2.7 Cleanright — 54
- 4.2.8 Cradle-to-Cradle — 54
- 4.2.9 Ecocert — 55
- 4.2.10 Ecogarantie label — 55
- 4.2.11 ICADA (International Cosmetics And Device Association) — 56
- 4.2.12 Nature Care Products — 56
- 4.2.13 Nature plus — 56

5 Sources of claims and ingredient information on consumer products — 59

- 5.1 Alerts on claims in Safety Gate — 59
- 5.2 Reports by fellow scientific institutes in Europe — 59
 - 5.2.1 DECO — 60
 - 5.2.2 BEUC — 60
 - 5.2.3 TVE — 61
 - 5.2.4 Swedish projects — 62
- 5.3 (Social) media and claims on consumer products — 62
 - 5.3.1 News-related hits — 62
 - 5.3.2 Internet and social media — 63

6 Conclusion and discussion — 65

- 6.1 Definitions and labels — 65
- 6.2 Consumers perspective — 65
- 6.3 Indications for health risk — 66
- 6.4 Recommendations — 68

7 References — 69

8 Acknowledgements — 75

9 Annex I Details of the types of products in the categories defined by Mintel — 77

10 Annex II Complete list of ingredients in Beauty & personal care products with claims as mentioned in the Mintel GNPD — 80

11 Annex III Complete list of ingredients in Beauty & personal care products without claims as mentioned in the Mintel GNPD — 95

Summary

There is an increasing number of products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims on the market. For example 'vegan' shampoo, 'organic' soap, and 'ecological' paint. In this study, it has been investigated whether there are indications of potential health risks for consumers as a result of the use of products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims. In addition, an overview is given of the most common labels and claims used on products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims.

First, ingredient lists of Beauty & personal care products with a health, environmental and/or sustainability claim and without a claim were obtained from Mintel Global New Products Database (GNPD). The database contains several pre-programmed claims which can be selected. For this purpose, the claims 'Vegan/non animal ingredient', 'Vegetarian', and 'All natural products' were selected. Beauty & personal care products which were released on the Dutch market in the last three years with such claims ($n=1925$) contained 2122 different ingredients. An identical list was made of all 1076 ingredients found in Beauty & personal care products without these claims ($n=285$). Next, a list was made containing ingredients which are used in the products with a claim, but are not used in the products without a claim. The regulatory measures of the 35 most frequently used ingredients on this list were checked. Next, 12 ingredients were selected for further analysis. It has been determined in which types of Beauty & personal care products the substances occur and what their function is in the product. Information on their toxicity was investigated in a small literature search.

The results show that most ingredients in the products with a health, environmental and/or sustainability claim have no direct indication for serious health risk, except the frequently used botanical ingredients. While botanical additives like plant extracts in cosmetics sound safe to many people as they come from nature, botanical ingredients like *Achillea millefolium*, *Citrus aurantium amara*, *Citrus grandis*, *Lavandula hybrida*, *Litsea cubeba*, and *Rosmarinus officinalis* have some common reasons for concern. First, they frequently contain allergens such as linalool and limonene. Frequent use (in several products) may result in unwanted skin reactions. Second, there is concern regarding pesticide residues and heavy metals that may be present in botanical ingredients. Further research into the safety of the use of botanical ingredients in consumer products would be valuable. Also ingredients that have not been selected in this screening are of particular interest, because there is no information on them in CLP or the Cosmetic Product Regulation.

Next, the study focussed on labels and claims on consumer products. Currently, there is no specific regulation governing definitions like 'natural' and 'organic'. This results in the emergence of private labels to substantiate claims made by companies about the 'natural' or 'organic' status of their products and/or ingredients. Consequently, as a consumer it is difficult to make sense of the many labels on the environmental performance of products and companies. In March 2023,

the European Commission proposed common criteria against greenwashing and misleading environmental claims. Under the proposal, consumers will have stronger reassurance that when something is sold as green, it actually is green, and clearer information is provided to choose environment-friendly products and services.

In this report it is shown that the leading labels for Beauty & personal care products are COSMOS-standard, NATRUE and Vegan. COSMOS-standard and NATRUE have similar, but not identical, definitions for organic and/or natural ingredients and for natural and/or organic cosmetic final products.

Another point of interest are the claims on the packages of Beauty & personal care products. Claims like 'non-toxic', 'free from...' or 'hypoallergenic' can be confusing for a consumer. For instance: are comparable products without the claim toxic? And is it harmful to use a product that does not state that it is 'free from...'? The meaning of these claims is often unclear and in some cases they may be not in accordance with the guidance on cosmetic claims.

Explanations of complicated terms on products could be communicated to consumers via an online platform such as Waarzitwatin.

Samenvatting

Er komen steeds meer producten met gezondheids-, milieu- en/of duurzaamheidsclaims op de markt. Bijvoorbeeld 'vegan' shampoo, 'biologische' zeep en 'ecologische' verf. In dit onderzoek is onderzocht of er gezondheidsrisico's zijn voor consumenten die producten met gezondheids-, milieu- en/of duurzaamheidsclaims gebruiken. Daarnaast zijn de meest voorkomende labels en claims op producten onderzocht.

In dit onderzoek zijn ingrediëntenlijsten van beauty- en persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten met een gezondheids-, milieu- en/of duurzaamheidsclaim en zonder claim verkregen uit de Mintel Global New Products Database (GNPD). Deze database bevat verschillende voorgeprogrammeerde claims die gebruikt kunnen worden voor dataselectie. Voor deze studie zijn de claims 'Vegan/non animal ingredient', 'Vegetarian', en 'All natural products' gebruikt. Beauty- en persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten die de afgelopen drie jaar met dergelijke claims op de Nederlandse markt zijn gebracht ($n=1925$), bevatten 2122 verschillende ingrediënten. Een identieke lijst is gemaakt van alle ingrediënten ($n=1076$) die worden aangetroffen in beauty- en persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten zonder deze claims ($n=285$). Vervolgens is een lijst gemaakt met ingrediënten die wel in de producten met claim voorkomen, maar niet in de producten zonder claim. Voor 35 van de meest gebruikte ingrediënten van deze lijst is gekeken naar de geldende wet- en regelgevingen. Vervolgens werden 12 ingrediënten geselecteerd voor verdere analyse. Er is bepaald in welke soorten beauty- en persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten de ingrediënten voorkomen en wat hun functie is in het product. Informatie over de toxiciteit van deze stoffen werd onderzocht door middel van een klein literatuuronderzoek.

Uit de resultaten blijkt dat de meeste ingrediënten in de producten met een gezondheids-, milieu- en/of duurzaamheidsclaim geen directe indicatie hebben voor een ernstig gezondheidsrisico, met uitzondering van de veelgebruikte botanische ingrediënten. Hoewel botanische additieven zoals plantenextracten in cosmetica voor veel mensen als 'veilig' in de oren klinkt omdat ze uit de natuur komen, hebben botanische ingrediënten zoals *Achillea millefolium*, *Citrus aurantium amara*, *Citrus grandis*, *Lavandula hybrida*, *Litsea cubeba* en *Rosmarinus officinalis* een aantal redenen tot zorg. Ten eerste bevatten ze vaak allergenen zoals linalool en limoneen. Veelvuldig gebruik (in meerdere producten) kan daardoor ongewenste huidreacties veroorzaken. Ten tweede zijn er zorgen over residuen van bestrijdingsmiddelen en zware metalen die mogelijk aanwezig zijn in botanische ingrediënten. Verder onderzoek naar de veiligheid van het gebruik van botanische ingrediënten in consumentenproducten zou waardevol zijn. Interessant zijn ook de ingrediënten die in deze screening niet zijn geselecteerd, omdat daarover geen informatie beschikbaar is in de CLP wetgeving of de Cosmeticaverordening.

Vervolgens richtte het onderzoek zich op keurmerken en claims die op verpakkingen van consumentenproducten te vinden zijn. Momenteel

bestaat er geen specifieke regelgeving voor definities als 'natuurlijk' en 'biologisch'. Dit resulteert in een wildgroei van keurmerken waarmee producenten de 'natuurlijke' of 'biologische' status van hun producten en/of ingrediënten onderbouwen. Als consument is het daardoor lastig om de betrouwbaarheid van de vele keurmerken in te kunnen schatten. In maart 2023 heeft de Europese Commissie gemeenschappelijke criteria voorgesteld tegen greenwashing en misleidende milieucclaims. Volgens het voorstel zullen consumenten er meer op kunnen vertrouwen dat wanneer iets als 'groen' wordt verkocht, het ook daadwerkelijk groen is, en wordt er duidelijkere informatie verstrekt om milieuvriendelijke producten en diensten te kiezen.

In dit rapport wordt beschreven dat de drie toonaangevende keurmerken voor beauty- en persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten COSMetic Organic and Natural Standard (COSMOS), NATRUE en Vegan zijn. De COSMOS-standaard en NATRUE hebben vergelijkbare, maar niet identieke, definities voor biologische en/of natuurlijke ingrediënten en voor natuurlijke en/of biologische cosmetische eindproducten.

Een ander aandachtspunt zijn de claims op de verpakkingen van beauty- & persoonlijke verzorgingsproducten. Claims als 'niet giftig' ('non-toxic'), 'vrij van...' ('free from...') of 'hypoallergeen' kunnen voor een consument verwarrend zijn. Bijvoorbeeld: zijn vergelijkbare producten zonder de claim dan dus giftig? En is het schadelijk om een product te gebruiken waarop niet vermeld staat dat het 'vrij is van...'? De betekenis van deze claims is vaak onduidelijk en in sommige gevallen zijn ze mogelijk niet in overeenstemming met de richtlijnen voor cosmetische claims.

Uitleg van ingewikkelde termen op producten zou via een online platform zoals Waarzitwatin aan consumenten kunnen worden gecommuniceerd.

1 Introduction

Health, environmental and/or sustainability claims are becoming increasingly common on consumer products. This varies from 'vegan' shampoo, 'organic' soap to 'ecological' paint. It is expected that natural and botanical raw materials will be used more often in these products than in products without these claims. In addition, there is often an assumption among consumers that 'natural', 'organic' or 'ecological' also means 'healthier'. However, there is no toxicological difference between the same substance synthesized in a factory or extracted from a plant.

By promoting consumer products with health, environmental, and/or sustainability claims such as 'vegan' and 'natural', consumers can wrongly assume that the use of the products is safe and does not entail any health risks.

In the current study, indications of potential health risks for consumers as a result of the use of products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims were investigated. First, the definition of health, environmental and sustainability claims is given in Chapter 2. Also the regulatory frameworks within the European Union and the Netherlands that are relevant for non-food consumer products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims are described. To determine whether ingredients of products with such claims differ from products without these claims, the ingredients of both groups have been listed using the Mintel Global New Products Database (GNPD)¹. This is described in Chapter 3. Initially, the focus was on personal care products (incl. cosmetics) and household products. For each product type, overviews are made of the ingredients, claims and warnings that appear on the packaging. Next, substances that are used only in products with (a) claim(s) are screened on potential concerns. It is described whether further investigation is recommended on specific ingredients. In Chapter 4, an extensive description is given of the various (types of) claims and certifications to provide a better insight on the claims that were found in the Mintel GNPD. Chapter 5 describes further the alert system of the EU 'Safety gate' and the information from other scientific institutes or consumer organisations on products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims. In addition, (social) media were searched for their advice to consumers and how they influence the choice of products. Finally in Chapter 6, conclusions and recommendations on the subject are given.

Information on claims and/or labels on environmental impact (e.g. CO₂ foot print), (micro)plastics, and animal testing are not included in this report.

¹ <https://www.mintel.com/>

2 Definitions of commonly used claims and legislations

In this chapter, the most common claims will be described as well as the regulation related to claims on personal care products (incl. cosmetics), and detergent products.

2.1 Definitions of commonly used claims

2.1.1 *Biobased*

The term 'biomass-based' or 'bio-based' refers to the origin of the raw material and is defined as "a product wholly or partly derived from biomass" [1]. The prefix 'bio' can refer to different functionalities (biodegradable, biocompatible, etc.) or processes (biological or biotechnological processes). To ensure transparent and non-misleading information to consumers, the prefix 'bio' should be substituted by more accurate and more informative equivalents and should refer to a European or International Standard. For example, NEN-EN 16575 [1] defines general terms to be used in the field of bio-based products, including horizontal aspects relevant for bio-based product standards. NEN-EN 16935 [2] specifies requirements for transparent and non-misleading business-to consumer communication of characteristics of bio-based products by means of labelling and claims. It does not specify requirements for bio-based products.

2.1.2 *Natural*

The term 'natural ingredients' is in Guideline ISO 16128 for cosmetic ingredients [3] defined as: "Natural ingredients are cosmetic ingredients obtained only from plants, animals, micro-organisms or minerals, including those obtained from these materials by

- physical processes (e.g. grinding, drying, distillation),
- fermentation reactions occurring in nature and leading to molecules which occur in nature, and
- other procedures of preparation including traditional ones (e.g. extraction using solvents) without intentional chemical modification".

2.1.3 *Ecological*

The terms ecological and organic are often used interchangeably, but do not have the same meaning. Organic refers to the farming method used to obtain goods. An organic product falls under a certain regulation and must follow specifications (see 2.1.4). Ecological does also include the complete life cycle assessment, including avoiding the ecosystem to be harmed during the production process. For the moment, the EU has not defined the term ecological product and the criteria to be able to state that on the label.

2.1.4 *Organic*

According EU regulation 2018/848 [4], an organic product is "a product resulting from organic production, other than a product produced during the conversion period referred to in Article 10. The products of hunting or fishing of wild animals are not considered as organic products". Detergents, for example, are not unprocessed or processed agricultural

products for use as food, they therefore do not fall under the scope of the EU organic legislation and can be neither certified as organic, nor labelled or advertised using the EU organic logo.

The term 'organic ingredients' is in Guideline ISO 16128 for cosmetic ingredients [3] defined as: "Organic ingredients are natural ingredients originating from organic farming methods or from wild harvesting in compliance with national legislation or equivalent International Standards where applicable". There is no set definition for organic detergents. The term organic or biological is also sometimes used for products based on enzymes or micro-organisms. However, the correct term in that context is microbiological.

2.1.5 *Biodegradable*

A biodegradable substance is one that can be broken down under the influence of micro-organisms into the naturally occurring substances water, carbon dioxide and inorganic salts. All detergents marketed in Europe must comply with the Detergents Regulation ((EC) No. 648/2004) [5] which requires that all surfactants in detergents and cleaning products must be biodegradable. For biodegradable plastics the EN 13432 standard prescribes time limits within which 90% material has to be degraded to be considered biodegradable [6].

2.1.6 *Vegan*

This term includes products that do not contain ingredients derived from animals, or animal by-products or by an intermediate process involving animals.

2.2 **Legislations**

The claims 'natural', 'vegan', 'ecological', 'organic', etc. are now commonplace in different consumer products. Several regulatory frameworks within the European Union and the Netherlands are relevant for non-food consumer products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims. In the Netherlands, the Dutch Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (NVWA) is the enforcement authority for compliance with laws and regulations on advertising. They have an enforcement role and can impose sanctions for companies that do not abide by these rules. The relevant EU legislation is described in this chapter.

2.2.1 *General Product Safety Regulation (GPSR)*

Regulation (EU) 2023/988 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 10 May 2023 on general product safety replaces Directive 2001/95/EC and aims to ensure the health and safety of consumers and the functioning of the internal market. It addresses the product safety challenges of emerging technologies, including the use of artificial intelligence (AI) and connected devices, and establishes clear obligations for online marketplaces. In the Netherlands, the rules are described in the General Product Safety and the Dutch Commodities Act (Warenwet [7]).

2.2.2 *Unfair Commercial Practices Directive (UCPD)*

Product claims are frequently subject to a framework regulation (e.g. the EC guideline Unfair Commercial Practices Directive (UCPD,

2005/29/EC) [8]) and self-regulation (e.g. the International Chamber of Commerce Code and national codes like the Stichting Reclame Code and Reclame Code Commissie) that is comprehensive and ensures consumer protection from misleading claims. The main purpose of the UCPD is to ensure fair communication towards consumers. The directive applies to all products offered on the European market, but does not provide specific rules regarding health, environmental and sustainability claims.

2.2.3 *REACH Regulation*

Regulation (EC) No 1907/2006 concerning the Registration, Evaluation, Authorisation and Restriction of Chemicals (REACH) [9] provides definitions for:

- "Substances which occur in nature: means a naturally occurring substance as such, unprocessed or processed only by manual, mechanical or gravitational means, by dissolution in water, by flotation, by extraction with water, by steam distillation or by heating solely to remove water, or which is extracted from air by any means", and
- "Not chemically modified substance: means a substance whose chemical structure remains unchanged, even if it has undergone a chemical process or treatment, or a physical mineralogical transformation, for instance to remove impurities".

2.2.4 *Classification Labelling and Packaging (CLP) Regulation*

In the regulation on classification, labelling and packaging of substances and mixtures (EC No 1272/2008) [10], it is mentioned that "Statements such as 'non-toxic', 'non-harmful', 'non-polluting', 'ecological' or other statements indicating that the substance or mixture is not hazardous or any other statements that are inconsistent with its classification should not appear on the label or packaging of any substance or mixture".

2.2.5 *Biocidal Product Regulation (BPR)*

In the Biocidal Product Regulation ((EU) No 528/2012) [11], it is stated that "authorisation holders shall ensure that labels are not misleading in respect of the risks from the product to human health, animal health or the environment or its efficacy and, in any case, do not mention the indications 'low-risk biocidal product', 'non-toxic', 'harmless', 'natural', 'environmentally friendly', 'animal friendly' or similar indications.". And "Advertisements for biocidal products shall not refer to the product in a manner which is misleading in respect of the risks from the product to human health, animal health or the environment or its efficacy. In any case, the advertising of a biocidal product shall not mention 'low-risk biocidal product', 'non-toxic', 'harmless', 'natural', 'environmentally friendly', 'animal friendly' or any similar indication".

2.2.6 *Cosmetics Product Regulation (CPR)*

In Regulation (EU) No 1223/2009 on cosmetic products [12], it is mentioned that "The consumer should be protected from misleading claims concerning efficacy and other characteristics of cosmetic products". Cosmetic product claims must comply with the legally binding Common Criteria Regulation (Regulation (EU) No 655/2013) [13] which lays down six criteria that must be met for the justification of claims used in relation to cosmetic products:

- legal compliance

- truthfulness
- evidential support
- honesty
- fairness
- informed decision-making

The use of claims like vegan, natural or organic on cosmetic products is also covered by the above mentioned six criteria. The claim can provide an opportunity for a consumer to make an informed choice, but they should not imply any additional benefit for the consumer other than the factual ones (e.g. it should not be claimed that products are safer because they contain natural ingredients).

The European Commission updated the guidelines for the cosmetic claims in 2017. This Technical Document [14] further specifies when the 'free from' and 'hypoallergenic' claims can be used.

2.2.7 *Detergents Regulation*

All detergents marketed in Europe must comply with the Detergents Regulation ((EC) No. 648/2004) [5]. There are no provisions on claims in this regulation, however it is stated that all surfactants in detergents and cleaning products must be biodegradable. In most cases, surfactants are the main component of a washing or cleaning product.

2.2.8 *Production and labelling of organic products*

Regulation (EU) 2018/848 [4] sets out the rules on production, certification, labelling and advertising of organic food and feed. Cosmetics and detergents do not fall under the scope of the EU organic legislation and can be neither certified as organic, nor labelled or advertised using the EU organic logo. Therefore, this regulation does not prevent the use of the terms that refer to the organic production method, such as 'biological' or 'ecological', in products not related to agricultural products or not in the scope of the EU organic legislation, or whenever not liable to mislead the consumers.

2.2.9 *EU Ecolabel Regulation*

In Regulation (EC) No 66/2010 [15] on the EU Ecolabel, the criteria for the EU Ecolabel, developed at European level are described. EU Ecolabel is the official European environmental label and is recognised by all European Union countries, plus Norway, Iceland, and Liechtenstein. The label imposes sustainability requirements on the entire lifecycle of products and services. Displaying the EU Ecolabel indicates that the product or service has a reduced negative impact on the environment, public health, the climate, and natural resources. The EU Ecolabel is an ISO type I label and operates in accordance with ISO standard 14024 [16].

2.2.10 *Green Claims Directive*

A Commission study from 2020 highlighted that 53.3% of examined environmental claims in the EU were found to be vague, misleading or unfounded and 40% were unsubstantiated [17]. These voluntary green claims lead to 'greenwashing': the presentation of an environmentally responsible public image by a trader in a way that is unfounded or misleading and thereby creating an uneven playing field in the EU's market, to the disadvantage of genuinely sustainable companies.

In March 2023, the European Commission proposed common criteria against greenwashing and misleading environmental claims [18] in the Green Claims Directive. The proposal aims to improve the clarity and accuracy of green claims and provide consumers with higher quality information to choose environment-friendly products and services. Businesses will also benefit, as those that make a genuine effort to improve the environmental sustainability of their products will be more easily recognised and rewarded by consumers and able to boost their sales – rather than face unfair competition. In this way, the proposal will help establish a level playing field when it comes to information about environmental performance of products.

Several rules will make sure that claims are communicated clearly. For example, claims or labels that use aggregate scoring of the product's overall environmental impact, will no longer be permitted, unless compliant with EU rules. If products or organisations are compared with others, such comparisons should be based on equivalent information and data.

The proposal will also regulate environmental labels. There are currently at least 230 different labels [18] and there is evidence that this leads to consumer confusion and distrust. To control the proliferation of such labels, new public labelling schemes will not be allowed, unless developed at EU level, and any new private schemes will need to show higher environmental ambition than existing ones and get a pre-approval to be allowed. There are detailed rules about environmental labels in general: they must also be reliable, transparent, independently verified, and regularly reviewed.

However, according to the ordinary legislative procedure, the Green Claims Directive proposal will first be subject to the approval of the European Parliament and the Council.

3 Mintel GNPD search strategy

To determine whether the composition of products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims differ from products without these claims, the ingredients of both groups have been listed using the Mintel Global New Products Database (GNPD). In this chapter, we describe on which criteria the products and ingredients lists were retrieved from the database. Ingredient lists were made for products with and without a claim. The 35 most used ingredients in products with a claim which were not used in product without a claim, were analysed. Moreover, in a case study two similar products, one with claims and a similar one from the same brand without claims, were compared.

3.1 Mintel GNPD search strategy

The Mintel Global New Products Database (GNPD)² was used as source for product information, such as the name, type, ingredients, and claims. Mintel GNPD contains detailed data on new products launched in the food, beverage, beauty & personal care, healthcare, household goods, and pet care markets. The product information is derived from the packaging of products in shops. It covers 270 subcategories, 140 product claims, 200 packaging attributes, and over 46,000 ingredients.

In order to analyse the link between the different types of products with their associated claims and ingredients the products must comply to all of the following criteria:

- (only) sold in the Netherlands,
- Included in the database in the last 3 years (the database does not remove older products that are no longer on the market),
- falling in/belonging to at least one of the two main product categories: Beauty & personal care or Household.

The database contains several pre-programmed claims which can be selected. For this study, the claims 'Vegan/non animal ingredient', 'Vegetarian', and 'All natural products' were selected. These groups were chosen as they were expected to be the most relevant groups that would contain products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims. No other group of claims seemed to be relevant for this report.

Details of the types of products included in both categories can be found in Annex I.

3.2 Product information in Mintel GNPD

Table 1 provides the details of the search strategy in Mintel GNPD and the number of products that were used for further analysis in this study. The results from the search give an overview of the product (variant), brand, company, date published, (sub-)category, price in Euros, positioning claims, storage, unit pack size, package type, package material, number of variants, product description, launch type, barcode, flavours, fragrances, ingredients (data not shown).

² <https://www.mintel.com/>

Table 1 Details search criteria Mintel GNPD.

Category	Criteria subcategories	Claims	Search details (search performed on July 10, 2023)	Result (number of products)
Beauty & personal care	Without absorbent hygiene	Vegan/non animal ingredient Vegetarian All natural products	Netherlands Last complete 3 years	1925
Beauty & personal care	Without absorbent hygiene	Does not match on or more of Vegan/non animal ingredient Vegetarian All natural products	Netherlands Last complete 3 years	285
Household products	All	Vegan/non animal ingredient Vegetarian All natural products	Netherlands Last complete 3 years	206
Household products	All	Does not match on or more of Vegan/non animal ingredient Vegetarian All natural products	Netherlands Last complete 3 years	1026

There were more Beauty & personal care products with a claim added to Mintel GNPD than products without a claim in the last 3 years, while it is the other way around for Household products.

Due to the large amount of ingredients found and time constraints, further analysis was only performed on the data of the Beauty & personal care products, and not on Household products.

3.3 Ingredients found in Beauty & personal care products

The Beauty & personal care products ($n=1925$) with a claim like 'vegan/non animal ingredient', 'vegetarian' or 'all natural products' contained 2122 different ingredients (see Annex II). A similar list was made of all ingredients ($n=1076$) found in the 'Beauty & personal care products without claims' ($n=285$; see Annex III). Almost twice as many ingredients are found in the Beauty & personal care products with a claim. This can be explained by the fact that more (different) products were in the list of products with a claim compared to the products without a claim (which is probably due to the search settings).

Next, the different ingredient lists were compared. Ingredients which were used in Beauty & personal care products with a claim, but not in products without a claim, were listed. The 35 most frequently used ingredients from this list are shown in Table 2. The regulatory measures of these 35 most frequently used ingredients were checked in the CPR [12] and for harmonised classification (CLP Regulation [10]) (see Table 2). None of the substances is mentioned on the substances of very high concern (SVHC) list³.

³ <https://echa.europa.eu/candidate-list-table>

Based on the found information, 12 substances (green shaded in Table 2) were selected for further analysis. For these ingredients, it has been investigated in which types of Beauty & personal care products they occur and what the function of the ingredient in the product is. In addition, a limited literature search was performed to obtain information on the toxicity of the ingredients.

Table 2 Most frequently used ingredients in Beauty & personal care products with claims which were not found in Beauty & personal care products without claims

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
Denatonium benzoate	56	Denaturant, Fragrance	3734-33-6	223-095-2	No		Not classified		No
Macadamia integrifolia seed oil	40	Skin conditioning, Hair conditioning	159518-86-2; 438545-25-6; 129811-19-4	605-184-1; 610-153-0; 603-361-8; 924-613-6	No		Not classified		No
Glyceryl laurate	38	Skin conditioning (emollient), Surfactant (emulsifying)	59070-56-3 27215-38-9; 142-18-7	680-846-0 248-337-4; 205-526-6	No		Not classified		No
Ethylhexyl stearate	37	Skin conditioning (emollient)	22047-49-0	244-754-0	No		Not classified		No
Cucumis sativus (cucumber)	35	Skin conditioning (emollient)	89998-01-6	289-738-4; 918-550-3	No		Not classified		No
Benzophenone-4	31	Light stabilizer, UV absorber, UV filter	4065-45-6	223-772-2	Annex VI, entry 22	Maximum concentration in ready for use preparation: 5% (as acid)	Not classified	There is broad agreement in that a majority of data submitters	Yes

⁴ As mentioned in the cosmetic ingredient database CosIng: <https://ec.europa.eu/growth/tools-databases/cosing/>, information retrieved on August 25, 2023

⁵ Information retrieved on August 25, 2023

⁶ As mentioned in the ECHA database: <https://echa.europa.eu/nl/home>, information retrieved on August 25, 2023

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
								agree this substance is Skin sensitising (100% of REACH registrations). Listed in EDC list II	
Beta-sitosterol	30	Emulsion stabilising, Fragrance, Skin conditioning, Light stabilizer	83-46-5	201-480-6	No		Not classified		No
Isoamyl laurate	30	Skin conditioning (emollient)	6309-51-9	228-626-1	No		Not classified		No
Squalene	28	Skin conditioning (emollient), Hair conditioning, Solvent	111-02-4	203-826-1	Annex II, entry 419	Prohibited Category 1 material and Category 2 material as defined in Articles 4 and 5 respectively of Regulation (EC) No 1774/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council, and ingredients derived therefrom	Not classified		Yes

Substance	Frequency	Function⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12]⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
Mangifera indica	27	Abrasive; Skin conditioning (emollient); Skin protecting	90063-86-8	290-045-4; 926-514-3	No		Not classified		No
Althaea officinalis	22	Skin conditioning (emollient)	73049-65-7	277-254-6	No		Not classified		No
Carthamus tinctorius (safflower)	22	Fragrance, Skin conditioning (emollient), Emulsion stabilising	8001-23-8	232-276-5; 926-590-8	No		Not classified		No
Glucose	22	Humectant	50-99-7	200-075-1	No		Not classified		No
Rhus verniciflua peel cera	22	Skin conditioning (emollient), Light stabilizer	-	-	No		Not classified		No

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
CI 77220 (Calcium carbonate)	20	Colorant	72608-12-9; 207-439-9; 471-34-1; 1317-65-3	615-782-4; 471-34-1; 207-439-9; 215-279-6	Annex IV, entry 124	Purity criteria as set out in Commission Directive 95/45/EC (E 170)	Not classified	Substance is known to be on the EEA market in nanomaterial form, as indicated in the REACH registered substance factsheet(s), and as listed in the EUON Nanomaterials in the EU market list. Registration dossiers submitted to ECHA for this substance have been evaluated under REACH.	Yes

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
Citrus grandis	20	Skin conditioning (emollient), Perfuming, Absorbent, Astringent, Tonic	90045-43-5; 8016-20-4	289-904-6; 616-973-5			Not classified	There is broad agreement in that a majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising (100% of REACH registrations).	Yes

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
Benzophenone-3	19	Light stabilizer, UV absorber, UV filter	131-57-7	205-031-5	Annex VI, entry 4	Maximum concentration in ready for use preparation: a) Face products, hand products, and lip products, excluding propellant and pump spray products: 6%; b) Body products, including propellant and pump spray products 2,2%; c) Other products 0,5%. For a) and b) Not more than 0,5 % to protect product formulation a) If used at 0,5 % to protect product formulation, the levels used as UV filter must not exceed 5,5 %. b) If used at 0,5 % to protect product formulation, the levels used as UV filter must not exceed 1,7 %. Wording of conditions of use and warnings: For a) and b): Contains	Not classified	Under assessment as Endocrine Disrupting (ED list). Listed in EDC list II	Yes

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
						Benzophenone-3 (Not required if concentration is 0,5 % or less and when it is used only for product protection purposes.)			
Tetrasodium iminodisuccinate	19	Chelating	144538-83-0	604-420-0	No		Not classified		
Carica papaya	18	Tonic, Skin conditioning,	84012-30-6	281-675-0	No		Not classified		No
Oenothera biennis	18	Skin conditioning	90028-66-3	289-859-2	No		Not classified		No

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
(evening primrose)		(emollient), Astringent							
Achillea millefolium (yarrow)	17	Fragrance, Skin conditioning, Anti-seborrheic, Cleansing, Refreshing, Soothing, Tonic, Perfuming	84082-83-7; 8022-07-9	282-030-6; 639-661-0	No		Not classified	A majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising	Yes
Polyglyceryl-3 distearate	17	Surfactant (emulsifying)	9009-32-9; 94423-19-5		No		Not classified		No
Salix alba	17	Skin conditioning, Astringent, Soothing, Tonic, Hair conditioning	84082-82-6	282-029-0	No		Not classified	A majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising	Yes
Sclerotium gum	17	Emulsion stabilising, skin conditioning, Viscosity controlling	39464-87-4	254-464-6	No		Not classified		No

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
Bertholletia excelsa	16	Skin conditioning (emollient, miscellaneous), Abrasive, Skin protecting	356065-50-4	609-151-2	No		Not classified		No
Citrus aurantium amara	16	Humectant, Skin conditioning (emollient), Refreshing, Fragrance	72968-50-4; 68916-04-1	277-143-2	Annex III, entry 350 and 351		Not classified	UVCB; There is broad agreement in that a majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising (100% of REACH registrations).	Yes
Lavandula hybrida abrial/gross o herb oil, flower water	16	Perfuming	93455-96-0	297-384-7	Annex III, entry 360		Not classified	A majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising	Yes
Litsea cubeba	16	Fragrance, Tonic, Perfuming	68855-99-2; 90063-59-5	290-018-7	No		Not classified	A majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising	Yes

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
polyglyceryl-4 laurate	16	Surfactant (emulsifying)	75798-42-4	640-999-6	No		Not classified		No
Rosmarinus officinalis	16	Antioxidant, Deodorant, Skin conditioning, Perfuming, Antimicrobial, Refreshing, Tonic, Fragrance	84604-14-8	283-291-9	No		Not classified	UVCB; There is broad agreement in that a majority of data submitters agree this substance is Skin sensitising (100% of REACH registrations).	Yes
Boron nitride	15	Buling, Slip modifier	10043-11-5	701-292-9	No		Not classified	There is no overall agreement among data submitters, but a minority indicate they consider this substance as Toxic to Reproduction (0.2% of CLP notifications). Of the minority	Yes

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
								indicating the property of concern, most indicate that it may relate to an impurity or additive rather than the substance itself.	
Illite (yellow clay)	15	Abrasive, Absorbent, Anticaking, Bulking	12173-60-3	601-803-4	No		Not classified		No
Rosa canina (rosehip)	15	Astringent, Skin conditioning (emollient), humectant, Keratolytic, Fragrance, Tonic	84696-47-9	283-652-0	No		Not classified		No
Vaccinium myrtillus (bilberry)	15	Antioxidant, Astringent, Hair conditioning, Nail conditioning,	84082-34-8	281-983-5	No		Not classified		No

Substance	Frequency	Function ⁴	CAS	EC	Cosmetics Regulation [12] ⁵	Conditions for use in cosmetics as stated in Cosmetics Regulation	Harmonised classification CLP ⁶	Properties of concern	Further analysis
		Skin conditioning							
Vitis vinifera	15	Skin conditioning (emollient), Fragrance, Skin protecting, Antioxidant	85594-37-2; 84929-27-1; 8024-22-4	287-896-9; 284-511-6	No		Not classified		No

Green shaded ingredients were selected for further analysis.

3.3.1 *Achillea millefolium* (yarrow)

Achillea millefolium (yarrow) is found in the categories face/neck care, shampoo, shower products, conditioner, hair treatments, and body care. *Achillea millefolium* extract can be made from different parts of the plant:

- *Achillea millefolium* extract (CAS nr. 84082-83-7): the extract of the whole plant, which functions as fragrance ingredient, skin-conditioning agent.
- *Achillea millefolium* flower extract: the extract of the flowers of the plant, which functions as antioxidants, skin-conditioning agent.
- *Achillea millefolium* flower/leaf/stem extract: the extract of the flowers, leaves and stems of the plant, which functions as skin-conditioning agent.

Achillea extract is often supplied in polypropylene glycol and functions as fragrance or skin conditioning agent in cosmetic products. It is a multi-constituent substance of biological origin. Sesquiterpene lactones, polyacetylenes, simple coumarins, and flavonoids have been identified among the many components of *achillea millefolium* [19]. Constituents of concern in the plant are linalool (1-4000 ppm), thujone, quercetin, α -peroxyachifolid, and hydroquinone [20]. Linalool is a dermal sensitizer and has toxic effects. Thujone has been reported to cause neurological toxic effects; the suggested acceptable daily intake was 3-7 mg/kg/d. Quercetin has been reported to have some positive genotoxic effects. Hydroquinone has been reported to cause skin depigmentation and has a harmonized classification for Mutagenicity Cat 2, Carcinogenicity Cat 2 and Skin sensitization. However, the maximum concentration of use of *achillea millefolium*-derived extracts in cosmetics was reported to be 0.04%. For this reason the Cosmetic Ingredient Review (CIR) in the USA concluded that exposures to these constituents in cosmetics containing *achillea millefolium* would be below levels of toxicological concern.

The levels of constituents of concern in the ingredients derived from plants can vary widely and may even be undetectable, depending on the growing conditions of the plant, the methods of manufacturing of the ingredient, and other factors.

Although *achillea millefolium* has no harmonised classification, a majority of data submitters agree that the substance is skin sensitising. This may, however, for example be explained by the fact that *achillea millefolium* contains the dermal sensitizer linalool which is included in Annex III of the CPR (List of substances which cosmetic products must not contain except subject to the restrictions laid down) [12]. In addition, there is concern regarding pesticide residues and heavy metals that may be present in botanical ingredients [20-22]. Also, the use of other botanical ingredients in a cosmetic product that may contain constituents of concern (e.g., potential sensitizers) in combination with ingredients from the *achillea millefolium* could result in exposures that exceed levels of concern.

3.3.2 *Benzophenone-3*

Benzophenone-3 (BP-3) is used as an UV-filter in sunscreen products and is included in Annex VI (List of UV filters allowed in cosmetic

products) of the CPR [12] in which a maximum concentration for specific product types is included.

The substance is mainly found in soap and bath products and skincare products.

According to the ECHA website, this substance is under assessment for endocrine disruption properties, and it is included in the Community Rolling Action Plan (CoRAP). CLP notifiers indicate this substance is 'toxic to aquatic life with long lasting effects', 'very toxic to aquatic life', 'causes serious eye irritation', 'causes skin irritation, and may cause respiratory irritation'. However, the substance has no harmonised classification.

The Scientific Committee on Consumer Safety (SCCS) has performed a safety assessment concerning the possible endocrine disrupting properties of benzophenone-3 used as UV filter in sunscreens [23]. It was concluded that BP-3 is not safe for the consumer to use in sunscreens as body cream, sunscreen propellant spray or pump spray up to the maximum concentration of 6%. However, concentrations up to a maximum total concentration of 2.2% is considered safe in these products in case the substance is not additionally used as a protector in the same formulation. If so, the substance's concentration as a UV filter should not exceed 1,7%. Additionally, it is considered safe to use BP-3 as sunscreen in face and hands creams and lipsticks in concentrations up to 6%. Moreover, SCCS considered it safe to use this substance as UV-stabiliser to protect cosmetic formulations against sunlight up to 0.5% [23].

3.3.3 *Benzophenone-4*

Similar to benzophenone-3, benzophenone-4 (BP-4) is used as an UV-filter in sunscreen products in a concentration up to 5%, and as UV-stabiliser to protect cosmetic formulations against sunlight.

BP-4 is mainly found in soap and bath products, skincare, and shampoo. In the ECHA database, the majority of data submitters identified this substance as skin sensitising. In addition, REACH and CLP notifications and registrations considered that BP-4 causes 'serious eye damage', 'causes skin irritation', and 'may cause an allergic skin reaction'. SCCS considered recently that the use of BP-4 is safe when used as UV filter up to a maximum concentration of 5% in sunscreen, face and hand cream, lipstick, sunscreen propellant spray and pump spray, when used separately or in combination [24].

3.3.4 *Boron nitride*

Boron nitride is an inorganic compound that is widely used in cosmetics in its hexagonal crystal form [25]. It is found products in the categories eye colour cosmetics, face colour cosmetics, and skin care. Due to its unique graffiti- and ceramic-like smoothness and thermal inertness, boron nitride is utilized as a slip modifier, which allows substances to flow more readily and smoothly without chemical reaction [25, 26].

Boron nitride does not have a harmonized classification. However, a minority of CLP notifiers indicate they consider this substance as toxic to reproduction (0.2% of CLP notifications), which is caused by an impurity or additive rather than the substance itself. However, there are no reproductive toxicity studies with boron nitride to either confirm or reject this assumption. It is also noted that boron itself is a well-known reproductive toxicant.

Another concern is the possible presence of nano particles, although boron nitride is not marketed as a nano material.

There are no restrictions for boron nitride in the European Union list of cosmetic ingredients [12]. The CIR evaluated the safety of using boron nitride in cosmetics concluding it is safe, based on its inability to penetrate the outer layer of the skin [25, 27].

3.3.5 *CI 77220 (Calcium carbonate)*

CI 77220 (calcium carbonate) is a white pigment which is mainly found in toothpaste, tooth whitening powder, and coloured cosmetics. The pigment is the product obtained from ground limestone or by the precipitation of calcium ions with carbonate ions. Calcium carbonate is included in Annex IV (List of colorants allowed in cosmetic products), entry 124 of the CPR, and contains the note "Purity criteria as set out in Commission Directive 95/45/EC (E 170)" [12]. Commission Directive 95/45/EC is no longer in force, the purity criteria are now included in Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 of 9 March 2012 laying down specifications for food additives listed in Annexes II and III to Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council [28]. The regulation sets maximal values for magnesium and alkali salts, fluoride, antimony, copper, chromium, zinc, barium, lead, and cadmium. Impurities found in calcium carbonate consist mainly of magnesium carbonate, quartz, clay, and mica [29]. Aluminium is a structural element of both clay and mica. In a recent report by EFSA, it was mentioned that exposure to aluminium via calcium carbonate in food, would exhaust a substantial percentage of the tolerable weekly intake or even largely exceed it [29]. There seems not to be concern with regard to the exposure to small particles, including nanoparticles, present in calcium carbonate [30].

3.3.6 *Citrus aurantium amara*

Citrus aurantium amara is mainly found in the product categories face/neck care, body care, shower products, conditioner, fragrances, face cleansers, and hand/nail care.

Citrus aurantium amara is included in the CPR in Annex III entry 350 and 351, stating that it should be included on the label from 0.01% in rinse-off products and 0.001% in leave-on products due to its sensitizing properties. This is an update of the regulation that applies to many fragrance compounds and will apply to products placed on the EU market from 31 July 2026 and made available on the EU market from 31 July 2028. [12].

Ingredients from the *citrus aurantium amara* can be extracted from different parts of the plant:

- *Citrus Aurantium Amara* (Bitter Orange) Flower Extract (CAS Nr. 72968-50-4): the extract of the flowers of *citrus aurantium amara*, which functions as skin-conditioning agents
- *Citrus Aurantium Amara* (Bitter Orange) Flower Oil: the volatile oil obtained from the flowers of *citrus aurantium amara*, which functions as fragrance ingredients; skin-conditioning agents
- *Citrus Aurantium Amara* (Bitter Orange) Flower Water: an aqueous solution of the steam distillate obtained from the flowers of *citrus aurantium amara*, which functions as fragrance ingredients; skin-conditioning agents

- *Citrus Aurantium Amara* (Bitter Orange) Flower Wax: a wax obtained from the flower of *citrus aurantium amara*.

Botanicals such as citrus are composed of hundreds of constituents, some of which have the potential to cause toxic effects. For example, bergapten (as known as 5-methoxypsoralen (5-MOP)) is a naturally occurring, phototoxic furanocoumarin (psoralen) in citrus peel oils [31]. In the CIR safety assessment published by Burnett *et al.* 2021, cosmetic allergens were identified in *citrus aurantium amara* (Bitter Orange) Flower ingredients, including benzyl alcohol, linalool, limonene and hydroperoxides [32]. Because botanical ingredients are complex mixtures, there is concern that multiple botanical ingredients in one product may each contribute to the final concentration of a single constituent. In addition, pesticide residues, heavy metals, and other plant species with possible adverse health effects on may be present in botanical ingredients [21, 22, 33].

3.3.7 *Citrus grandis*

Citrus grandis is found in many different product categories like hand/nail care, bath additives, shower products, face/neck care, body care, liquid soap, face – cleansers, and shampoo. Citrus Grandis (Grapefruit) Leaf Extract is the extract of the leaves of the *citrus grandis*, which functions as skin-conditioning agents-miscellaneous. *Citrus grandis* (grapefruit) peel oil is the volatile oil obtained from the peel of the grapefruit, which functions as fragrance ingredients; skin conditioning agents-miscellaneous. Comparable to the ingredients from the *citrus aurantium amara*, limonene is frequently reported to be present in the ingredients from the *citrus grandis* [31, 32].

3.3.8 *Lavandula hybrida abrial/grosso herb oil, flower water*

Lavandula hybrida in its several forms is found in shower products, face/neck care, body care, hair treatments, face - cleansers, hand/nail care, deodorants, shampoo, bath additives, fragrances, bar soap, and liquid soap.

Lavandula hybrida is included in the CPR for its skin sensitizing properties in Annex III, entry 360: the presence of the substance or substances shall be indicated 'Lavandula Oil/Extract' in the list of ingredients referred to in Article 19(1), point (g), when the concentration of the substance or substances exceeds: 0,001% in leave-on products, and 0,01% in rinse-off products.

Ingredients from the *lavandin* can be extracted from different parts of the plant:

- *Lavandula Hybrida* Abrial Herb Oil is an essential oil distilled from the flowering herbs of the Lavandin, *Lavandula hybrida* var. abrial
- *Lavandula Hybrida* Grosso Herb Oil is an essential oil distilled from the flowering herbs of the Lavandin, *Lavandula hybrida* grosso
- *Lavandula Hybrida* Flower Water is an aqueous solution of the steam distillate obtained from the flowers of lavender, *Lavandula hybrida*

The 'Abrial' is highly valued for its fragrance - similar to that of true lavender, while 'Grosso' is currently the most cultivated for economic reasons. The main components of lavender oil are linalool, linalyl acetate, 1,8-cineole, and camphor [34].

The European Medicines Agency (EMA) assessed the use of lavender oil in traditional medicine and concluded that there are, apart from its sensitizing properties, no major concerns over the safety of lavender oil [35].

3.3.9 *Litsea cubeba*

The essential oil *litsea cubeba* is found in products like liquid soap, body care, bar soap, and shampoo. The composition of essential oils varies based on the extraction method, cultivar, plant parts, time of sampling and processing. It was shown that the main components of the essential oil *litsea cubeba* are geranial and neral, which are isomers commonly named together as citral [36]. The next component was limonene. Citral, geranial and neral are skin sensitizing substances included in the CPR in Annex III, entry 70: the presence of the substance or substances shall be indicated as 'Citral' in the list of ingredients referred to in Article 19(1), point (g), when the concentration of the substance or substances exceeds: 0,001% in leave-on products, and 0,01% in rinse-off products.

3.3.10 *Rosmarinus officinalis*

Rosmarinus officinalis is mainly found in body creams, shampoos and conditioners, deodorant, shower gel and hand soap.

Ingredients from the *rosmarinus officinalis* can be extracted from different parts of the plant:

- *Rosmarinus officinalis* (rosemary) extract (CAS nr. 84604-14-8) is an extract of the whole plant and functions as conditioning agent
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) flower extract is an extract of the flowers of *R officinalis* and functions as antioxidant, deodorant agents, and skin conditioning agents
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) flower/leaf/stem extract is an extract of the flowers, leaves, and stems of *R officinalis* and functions as fragrance ingredients and skin conditioning agents
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) flower/leaf/stem water is the aqueous solution of the steam distillates obtained from the flowers, leaves, and stems of *R officinalis* and functions as fragrance ingredient
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) leaf is from the leaf of *R officinalis* and functions as skin-conditioning agents
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) leaf extract (CAS nr. 84604-14-8) is the extract of the leaves of *R officinalis* and functions as antimicrobial agents, antioxidant, fragrance ingredients, and skin conditioning agents
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) leaf oil (CAS nr. 8000-25-7) is the essential oil obtained from the flowering tops and leaves of *R officinalis* and functions as fragrance ingredients, and skin conditioning agents
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) leaf water is an aqueous solution of the steam distillate obtained from the leaves of *R officinalis* and functions as fragrance ingredient
- *R officinalis* (rosemary) water is an aqueous solution of the steam

distillate obtained from *R officinalis* and functions as fragrance ingredient

R officinalis L. is composed of an array of constituents, primarily phenolic acids, flavonoids, monoterpenes, diterpenes, diterpenoids, and triterpenes, including carnosol, limonene, linalool [37].

Because botanical ingredients, derived from natural plant sources, are complex mixtures, there is concern that multiple botanical ingredients may each contribute to the final concentration of a single constituent.

3.3.11 *Salix alba*

Salix alba is mainly found in day creams, conditioners and anti-dandruff shampoos. *Salix Alba* (Willow) Bark Extract is the extract of the bark of *Salix alba*. Willow bark extracts have been used for thousands of years as an analgesic, antipyretic and anti-inflammatory agent. Willow bark constituents include flavonoids, tannins and salicylates. The active constituent of willow bark is thought to be salicin [38, 39]. The salicin, flavonoids and tannins content as well as that of other components in the plant material depend on numerous factors including the species used and manufacturing process. Following the ECHA Database⁷, salicin is a known skin sensitizer. However, at least for food, the main reason for concern is the content of heavy metals, mainly cadmium, in the white willow bark [38].

3.3.12 *Squalene*

Squalene is found in products like shampoo, body care products, liquid soap, conditioner, shower products, lip care products, face colour cosmetics - foundations/fluid illuminators, hand/nail care products, and razors. It is used as skin conditioner (emollient), hair conditioner, and/or solvent. Squalene is an unsaturated branched chain isoprenoid hydrocarbon. Current sources for squalene are primarily fish oils, and in particular shark liver oils. There can be problems associated with the use of squalene extracted from shark liver oil, for instance, sharks may be infected by pathogens that are also infectious for humans or that produce substances that are harmful to humans [40]. Squalene can also be found in plant oils (e.g. olive oil).

Cosmetic products containing ingredients of animal origin must comply with the safety requirements laid down in the CPR. Some ingredients of animal origin are not allowed for use in cosmetic products in the EU. According to Annex II of the Cosmetics Regulation [12], Category 1 material and Category 2 material as defined by Regulation (EC) No 1069/2009 are banned for use in cosmetics [41]. Depending on the source of squalene it is allowed or not in cosmetic products. However it is not required to indicate the origin of an ingredient (e.g. animal or plant). As a consequence, it is unknown to which extent shark squalene is used in cosmetic products which may pose a risk, except certified vegan products (12 of the 28 products containing squalene investigated in this study have the label Vegan Society Approved Vegan Trademark, 16 products only have the self-declared claim vegan).

⁷ <https://echa.europa.eu/nl/home>

3.4 Case study: comparison of two shampoos

In order to get an impression of the differences in the ingredient lists between a product with and without a health, environmental and/or sustainability claim, two shampoos of the same brand were compared. Note: for this comparison the settings in the Mintel GNPD as mentioned in Chapter 3.1 were used, i.e. pre-programmed claims were used to divide products in the category with or without 'health, environmental and/or sustainability claim'. The following claims were given on the packaging of the two selected products:

- Claims on the product with 'health, environmental and/or sustainability claim':
 - 100% biodegradable
 - 0% sulphates and silicone
 - 94% ingredients from natural origin
 - Bottle made with 100% recycled plastic
 - Biological bamboo extract
 - Plant-based cleaners
 - No artificial colours
 - No ingredients from animal origin
- Claims on the product without 'health, environmental and/or sustainability claim':
 - 93% ingredients from natural origin
 - Bottle and cap 100% recycled and recyclable
 - Part of coconut boost line

The shampoos selected for this case study contained 21 ingredients (shampoo with a claim) and 18 ingredients (shampoo without a claim). The goal of both products is the same, the basic ingredients ($n=11$) of the shampoos were comparable. On average, shampoos with a claim included in this study ($n=47$) contained 23 ingredients (median 23, range 12-47), and the shampoos without a claim ($n=9$) contained 28 ingredients (median 27, range 22-36).

Due to the low concentrations used in products it probably does not result in a risk for consumers, but both products contain ingredients classified under CLP as harmful to aquatic life with long lasting effects, and/or classified for the hazards serious eye damage, serious eye irritation, skin irritation, severe burn, allergic skin reaction or may cause an allergic skin reaction or respiratory irritation.

The total number of ingredients is higher in the product with 'health, environment and/or sustainability claim', as well as the number of ingredients that cause harm/toxicity to aquatic life (with long lasting effects) as compared to the product without the claim. However, as this is so far only observed by comparing two products, this observation cannot be extrapolated for all products containing a health, environmental and/or sustainability claim.

The claims on these products were checked. However, without fully analysing the product in a laboratory and the documentation of the origins of these chemicals, it is not possible to make a statement whether the claims are correct. The only claim that could be checked was about the absence of silicone and sulphates and it was correct.

4 Labels and certifications

Labels and certifications can be found on the packages of consumer products. They indicate for example that the product has a reduced negative impact on the environment as set by specified criteria. In addition, claims like 'natural', 'vegan', and 'organic' are frequently used on packages of consumer products.

In this chapter, first the most common claims and labels on products found in the Mintel GNPD will be described and then the other found labels will be explained.

4.1 Claims and labels found on products in the Mintel GNPD

4.1.1 Claims

The data from the Mintel GNPD contains two columns which describe claims mentioned on the package of a product: positioning claims and product description. Table 4 shows an overview of the claims found in the data obtained from the Mintel GNPD. In total 92 different claims were found from the analysis of Beauty & Personal Care products with claims ($n=2652$ products) and Household products with claims ($n=216$ products) (Table 4). Most products have multiple claims.

Table 3 Frequency of occurrence of claims in both categories of products.

Claim	Beauty & personal care products	Household products
Alcohol Free	74	1
All Natural Product	335	58
Allergy friendly	0	4
Aromatherapy	124	18
Bio	126	37
Biodegradable	278	151
Botanical	1324	126
Botanical/Herbal	1263	122
Can be composted	0	2
Carbon balanced	2	2
Carbon Neutral	64	6
Card is made from grass paper	0	1
Charity	119	8
Cruelty-free	160	31
Demeter: a minimum amount of Sulphur Dioxide is used	0	2
Dermatologically tested	791	35
Does not require rinsing	0	3
Eco-formula	0	1
Eco-friendly	31	18
Economic	11	3
Environmentally-conscious	0	1
Ethical	1525	197
Ethical - Animal	669	57
Ethical - Biodegradable	143	80
Ethical - Charity	143	8

Claim	Beauty & personal care products	Household products
Ethical - Environmentally Friendly Package	944	136
Ethical - Environmentally Friendly Product	675	159
Ethical - Human	172	11
Ethical - Recycling	710	110
Ethical - Sustainable (Habitat/Resources)	678	110
Ethical - Toxins Free	27	0
Fair-trade	2	2
Food-grade	2	1
Fragrance free	132	23
Free from Added/Artificial Additives	1	2
Free from Added/Artificial Colourings	162	30
Free from Added/Artificial Flavourings	2	0
Free from Added/Artificial Preservatives	79	1
Free from additives	0	2
Free from artificial ...	11	9
Free from colouring	3	3
Free from fragrance	29	3
Free from synthetic ...	36	3
Gluten Free	49	0
GMO Free	64	1
Halal	25	0
Handmade	53	7
Hypoallergenic	119	44
Inspired by nature and the ancient art of living wisely	0	1
Low/No/Reduced Allergen	4	0
Mineral Oil/Petroleum Free	163	0
Minimal impact on the environment	0	1
Natural	1641	192
Naturally antibacterial and antiseptic	0	2
Naturally derived ingredients	23	2
No Additives/Preservatives	197	32
No animal ingredients	1776	169
Non-Acneogenic	1	0
Non-Comedogenic	45	0
Non-toxic	1	3
Not tested on animals	63	1
Oil Free	47	24
On-the-go	30	4
Organic	1499	64
Organic ingredients	105	1
Palm Oil Free	41	24
Paraben Free	179	20

Claim	Beauty & personal care products	Household products
pH neutral	82	18
Planet friendly	0	1
Plant-based	94	57
Plastic-free	35	12
Rainforest-kind	0	1
Recyclable	425	72
Recycled plastic	122	39
Refillable	65	18
Replace plastic bottles of washing-up liquid	0	1
Reusable	8	3
Safe	30	12
Silicone Free	247	0
Socially Responsible	3	3
Sulphate/Sulfate Free	140	0
Super safe	0	1
Sustainable	794	126
Vegan	3560	331
Vegan/No Animal Ingredients	1773	167
Vegan-friendly	27	7
Vegetable base	0	1
Vegetable origin	0	1
Vegetarian	150	0
Very concentrated	0	2
Water-neutral	2	1
Worry-free	1	1

Further explanation on the claims for Beauty & personal care products is given in the following sections.

4.1.1.1 *'Non-toxic' and 'safe'*

In several regulations, it is laid down that it is not allowed to mislead the consumer by claims on a product. In the CLP regulation (EC No 1272/2008) [10], it is mentioned that "Statements such as 'non-toxic', 'non-harmful', 'non-polluting', 'ecological' or other statements indicating that the substance or mixture is not hazardous or any other statements that are inconsistent with its classification should not appear on the label or packaging of any substance or mixture.". However, the statement 'non-toxic' was found once in the Beauty & Personal Care products with claims and three times in the Household products with claims. Cosmetic products do not fall under the CLP regulation, but always have to be safe, which means that the claim 'non-toxic' is misleading. The claim 'Ethical - Toxins Free' was found 27 times in the Beauty & Personal Care products with claims. In the case of cosmetic products, the claims must meet the six criteria (legal compliance, truthfulness, evidential support, honesty, fairness, and informed decision-making) as laid down in the Common Criteria Regulation (Regulation (EU) No 655/2013) [13]. Also, the claims 'safe' and 'super-safe' can give a consumer (unjustly) the feeling that there is no risk at all. Moreover, these claims can suggest that other products are 'toxic' or 'unsafe' which violates the fairness principle.

4.1.1.2 *'Free from...' claims*

Following the six criteria [13], 'free from...' claims on cosmetics, should for example not be made when:

- the claim is concerning an ingredient which is prohibited for use in cosmetics,
- the absence of a specific ingredient is not demonstrated by adequate and verifiable evidence,
- the claim should not be allowed when they refer to an ingredient which is typically not used in the particular kind of cosmetic product, and
- the claims should not be allowed when they imply a denigrating message, notably when they are mainly based on a presumed negative perception on the safety of the ingredient.

In this research, claims like 'alcohol free', 'fragrance free', 'paraben-free', and 'No Allergen' were identified. In the Technical Document on cosmetic claims it is however mentioned that "Certain parabens are safe when used in accordance to Regulation (EC) No 1223/2009. Considering the fact that all cosmetic products must be safe, the claim 'free from parabens' should not be accepted, because it is denigrating the entire group of parabens." [14]. In the Technical Document it is also mentioned that "The claim 'free from allergenic/sensitizing substances' is not allowed. A complete absence of the risk of an allergic reaction cannot be guaranteed and the product should not give the impression that it does." It is, however, beyond the scope of this project to assess in detail whether the claims comply with the regulations.

In addition, in practise 'alcohol free' means 'free from ethyl alcohol' (or 'ethanol free'). Alcohol free cosmetic products may contain fatty alcohols like cetyl, stearyl, cetearyl, or lanolin alcohol.

4.1.1.3 *Claims referring to experimental studies*

Products may bear claims that relate to the nature of experimental studies, for example 'dermatologically tested'. Consumer expectations regarding these claims may vary depending, in particular, on the presentation of the claim and its specific context. However, in all circumstances, consumers will expect that such claims are made only when the effects tested are favourable. The claim 'dermatologically tested' implies that the product was tested on humans under the supervision of a dermatologist. Depending on the presentation of the claim, it may refer to a specific efficacy or tolerance of the product. Consumer self-perceptions studies are not appropriate to support such claims [14].

4.1.1.4 *'Hypoallergenic'*

The claim 'hypoallergenic' can only be used in cases where the cosmetic product has been designed to minimize its allergenic potential. If a cosmetic product claims to be hypoallergenic, the presence of known allergens or allergen precursors should be totally avoided. The use of the claim 'hypoallergenic' does not guarantee a complete absence of risk of an allergic reaction and the product should not give the impression that it does. In the Technical Document on cosmetic claims it is mentioned that companies should consider whether consumers understand the claim 'hypoallergenic' [14]. If necessary, further

information or clarification regarding its meaning should be made available.

4.1.2 Labels

In the studied Beauty & Personal Care products with claims ($n=2652$) as well as Household products with claims ($n=216$), not all products have a certified label (especially in the category Household products), while others with a claim have multiple certified labels. Table 3 gives an overview of the frequency of occurrence of the different labels. The three most common labels found in this study are COSMetic Organic and Natural Standard (COSMOS), NATRUE and Vegan Society Approved (Ecocert follows for cosmetics the COSMOS-standard). More details as the conditions for complying with the label in terms of the use of chemicals in the (production chain of the) products on the three most common labels are provided below.

Table 4 Frequency of occurrence of labels in both categories of products.

Label	Beauty & personal Care products	Household products
BDIH	64	0
Certified Sustainable Enterprise	3	2
Certified Vegan	10	0
Cleanright Charter	0	14
Cosmos Cosmébio	38	0
COSMOS-standard	240	0
Cradle to Cradle	0	0
Ecocert	187	21
Ecogarantie label	0	0
EU Ecolabel	0	11
ICADA	6	0
Nature Care Products	0	8
Natural Care Products - Vegan	0	0
Natural Cosmetics Standard	7	0
Nature plus	0	0
NATRUE	123	2
Nordic Swan Ecolabel	3	2
Slow Cosmétique	7	0
Vegan Society Approved	263	24
Vegan Trademark		

4.1.2.1 COSMOS-standard⁸



The COSMOS-standard is a collaboration between the major certification bodies for organic and natural cosmetics. The standard was founded by the labels BDIH (Germany), Cosmebio (France), ECOCERT (France), ICEA (Italy), and the Soil Association (UK) and is now a widely used label for cosmetics.

The COSMOS-standard covers two levels for finished products 'COSMOS Organic' and 'COSMOS Natural' and two levels for raw materials:

- cosmetic products under organic certification: at least 95% of the physically processed agro-ingredients must be organic (except soap and alcohol-based products).
- cosmetic products under natural certification: there is no requirement to use a minimum level of organic ingredients.
- COSMOS certified raw materials (organic content): there is no minimum percentage of organic content required as soon as there is at least one organic ingredient in that raw material.
- COSMOS approved raw materials (non-organic content): no minimum of organic content is required.

To obtain the label 'COSMOS-standard', a product must comply to the COSMOS-standard criteria⁹, which include:

- The user must comply with all relevant legislation, including the
 - EU Regulation on cosmetic products (EC No. 1223/2009) [12] as amended, the EU REACH Regulation (EC No. 1907/2006) [9], the Commission Regulation on claims in cosmetic products (EU No. 655/2013) [13], and/or other local or national laws concerning cosmetic products where appropriate.
- Nanomaterials, GMO's and irradiation are not allowed.
- Palm oil, palm kernel oil and their derivatives used in cosmetic products and ingredients must be from certified organic origin or sustainable sources.
- It is forbidden to use: plants, plant materials and microorganisms that have been genetically modified; primary raw materials extracted from living or slaughtered animals; primary raw materials harvested/collected by threatened species listed in the IUCN red list (<https://www.iucnredlist.org/search>).
- It is allowed to use ingredients of animal origin as long as they: are produced by animals but are not a part of the animal; do not entail the death of the animal concerned, and have been obtained using only the processes listed in Appendix I of the Standard.

⁸ <http://www.cosmos-standard.org/>

⁹ https://media.cosmos-standard.org/filer_public/a9/35/a935e9a9-6623-4d5d-b0dd-0c56c81417c3/cosmos-standard_v40.pdf

- Calculation rules as stated in the Standard must be used to determine the proportion of organic content for each cosmetic ingredient.
- Labelling and communication must be clear and must not mislead consumers, the requirements are elaborated in the Labelling Guide¹⁰.

4.1.2.2 NATRUE¹¹



Reliability assurance: audited every 2 years by an independent body

Type of products concerned: cosmetics

Must comply to: The international natural and organic cosmetics association started the NATRUE label. It guarantees natural and organic ingredients, environmentally friendly practices, no synthetic fragrances or dyes, no petrochemicals (paraffins, PEG, -propyl-, -alkyl-, etc.), no oils silicone or silicone derivatives, no ingredients from genetically modified plants or organisms (in accordance with the European organic standard), no irradiation of the finished product or its plant ingredients and finished products not tested on animals. Furthermore, it has three levels of certification: natural cosmetics (ingredients are natural and processed as little as possible), natural cosmetics with an organic content (>70% of the agricultural ingredients are organic), and organic cosmetics (>95% of the agricultural raw materials are organic). The last and the one that offers the most guarantee is NATRUE Organic Cosmetics.

The NATRUE Standard¹² is applicable to raw materials and finished products intended for cosmetic use. Independently of the formulation of a natural cosmetic product, all products must comply with:

- The basic requirements of Cosmetics Regulation (EC) No 1223/2009 [12].
- Under NATRUE's Criteria, organic certified natural substances and derived natural substances must come from controlled organic farming and/or wild collection, certified by a duly recognized certification body or authority to an organic standard or regulation. In terms of GMO, finished products, starting materials and the used enzymes and microorganisms must comply with the criteria laid down in the EU Eco-regulation (Regulation (EC) No 2018/848) [4].
- In natural cosmetics, natural fragrances (for example, essential oils) which correspond to ISO standard 9235:2021 [42] may be used. These include isolates of essential oils and essential oils reconstructed from them. Synthetic nature-identical fragrances may not be used in the formulation of natural cosmetics under NATRUE's criteria.

¹⁰ https://media.cosmos-standard.org/filer_public/fe/64/fe64bd35-9357-4e24-a891-ba79dd6789be/cosmos-standard_labelling_guide_v40.pdf

¹¹ <https://NATRUE.org/our-standard/NATRUE-criteria-2/>

¹² https://NATRUE.org/uploads/2023/08/EN-NATRUE-Label_Requirements_v3.9-final-version-2.pdf

- Detergent surfactants substances used must be completely biodegradable in accordance with the EC Regulation on Detergents (Regulation (EC) No 648/2004) [5].

In addition, the standard specifies that:

- Chemically unmodified natural ingredients used should preferably be of organic grade. Natural cosmetics are products which are produced exclusively from natural substances. Natural substances are substances of botanic, inorganic-mineral or animal origin (except for dead vertebrates). Enzymatic and microbiological reactions are also permitted in so far as exclusively naturally occurring microorganisms or enzymes obtained from these are used, and the end products are identical to those which occur in nature.
- Nature-identical substances may only be used when natural substances cannot be recovered from nature using reasonable technical effort.
- Derived natural substances are only justified if their function cannot be achieved using natural substances.
- For the preservation of natural cosmetics, only the preservatives classified as nature-identical or derived natural may be used.
- The standard specifies calculation percentages of minimum levels of natural substances and natural substances of organic grade as well as for maximum levels of derived natural substances allowed for each certification level and product category under NATRUE's criteria.

4.1.2.3 Vegan Society Approved Vegan Trademark¹³



Reliability assurance: yearly renewal of the registration

Type of products concerned: fashion and textiles, cosmetics, Household and toiletries, food, drink, and supplements.

Must comply to

The product must be free from:

- **Animals:** The Vegan Society understands the word 'animal' to refer to the entire animal kingdom. That is all vertebrates and all multicellular invertebrates. 'Animal' can refer to a species or an individual; and is used as a noun or an adjective, as required. Unless otherwise stated, it usually means non-human animals.
- **Animal ingredients:** The manufacture and/or development of the product, and its ingredients, must not involve or have involved, the use of any animal product, by-product or derivative.
- **Animal testing:** The development and/or manufacture of the product, and its ingredients, must not involve or have involved, testing of any sort on animals conducted at the initiative of the company or on its behalf, or by parties over whom the company has effective control.

¹³ <https://www.vegansociety.com/vegan-trademark/vegan-trademark-standards>

- Genetically Modified Organisms (GMOs): The development and/or production of GMOs must not have involved animal genes or animal-derived substances. Products put forward for trademark registration that contains or may contain any GMOs must be labelled as such.

4.2 Other labels and certifications

In this chapter a non-exhaustive list of labels that can be found in a Dutch store is shown. The number of labels and certifications is large and growing. Under the Green Claims Directive it is proposed to increase the regulation of new labels, as discussed in Chapter 2.2.10.

Per label, the 'reliability assurance', the 'type of products concerned' as well as the standard it 'must comply to' are described.

4.2.1 EU Ecolabel¹⁴



Type of label: controlled by independent party at regular basis

Type of products concerned: all consumer's products

Must comply to: NEN-EN-ISO 14024 [16]

EU Ecolabel is the official European environmental label and is recognised by all European Union countries, plus Norway, Iceland, and Liechtenstein. The label imposes sustainability requirements on the entire lifecycle of products and services: from raw material extraction through production and distribution to disposal. The label also encourages companies to develop innovative products that are durable, easy to repair and recyclable.

In addition to the label restrictions, the ISO 14020 [43] family of standards provide principles and requirements for communicating environmental aspects and environmental impacts of products through environmental statements including self-declared environmental claims and ecolabels. NEN-EN-ISO 14024 [16] establishes the principles and procedures for developing Type I environmental labelling programmes, including the selection of product categories, product environmental criteria and product function characteristics, and for assessing and demonstrating compliance.

¹⁴ <https://www.eu-ecolabel.nl/en/about-eu-ecolabel/>

4.2.2 Nordic Swan Ecolabel¹⁵



Nordic Ecolabelling

Type of label: audited by an independent body

Type of products concerned: detergents, cosmetics

Must comply to: NEN-EN-ISO 14024 [16]

Nordic Swan Ecolabelling sets criteria on the toxicity and degradability of the ingoing substances, the amount of packaging and sustainable extraction of raw materials. The general requirements include: environmental properties (degradability, bioaccumulation and toxicity to aquatic organisms) of the chemical substances used, no use of substances classified as carcinogenic, mutagenic, harmful to reproduction or allergenic. Additionally, use of substances on the EU list of substances suspected of being endocrine disruptors is forbidden as well as the use of microplastics and use of perfume in baby and children's products. The packaging volume and quantity and type of material is also important for this label.

4.2.3 Cosmos Cosmébio



Reliability assurance: controlled yearly by independent party

Type of products concerned: cosmetics

Must comply to: COSMOS-standard

This label is divided in 3 different labels which have several points in common such as that a minimum of 95% of the ingredients must be of natural origin. Additionally, for the sub label Cosmos natural and cosmos organic have a limitation of petrochemical origin (list of authorized ingredients with maximum dosage) on the total product. The life-cycle of the product is also taken into account where the origin of raw materials is controlled, to encourage ethical and sustainable sourcing. Regarding the production, the label wants a mild and non-polluting transformation process. The manufacture of the finished product (own composition, packaging, storage) as well as a transparent labelling and responsible communication are in the specifications.

¹⁵ <https://www.nordic-ecolabel.org/product-groups/>

4.2.4 BDIH (Bundesverband der Industrie- und Handelsunternehmen)¹⁶



Reliability assurance: audited yearly by independent party

Type of products concerned: cosmetics

Must comply to: COSMOS-standard

This ecological label indicates that the ingredients must be from natural origin except when there is no other alternative. Nanomaterials are prohibited. The label applies strict standards in terms of product biodegradability and toxicity to aquatic organisms, since it imposes critical thresholds. Additionally, it includes criteria that limit the amount of packaging per dose and prohibit certain packaging materials, such as PVC. Only a limited number of additives and processing techniques can be used in the production.

RIVM attaches a great deal of importance to the accessibility of its products, but at present we cannot yet provide this figure in an accessible form. Also see www.rivm.nl/accessibility.

4.2.5 Certified Sustainable Enterprise¹⁷



Reliability assurance: controlled every 3 years by independent party

Type of products concerned: products such as cosmetics detergents and cleaning agents.

Must comply to: self-standardization by industry that sets requirements on sustainability and improvement. The most important requirement for CSE is a sustainable business model i.e. production of ecological products (out of renewable raw materials or out of circular economy), trade with them, or offer a service that promotes sustainability.

4.2.6 Certified Vegan¹⁸



Reliability assurance: administered by the Vegan Awareness Foundation (official name of Vegan Action), a non-profit organization dedicated to educating the public about veganism and assisting vegan-friendly businesses

¹⁶ <http://www.kontrollierte-naturkosmetik.de/e/bdih.htm>

¹⁷ <https://gfaw.eu/en/>

¹⁸ <https://vegan.org/>

Type of products concerned: beverages/drinks, food, home care, personal care, pet care, supplements, textiles

Must comply to: proving the source of the ingredient (plant, mineral, fungal, bacterial, or synthetic) and showing that the manufacturer has not tested the specific ingredient on animals (nor paid another organization to do so) since the year 2000.

The Certified Vegan Logo is a registered trademark, for products that do not contain animal products or by-products and that have not been tested on animals. The Certified Vegan Logo is permitted on products owned by companies located in the United States, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, and US territories but is distributed and recognized worldwide.

4.2.7 Cleanright¹⁹



Reliability assurance: self-assigned

Type of products concerned: soaps, detergents and maintenance products

Must comply to: the Charter (the label owner) stipulates a set Charter Sustainability Procedures for companies to implement in their management systems.

It has been established by the AISE (International Association for Soaps and Detergents). This label is self-assigned by the manufacturers. To claim it, companies must ensure that their goods are produced in an ecological way, by limiting, for example, the use of chemicals in favour of water. However, this label does not benefit from any external control.

4.2.8 Cradle-to-Cradle²⁰



Reliability assurance: controlled every 3 years by independent party

Type of products concerned: cosmetics, personal care, and cleaning products

Must comply to:

The cradle-to-cradle concept designates an eco-design model based on the principle of zero pollution and the total reuse of raw materials used to make a product. The certification is awarded based upon four ascending levels of achievement: Bronze, Silver, Gold and Platinum, according to the product's performance in each category. For example, to achieve the Bronze level, a product must meet the minimum requirements in each of the five categories: the product must be made of materials that are safe for human and environmental health, and the materials must be recyclable or biodegradable. The product must also be

¹⁹ <https://www.aise.eu/library/artwork/cleanright-panel.aspx>

²⁰ <https://c2ccertified.org/get-certified>

manufactured using renewable energy sources and must not contribute to climate change. Additionally, the product must be designed to conserve water and protect water quality. Finally, the product must be produced in a socially responsible manner, ensuring fair labour practices and safe working conditions. The higher the category, the stricter the criteria are.

4.2.9 Ecocert²¹



Reliability assurance: controlled every 3 years

Type of products concerned: Ecocert cosmos organic: organic and natural cosmetics, Ecocert ecodetergent: natural cleaning products

Must comply to: COSMOS-standard (cosmetics) or ECOCERT standard²² (detergents)

This label guarantees an environmentally friendly production and processing processes, a promotion of the use of natural or organic ingredients including a prohibition of most of petrochemical ingredients, a responsible management of natural resources, and a transparency to the consumer by using communication and phraseology that does not mislead them.

4.2.10 Ecogarantie label²³



Reliability assurance: audited yearly by an independent body

Type of products concerned: detergents

Must comply to: The goal of this label is to products that contains 100% of all natural extracts are organic, 100% neutral regarding the CO₂ footprint, they guarantee that the certified products meet strict quality standards in terms of safety and sustainability, most of the products are made with biodegradable ingredients to minimise their impact on the environment. Additionally, GMO are prohibited and petrochemical ingredients limited to the list accepted by the EU. Ecogarantie belongs to a Belgium company.

²¹ <https://www.ecocert.com/en/home>

²² <https://ecocert.app.box.com/v/THE-STANDARD>

²³ <https://ecogarantie.eu/the-label/>

4.2.11 ICADA (International Cosmetics And Device Association)²⁴



Reliability assurance: controlled by independent party every year

Type of products concerned: cosmetics

Must comply to: ICADA Natural is a German label for organic and natural cosmetics. The label guarantees that the raw materials come from organic farming where possible. In addition, certain ingredients and production techniques are prohibited as well as GMO's. No ingredients from dead animals are used. Superfluous and non-recyclable packaging should be avoided, but these are not strict requirements. Some petroleum based ingredients are allowed. There is no explicit ban on microplastics, only a statement that ICADA is committed to take every step that is possible for a cosmetics association to actively prevent microplastics.

4.2.12 Nature Care Products²⁵



Reliability assurance: audited annually by an independent body

Type of products concerned: detergents and cleaning agents, hygiene products, cosmetics

Must comply to: These labels require the use of natural ingredients and the use of only naturally occurring chemical processes in manufacturing. [44] Amongst others, the product may not contain GMO and the label only allows a limited use of hazardous substances. Requirements are set for the biodegradability of the product after use. The packaging must be environmentally friendly.

The Vegan logo can be added if the product meets the vegan criteria.

The NSP logo applies to detergents and cleaning agents, hygiene products and the NCS logo to cosmetic products.

4.2.13 Nature plus²⁶



Reliability assurance: evaluation by an independent institute

Type of products concerned: paints and construction materials

Must comply to: material specific requirements that include criteria on climate change, depletion of mineral and fossil resources, human

²⁴ <http://icada.global/>

²⁵ <https://gfaw.eu/en/ncp/>

²⁶ <https://www.natureplus.org/>

toxicity, formation of photochemical ozone. This label covers production of ingredients, manufacture of the product, use, end of life of unconsumed paint. The label favours natural ingredients over ingredients of petrochemical origin. For example, mineral-based paints must consist of 95% water and mineral ingredients. Plant-based paints must consist of 99% plant, mineral and/or water ingredients. However, this does not guarantee that significant environmental impacts are systematically reduced (climate change, human toxicity, photochemical ozone formation).

5 Sources of claims and ingredient information on consumer products

In this chapter, a description of the alert system called 'Safety Gate' is given. A search in the system was performed related to the claims found in the Mintel GNPD to investigate whether alerts were published on unsafe products related to the claims. Furthermore, other scientific institutes or consumer organisations were contacted in order to know if reports were already written on consumer products with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims. To finish, (social) media were searched for their advice to consumers and their possible influence on the preferences of consumers.

5.1 Alerts on claims in Safety Gate

Safety Gate²⁷ is the EU rapid alert system for dangerous non-food products. The system enables quick circulation of information on measures taken against non-food dangerous products among the national authorities responsible for product safety in Europe. The product categories 'chemical products', 'childcare articles and children's equipment', 'cosmetics', and 'eco-design' were selected, and only alerts published since January 1, 2022 until September 25, 2023. A free text search was performed on the terms 'bio', 'biobased', 'biodegradable', 'biological', 'ecological', 'natural', and 'organic'.

The search resulted in a total of 75 hits of which 53 had a chemical risk, 1 a choking risk, 1 entrapment, injuries and suffocation risk, 19 a microbiological risk and 1 a strangulation risk. Of the 53 chemical risk hits, 2 hits concerned tattoo ink, which were excluded from further analysis.

The reported chemical risks were based on the incompliance with the cosmetic products regulation [12]. Most of them contained butylphenyl methylpropional (BMHCA, lysmeral, 2-(4-tert-butylbenzyl) propionaldehyde, CAS nr 80-54-6), which is prohibited in cosmetic products since March 2022. Other products contained hydroquinone (1,4-Dihydroxybenzene, CAS nr 123-31-9), which is also forbidden in cosmetic products, with the exception that professionals can use it in artificial nail systems up to 0,02%. One product contained mercury, which is prohibited in cosmetic products (except the special cases which are included in Annex V of the cosmetics regulation). A mixture of the preservatives methylchloroisothiazolinone and methylisothiazolinone (MCI/MI), which is prohibited in leave-on cosmetics, was also found.

5.2 Reports by fellow scientific institutes in Europe

European fellow institutes were contacted to know if they have performed similar research. Organizations in different countries were contacted such as Portugal (DECO), France (Anses), Denmark (FBR), Germany (BfR), Hungary (TVE), and the European Consumer Organisation (BEUC). The different scientific institutes or consumer

²⁷ <https://ec.europa.eu/safety-gate-alerts/screen/webReport#recentAlerts>

organisations have performed some specific research on ecological products. Interesting reports are summarized below.

5.2.1

DECO

DECO is the Portuguese association for the defence of consumers (Associação Portuguesa para a Defesa do Consumidor). They participated in a European project named CLEAN²⁸. The goal of that project was to thoroughly review the test protocols on dishwasher products, hand dishwasher products, all-purpose detergents, and bathroom cleaners.

In their report they mention a study conducted by Euroconsumers among 4210 consumers in Belgium, Italy, Portugal and Spain. The study indicates that:

- The majority of consumers indicate that they pay attention to environmental aspects when purchasing household detergents.
- Although consumers were concerned about the environmental aspects of detergents, a small number of respondents considered themselves well informed.
- Consumers have doubts about the environmental claims, with more than half of the respondents reporting they believe that environment-friendly claims are for marketing purposes.

During their research, DECO checked the environmental performance based on criteria of their choices of certain products depending on the ingredient lists. They concluded that 44 ingredients should be avoided because they have no role in performance in the products. A second list of ingredients that form a risk for the environment and should be replaced by other ingredients with the same function that are less harmful included: several surfactants, emulsifiers, viscosity controllers, chelating agents, scale inhibitors, or bleach stabilizers.

Another part of the project had the goal to identify labels and claims of dishwashing and hand dishwashing detergents. Green products were defined as those that carry 1-4 green claims, a traditional product would carry 0-3 green claims. Only few products with a harmful environmental impact (according to the scoring of the project) carry green claims, but they refer mostly to packaging.

The CLEAN project concluded that the green claims on detergents often are not very informative to consumers to determine the best environmental choice.

5.2.2

BEUC

BEUC (Bureau Européen des Unions de Consommateurs) mentioned a project called NordQual²⁹, financed by the EU Consumer Programme, a cooperation between consumer organizations in Denmark, Finland, and Sweden. The goal of this project was to evaluate household cleaners and identify potentially misleading marketing strategies.

According to the summary of the report "Based on product testing and desk research on 166 household cleaning products, the project identified the following challenges to consumers in choosing effective products that minimize impacts to health and the environment:

²⁸ <https://www.euroconsumers.org/clean-project/>

²⁹ <https://www.sverigeskonsumenter.se/vara-projekt/nordqual-2020-2021-in-english/nordqual-report-2021/>

1. Dual quality and market quality – product quality, contents, and availability can vary between Denmark, Finland, and Sweden
2. Poor performance – some products do not do the cleaning job consumers expect
3. Problematic chemicals – some ingredients can be harmful to health or the environment
4. Inaccessible ingredient information – consumers can have difficulty accessing ingredients information due to many companies out of compliance with EU detergent regulation
5. Greenwashing and misleading claims – unsubstantiated claims can mislead consumers
6. Hazard information and warnings – important consumer information is sometimes missing or hard to read”

Many recommendations were made for the consumer organisations, for the industry, enforcement agencies, policy makers, and eco- and allergy labelling schemes. The main recommendations are listed below:

- Inform consumers about the difference between credible labelling schemes versus empty greenwashing and marketing claims.
- Provide all the ingredients on the packages. Ensure online information is accessible and updated.
- Phase out problematic chemicals, for example, by requiring that products meet the Nordic Swan or EU Ecolabel criteria, and meet the Asthma Allergy Nordic label criteria.
- Remove unsubstantiated environmental or health claims from packages and instead communicate these qualities through credible ecolabels and allergy labels.
- More strictly regulate problematic chemicals in household cleaners including banning “Substances of Very High Concern” and other harmful chemicals. Take combination effects of exposure into account.
- Consider better regulation of misleading or unsubstantiated marketing claims and packaging designs that give the impression of a healthier or environmentally friendly product.
- Use the opportunities in the upcoming revision of the detergent regulation and the Chemicals Strategy to implement these initiatives.
- Fully ban the group of allergenic preservatives called isothiazolinones due to health and environmental impacts.

5.2.3

TVE

TVE is the Tudatos Vásárlók Egyesülete (Association of Conscious Consumers) in Hungary. They are working on an inventory and testing many products including the Ecolabel products.

- The tests were performed mostly on detergents and some cosmetics.
- They developed an app ‘Conscious Consumer app’³⁰: it covers the most typical household cleaning product categories, provides information about the sustainability and safety features of these products. Additionally, it has a ranking system based on the evaluation of substances in products. The data on substances is coming from the safety data sheets of products. By the end of

³⁰ <https://tudatosvasarlo.hu/letoltes/>

2023, there will be about 2000 products in the database. Products are ordinary, Eco-labelled and 'eco' products.

- An inventory of Eco-labelled products was also made, including chemicals and published online³¹.

5.2.4 *Swedish projects*

The Swedish consumers' association (Sveriges Konsumenter, SK) has concerns about green claims that can be very misleading for consumers. However, they have not performed any recent studies but redirected us to the NordQual and CLEAN projects.

In an inventory from the NordQual project, test results on various products from different countries can be found.³²

5.3 **(Social) media and claims on consumer products**

5.3.1 *News-related hits*

The Nexis database³³ contains articles from national and international newspapers and news magazines. A search was performed using the search terms 'biobased' OR 'biologisch afbreekbaar' OR 'biologisch' OR 'ecologisch' OR 'natuurlijk' OR 'organisch'. Subsequently the results were narrowed by time (January 1, 2022 until September 25, 2023), language (Dutch) and the terms 'gezond' and 'cosmetica'. This resulted in 60 news-related hits, of which 9 were relevant based on the title and after removing duplicate articles. Some highlights are summarized below.

- In one of the articles, a journalist is critical on a Danish cosmetics brand which prides itself on sustainability [45]. However, it hardly lives up to its green promises, mainly because of the use of propellants which contribute to the emission of volatile organic compounds (VOC). In another article, the reader is advised to "choose products with the ecolabel and do not automatically rely on marketing slogans such as 'natural' or 'organic'" [46]. The use of the app *KeurmerkenWijzer* made by Milieu Centraal is suggested by an article which helps the consumer to make sustainable choices as it contains an overview of labels and logos that can be found on products in the store [47].
- In an article discussing the increase in strict regulation concerning fragrances in cosmetics mentions that "A persistent misconception is that synthetic fragrances are harmful and natural ones are not. At least as often, it is natural extracts (essential oils) that are risky. In that respect, essential oils can be compared to cocaine: chewing a leaf of the coca plant does not do much harm, but boiling the leaves to concentrate cocaine and then shooting this cocaine straight through your nose is less healthy." [48].
- Making your own cosmetics and cleaning products has been a popular topic on social media during the last few years. In addition, you can personalize products by e.g. adding some drops of essential oil to a basic product (e.g. bath oil) [49].
- Although in general the tone of voice is critical and the authors seem to be well-informed, a remarkable advice is mentioned in

³¹ <https://tudatosvasarlo.hu/zold-otthon/okotermek-kereso/?type=eco>

³² <https://www.sverigeskonsumenter.se/vara-projekt/nordqual-2020-2021/har-finns-alla-testresultat/>

³³ <https://signin nexis.com/>

an article: “We always recommend using products with as few ingredients as possible, because after a while an adverse skin reaction can occur” [50]. This advice is given more often, based on the (mis)conception that this way you can limit your exposure to harmful substances. But from a toxicological point of view it always depends on the toxicity, concentration, and exposure to the ingredients that are in the product, regardless of their number.

5.3.2 *Internet and social media*

Misleading information due to limited knowledge can be easily shared on social media by consumers and influencers, advertorials by companies, etc. An example of misleading information is already found by a simple Google search using the search terms “natuurlijke shampoo zonder chemicaliën”, which resulted for example in a website stating “A natural shampoo without chemicals is extra nice for your hair and will work wonders - especially with summer coming, your locks could use a little more attention. But what is a good shampoo 'without the mess'?” [51]. This shows limited knowledge about chemicals as without chemicals, shampoo would not exist at all.

On the other hand, searching on “zijn natuurlijke ingrediënten beter” results in several websites of shops, organizations and lifestyle magazines mentioning for example that “Natural and organic products are not necessarily better for your skin. These products may also contain harmful or irritating substances. It is best to look at the list of ingredients on the product. You will then notice that perfume, one of the most harmful ingredients, has also been added to natural products.” [52].

Much of the research on the preferences for and perceptions of ‘natural’ products or products with other claims has taken place in the food and medicine domains. A biased preference for ‘natural’ perfumes was observed in the study by Apaolaza *et al.* [53]. This type of bias is likely caused by many factors, including a ‘natural-is-better’ default belief and a belief that ‘natural items’ are safer than ‘non-natural items’ [54]. According to a survey conducted in Brazil in 2019, approximately 53% of respondents were interested in ‘natural beauty products’, and 31% believed that products made with ‘organic’ and ‘natural’ ingredients were more effective than those that used chemical products [55].

Other studies show the relationship between social media and consumer purchases of consumer products with claims [56, 57]. Social media influencers play a role in for example the beauty industry by marketing specific products for a fee. It is shown that even when the products which are promoted/endorsed by digital influencers do not represent the follower’s philosophy of life, digital influencers are still able to shape the consumer’s intentions [55]. Social media influencers are therefore seen as an effective marketing tool in targeting a broad demographic and increasing brand awareness [58].

6 Conclusion and discussion

6.1 Definitions and labels

Consumers are increasingly aware of and concerned about their impact on the environment, the climate and sustainability. As a result, an increasing number of products with 'health, environmental and/or sustainability' claims are on the market. In addition, consumers have concerns about the use of vague terms such as 'natural', 'eco', 'green', or 'sustainable' on product packages have been reported, but at the same time consumers appear to have preferences for 'natural' products [53-55, 59].

The lack of specific regulations governing definitions like 'natural' and 'organic' has resulted in the emergence of private labels to substantiate claims made by companies about the 'natural' or 'organic' status of their products and/or ingredients. As a result, it is difficult for consumers to interpret the variety of labels on the environmental sustainability of products and companies. Companies can give a false impression of their environmental impacts or benefits, which can mislead consumers (a practise known as greenwashing). With the proposed Green Claims Directive, the EU is taking action to address greenwashing, in order to protect consumers and the environment [18]. An example of greenwashing is also shown in the case study in this report (Chapter 3.4) in which two shampoos were compared: the product with health, environmental and/or sustainability claims contained only 1% more ingredients from natural origin.

Regulation governing a definition of 'vegan' is also lacking, but this claim is more straightforward and easier to verify. For example, the widely used label 'Vegan' specifies its requirements as: the manufacture and/or development of the product, and its ingredients, must not involve or have involved, the use of any animal product, by-product or derivative. There is an ISO standard with technical definitions and criteria for natural and organic cosmetic ingredients (ISO 16128 [3]). Although the use of this standard is not legally binding, it is a standardized methodology to calculate the percentage of natural and organic ingredients in a cosmetic product.

In this report it is shown that the leading labels for cosmetic ingredients are COSMOS-standard, NATRUE and Vegan which are well established in the cosmetic ingredients market. COSMOS-standard and NATRUE have similar, but not identical, definitions for organic and/or natural ingredients and for natural and/or organic cosmetic final products and are thus more or less comparable. It is remarkable that EU Ecolabel - which is the official European environmental label - is found only on a few Household products.

6.2 Consumers perspective

Studies show that consumers have a preference for 'natural' products and social media influencers can shape consumer's intentions. As long as the use of products with a claim is safe, there are no reasons for

concern from a toxicological point. However, in this report it is shown that it may be hard for consumers to understand and interpret the labels, claims and difficult words (e.g. hypoallergenic) used on the packaging. A consumer can be (mis)led by statements made by influencers and claims on the product labels. The claim 'non-toxic' was found in one of the investigated products in this study. This can be confusing for a consumer: are comparable products without the claim toxic? What is meant by non-toxic? Is it also non-toxic in the case of misuse?

In the case of the claim 'hypoallergenic', it is mentioned in the Technical Document on cosmetic claims that companies should consider whether consumers understand the claim [14]. If necessary, further information or clarification regarding its meaning should be made available. It is, however, questionable whether an averagely educated consumer understands what the term 'hypoallergenic' means.

It is therefore recommended to perform further research into

- whether consumers understand claims like 'non-toxic' and 'hypoallergenic' on products, and
- whether the claims observed in this study (see Chapter 4.1) comply with the regulations.

Consumers should be further informed on this for instance by giving explanations of complicated terms via an online platform such as Waarzitwatin³⁴.

6.3 Indications for health risk

The Mintel GNPD was searched for products that were added during the last 3 years, to gain insight in the ingredients of recently released cosmetic products. Although it may result in an incomplete view on the products that are available in the stores now, the results give a useful overview of ingredients in both products with and without 'health, environmental and/or sustainability' claims.

As mentioned in the introduction, it was expected that the chemical composition of products with a 'health, environmental and/or sustainability' claim differs from products without these claims. As shown in the ingredient tables (Annex II and III) both the products with and without a claim have many unique ingredients. The 35 most frequently used ingredients of the 'Beauty & personal care products with claims' were analysed, and 12 of them were selected for further analysis. For boron nitride there is insufficient data to draw clear conclusions on its safety. In the case of squalene, it depends on the source of the ingredient, but there is no health concern when the product is certified vegan. Health concerns on endocrine disrupting properties of benzophenone-3 were considered in a safety assessment by SCCS, leading to a lower maximum concentration. Recently, benzophenone-4 was also assessed by SCCS, the use of BP-4 was considered safe when used as UV filter up to a maximum concentration of 5%. There are purity criteria for CI 77220 (calcium carbonate) that must be complied to. Another point of concern may be the content of

³⁴ <https://waarzitwatin.nl/>

aluminum, however this was mainly mentioned in relation to the oral intake via food of calcium carbonate.

The current study shows that products with a 'health, environmental and/or sustainability' claim more often contains botanical ingredients. Botanical additives in cosmetics like plant extracts sound safe as they come from nature. However, as shown for *Achillea millefolium*, *Citrus aurantium amara*, *Citrus grandis*, *Lavandula hybrida*, *Litsea cubeba*, and *Rosmarinus officinalis*, plants may contain constituents of concern (e.g. allergens like linalool and limonene) and frequent use may result in adverse skin reactions. In the case of *Salix alba*, the skin sensitizer salicin is present to a greater or lesser extent. In addition, information on the presence of pesticide residues and heavy metals in botanical ingredients is lacking. Also, the use of several botanical ingredients in one or more products that may contain similar constituents of concern could result in exposures that exceed levels of concern. Furthermore, the classification as well as risk assessment of these ingredients may be lacking because there is often limited data, no or low tonnage REACH registration and/or no harmonized classification. An example from the ingredient list is *Rhus verniciflua*/varnish tree extract, an ingredient that is not classified but the tree is known as poisonous [60]. Such an extended search in other information sources was not performed for other ingredients, but might be considered for future studies.

Additionally, for the human body, it does not matter whether a substance is made by man (synthetic) or obtained from nature. It is the same chemical, made or obtained in a different way. An example of this is the fragrance geraniol which can be extracted from a flower but can also be synthesized. Some people are allergic to fragrances such as geraniol and the appearance of an allergic reaction is independent of the origin of the substance.

Noteworthy, essential oils are considered MOCS (More than One Constituent Substances) under the current CLP regulation [10]. Currently, the CLP regulation is under revision³⁵, and discussions are ongoing whether essential oils should have to be classified for hazards related to their constituents or based on information of the total MOCS [61].

Although this study does not show direct indications for serious health risks, further research into the use of in particular botanical ingredients in consumer products would be valuable. For example, exposure to several cosmetic and household products (not fully analysed in this study) containing botanical ingredients may result in additive exposure to skin sensitization compounds like linalool and limonene. The lack of classification and risk assessment of many of these botanical ingredients raises concern that health effects may be missed. It could be considered to widen the evaluation to substances without classification, using different information sources, such as structural similarity tools, information on constituents, and botanical information to gain more insight in potential hazards. Furthermore, studies also raise their concern regarding pesticide residues and heavy metals in botanical

³⁵ https://environment.ec.europa.eu/publications/proposal-clp-revision_en

ingredients which could be further investigated. Additional research could also focus on the validity of environment claims.

6.4 Recommendations

Future research could be focussed on:

- Whether consumers understand claims like 'non-toxic' and 'hypoallergenic' on products.
- Whether the claims observed in this study comply with the regulations.
- The toxicity and composition of botanical ingredients.
- Risk assessment on the use of multiple products with botanical ingredients (additive exposure).
- Pesticide residues and heavy metals in botanical ingredients.
- The toxicity of substances without classification found in products with a health, environmental and/or sustainability claim.

7 References

1. NEN-EN, Bio-based products - Vocabulary (NEN-EN 16575). <https://www.en-standard.eu/bs-en-16575-2014-bio-based-products-vocabulary/>
2. NEN-EN, Bio-based products - Requirements for Business-to-Consumer communication and claims (NEN-EN 16935). <https://www.en-standard.eu/une-en-16935-2017-bio-based-products-requirements-for-business-to-consumer-communication-and-claims/>
3. NEN-ISO, Guidelines on technical definitions and criteria for natural and organic cosmetic ingredients and products - Part 1: Definitions for ingredients (ISO 16128-1:2016). <https://www.en-standard.eu/bs-iso-16128-1-2016-guidelines-on-technical-definitions-and-criteria-for-natural-and-organic-cosmetic-ingredients-and-products-definitions-for-ingredients/>
4. EU, REGULATION (EU) 2018/848 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 30 May 2018 on organic production and labelling of organic products. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2018/848/oj>
5. EU, REGULATION (EC) No 648/2004 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 31 March 2004 on detergents. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2004/648/oj>
6. NEN-EN, Packaging - Requirements for packaging recoverable through composting and biodegradation - Test scheme and evaluation criteria for the final acceptance of packaging (NEN-EN 13432:2000). <https://www.en-standard.eu/une-en-13432-2001-requirements-for-packaging-recoverable-through-composting-and-biodegradation-test-scheme-and-evaluation-criteria-for-the-final-acceptance-of-packaging/>
7. Overheid, Warenwet. <https://wetten.overheid.nl/BWBR0001969/2023-04-19>
8. EU, DIRECTIVE 2005/29/EC OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 11 May 2005 concerning unfair business-to-consumer commercial practices in the internal market. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/dir/2005/29/oj>
9. EU, REGULATION (EC) No 1907/2006 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 18 December 2006 concerning the Registration, Evaluation, Authorisation and Restriction of Chemicals (REACH). <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2006/1907/oj>
10. EU, REGULATION (EC) No 1272/2008 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 16 December 2008 on classification, labelling and packaging of substances and mixtures. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2008/1272/oj>
11. EU, REGULATION (EU) No 528/2012 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 22 May 2012 concerning the making available on the market and use of biocidal products. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2012/528/oj>

12. EU, REGULATION (EC) No 1223/2009 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 30 November 2009 on cosmetic products. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2009/1223/oj>
13. EU, COMMISSION REGULATION (EU) No 655/2013 of 10 July 2013 laying down common criteria for the justification of claims used in relation to cosmetic products. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2013/655/oj>
14. EU, Technical document on cosmetic claims. Working group on cosmetic products 2017. <https://ec.europa.eu/docsroom/documents/24847/attachments/1/tranlations/en/renditions/native>
15. EU, REGULATION (EC) No 66/2010 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 25 November 2009 on the EU Ecolabel. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2010/66/oj>
16. NEN-EN-ISO, Environmental labels and declarations - Type I environmental labelling - Principles and procedures (ISO 14024:2018). <https://www.en-standard.eu/une-en-iso-14024-2018-environmental-labels-and-declarations-type-i-environmental-labelling-principles-and-procedures-iso-14024-2018/>
17. EU, Environmental claims in the EU - Inventory and reliability assessment. 2020. https://www.qualenergia.it/wp-content/uploads/2023/01/Envclaims_inventory_2020_final_publi.pdf
18. EU, Proposal for a directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on substantiation and communication of explicit environmental claims (Green Claims Directive). 2023. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=COM:2023:0166:FIN>
19. Final Report on the Safety Assessment of Yarrow (Achillea Millefolium) Extract. International Journal of Toxicology, 2001. 20: p. 79-84. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10915810160233785>
20. Becker, L.C., et al., Safety Assessment of Achillea millefolium as Used in Cosmetics. International Journal of Toxicology, 2016. 35: p. 5S-15S. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1091581816677717>
21. Antignac, E., et al., Safety of botanical ingredients in personal care products/cosmetics. Food Chem Toxicol, 2011. 49(2): p. 324-41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2010.11.022>
22. Knödler, M., et al., Evaluating a comprehensive database on pesticide residues in essential oils: An update. Journal of Applied Research on Medicinal and Aromatic Plants, 2021. 20: p. 100283. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2214786120300449>
23. EU, COMMISSION REGULATION (EU) 2022/1176 of 7 July 2022 amending Regulation (EC) No 1223/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the use of certain UV filters in cosmetic products. 2022. <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2022/1176/oj>
24. SCCS, Opinion on Benzophenone-4 (CAS No.4065-45-6, EC No. 223-772-2). 2023. https://health.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2023-12/sccs_o_283.pdf
25. Fiume, M.M., et al., Safety Assessment of Boron Nitride as Used in Cosmetics. International Journal of Toxicology, 2015. 34: p. 53S-60S. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1091581815617793>
26. Gottschalk, T.E., G.N. McEwen, T. Cosmetic, and A. Fragrance, International cosmetic ingredient dictionary and handbook. 11th 2006. ed. 2005, Washington, DC: The Cosmetic, Toiletry, and Fragrance Association.

27. Domi, B., et al., Assessment of Physico-Chemical and Toxicological Properties of Commercial 2D Boron Nitride Nanopowder and Nanoplatelets. *Int J Mol Sci*, 2021. 22(2).
<https://doi.org/10.3390/ijms22020567>
28. EU, Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 of 9 March 2012 laying down specifications for food additives listed in Annexes II and III to Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council Text with EEA relevance.
<http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2012/231/oj>
29. EFSA Panel on Food Additives Flavourings, Re-evaluation of calcium carbonate (E 170) as a food additive in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age and follow-up of its re-evaluation as food additive for uses in foods for all population groups. *EFSA Journal*, 2023. 21(7): p. e08106. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2023.8106>
30. Sung, J.H., et al., Physicochemical analysis and repeated-dose 90-days oral toxicity study of nanocalcium carbonate in Sprague-Dawley rats. *Nanotoxicology*, 2015. 9(5): p. 603-612.
<https://doi.org/10.3109/17435390.2014.958587>
31. Burnett, C.L., et al., Safety Assessment of Citrus-Derived Peel Oils as Used in Cosmetics. *International Journal of Toxicology*, 2019. 38: p. 33S-59S.
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1091581819862504>
32. Burnett, C.L., et al., Safety Assessment of Citrus Flower- and Leaf-Derived Ingredients as Used in Cosmetics. *International Journal of Toxicology*, 2021. 40: p. 53S-76S.
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/10915818211040477>
33. Di Bella, G., et al., Pesticide and plasticizer residues in citrus essential oils from different countries. *Nat Prod Commun*, 2010. 5(8): p. 1325-8.
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1934578X1000500838>
34. Pokajewicz, K., et al., *Lavandula x intermedia*-A Bastard Lavender or a Plant of Many Values? Part II. Biological Activities and Applications of Lavandin. *Molecules*, 2023. 28(7).
<https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules28072986>
35. European Medicines Agency. 2013 *Lavandulae aetheroleum*.
<https://www.ema.europa.eu/en/medicines/herbal/lavandulae-aetheroleum>
36. Borotová, P., et al., Role of *Litsea cubeba* Essential Oil in Agricultural Products Safety: Antioxidant and Antimicrobial Applications. *Plants (Basel)*, 2022. 11(11). <https://doi.org/10.3390/plants11111504>
37. Fiume, M.M., et al., Safety Assessment of *Rosmarinus officinalis* (Rosemary)-Derived Ingredients as Used in Cosmetics. *International Journal of Toxicology*, 2018. 37: p. 12S-50S.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1091581818800020>
38. German Federal Institute for Risk Assessment Unit of Food Toxicology, Risk assessment of white willow (*Salix alba*) in food. *EFSA Journal*, 2018. 16: p. e16081.
<https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.e16081>
39. Piątczak, E., et al., Identification and Accumulation of Phenolic Compounds in the Leaves and Bark of *Salix alba* (L.) and Their Biological Potential. *Biomolecules*, 2020. 10(10): p. 1391.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/biom10101391>

40. Borucinska, J.D. and S. Frasca, Naturally occurring lesions and micro-organisms in two species of free-living sharks: the spiny dogfish, *Squalus acanthias* L., and the smooth dogfish, *Mustelus canis* (Mitchill), from the north-western Atlantic. *Journal of Fish Diseases*, 2002. 25(5): p. 287-298.
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1046/j.1365-2761.2002.00373.x>
41. EU, Regulation (EC) No 1069/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 21 October 2009 laying down health rules as regards animal by-products and derived products not intended for human consumption and repealing Regulation (EC) No 1774/2002 (Animal by-products Regulation).
<http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2009/1069/oj>
42. NEN-EN-ISO, Aromatic natural raw materials - Vocabulary (ISO 9235:2021). <https://www.en-standard.eu/une-en-iso-9235-2022-aromatic-natural-raw-materials-vocabulary-iso-9235-2021/>
43. NEN-EN-ISO, Environmental statements and programmes for products - Principles and general requirements (ISO 14020:2022). <https://www.en-standard.eu/bs-en-iso-14020-2023-environmental-statements-and-programmes-for-products-principles-and-general-requirements/>
44. NEN-EN-ISO, Environmental management systems - Requirements with guidance for use (NEN-EN-ISO 14001). <https://www.en-standard.eu/iso-14001-environmental-management-systems-requirements-with-guidance-for-use/>
45. Wechem, R.v., Hoe duurzaam is het Deens cosmeticamerken Natulique nou echt?, in Trouw. 2022. <https://www.trouw.nl/duurzaamheid-economie/hoe-duurzaam-is-het-deense-cosmeticamerken-natulique-nou-echt~ba9c52e6/?referrer=https://www.google.com/>
46. Engels, T., 5 tips om gezond en divers te leven in een chemische wereld, in Knack. 2023. <https://www.knack.be/nieuws/gezondheid/5-tips-om-gezond-en-divers-te-leven-in-een-chemische-wereld/>
47. Jöris, S., Overall is een app voor: ook voor duurzaam leven, in De Limburger. 2022. https://www.limburger.nl/cnt/dmf20220909_97807582
48. Roskamp, H., À la recherche du parfum perdu, in HP De Tijd. 2023. <https://www.hpdetijd.nl/2023-06-25/a-la-recherche-du-parfum-perdu/>
49. Thieleman, J., 25x Belgische beautymerken om te (her)ontdekken. 2023. <https://www.libelle.be/mooi/belgische-cosmeticamerken/>
50. Van Springel, M., Reinhart Speeckaert, professor dermatologie: 'De grootste boosdoener voor melanomen is verbranding op jeugdige leeftijd', in De Morgen. 2023. <https://www.demorgen.be/beter-leven/reinhart-speeckaert-professor-dermatologie-de-grootste-boosdoener-voor-melanomen-is-verbranding-op-jeugdige-leeftijd~b1867c90/?referrer=https://www.google.com/>
51. Heida, M., De beste natuurlijke shampoo: dit zijn 8 fijne organic shampoos, in Cosmopolitan. 2023. <https://www.cosmopolitan.com/nl/beauty/g30909507/beste-organic-natuurlijke-shampoos/>

52. Schilten, W., Zijn natuurlijke producten nou écht het beste voor je huid?, in Harpers Bazaar. 2019.
<https://www.harpersbazaar.com/nl/beauty/a25786070/natuurlijke-producten-beter-beste-gezichtsverzorging/>
53. Apaolaza, V., et al., Natural ingredients claim's halo effect on hedonic sensory experiences of perfumes. *Food Quality and Preference*, 2014. 36: p. 81-86.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodqual.2014.03.004>
54. Meier, B.P., A.J. Dillard, and C.M. Lappas, Naturally better? A review of the natural-is-better bias. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass*, 2019. 13(8): p. e12494.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/spc3.12494>
55. dos Santos, R.C., M.J. de Brito Silva, M.F. da Costa, and K. Batista, Go vegan! digital influence and social media use in the purchase intention of vegan products in the cosmetics industry. *Social Network Analysis and Mining*, 2023. 13(1): p. 49.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13278-023-01034-7>
56. Bedard, S.A.N. and C.R. Tolmie, Millennials' green consumption behaviour: Exploring the role of social media. *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 2018. 25(6): p. 1388-1396.
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/csr.1654>
57. Pop, R.A., Z. Săplăcan, and M.A. Alt, Social Media Goes Green—The Impact of Social Media on Green Cosmetics Purchase Motivation and Intention. *Information*, 2020. 11(9): p. 447.
<https://www.mdpi.com/2078-2489/11/9/447>
58. Hassan, S.H., S.Z. Teo, T. Ramayah, and N.H. Al-Kumaim, The credibility of social media beauty gurus in young millennials' cosmetic product choice. *PLOS ONE*, 2021. 16(3): p. e0249286.
<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0249286>
59. EU, Support for the upcoming Commission Initiative towards an EU product policy framework supportive of Circular Economy: Draft report on open public consultation, for the European Commission DG Environment. 2019. <https://data.europa.eu/doi/10.2779/686823>
60. University of Copenhagen, Varnish Tree - *Rhus verniciflua*. 2023 [cited 2023 November 20]; Available from:
https://ign.ku.dk/arboretum-hoersholm/plant_descriptions/july_rhus_verniciflua/
61. EU, Briefing EU Legislation in Progress Classification, labelling and packaging of chemical substances and mixtures. 2023.
[https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2023/751425/EPRS_BRI\(2023\)751425_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2023/751425/EPRS_BRI(2023)751425_EN.pdf)

8 Acknowledgements

The authors thank Susan Wijnhoven and Marjolijn Woutersen for careful reading the manuscript and appreciate their valuable comments and suggestions.

9 Annex I Details of the types of products in the categories defined by Mintel

The category Beauty & Personal Care includes:

- Absorbent Hygiene³⁶
 - Diapers
 - Incontinence Products
 - Nursing Pads
 - Pads
 - Tampons
- Colour Cosmetics
 - Body Colour Cosmetics
 - Eye Colour Cosmetics - Eye Brow
 - Eye Colour Cosmetics - Eye Lash
 - Eye Colour Cosmetics - Eye Liner
 - Eye Colour Cosmetics - Eye Shadow
 - Face Colour Cosmetics – Blush
 - Face Colour Cosmetics – Bronzer
 - Face Colour Cosmetics – Concealer
 - Face Colour Cosmetics - Foundations / Fluid Illuminators
 - Face Colour Cosmetics – Powder
 - Face Colour Cosmetics – Primer
 - Lip Colour Cosmetics - Lip Colour
 - Lip Colour Cosmetics - Lip Liner
 - Multi-Use
 - Nail Colour Cosmetics
- Deodorants
 - Roll-on
 - Spray
 - Stick
 - Wipe
 - Other
- Fragrances
 - Men’s Fragrances
 - Unisex Fragrances
 - Women’s Fragrances
- Hair Products
 - Conditioner
 - Hair Colorants
 - Hair Styling
 - Hair Treatment
 - Shampoo
- Oral Hygiene
 - Dental Ancillaries
 - Mouthwash
 - Toothbrushes
 - Toothpaste
- Shaving & Depilatories
 - Depilatory Products

³⁶ This sub-category was not included in the search criteria.

- Razors
- Shaving Preparations
- Skincare
 - Body Care
 - Eye - Cleansers
 - Eye Care
 - Face - Cleansers
 - Face/Neck Care
 - Foot Care
 - Hand/Nail Care
 - Lip Care
 - Nail Enamel Removers
 - Sets
 - Sun - After Sun
 - Sun - Self-Tanning
 - Sun - Sun/Sunbed Exposure
- Soap & Bath Products
 - Bar Soap
 - Bath Additives
 - Intimate Hygiene
 - Liquid Soap
 - Shower Products
 - Wipes

The category Household includes:

- Air Care
 - Candles
 - Non-Powered Air Fresheners
 - Powered Air Fresheners/Deodorisers
- Cleaning Equipment
 - Shoe Care
 - Sponges, Mops, Dusters & Dry Cloths
- Dishwashing Products
 - Dishwasher Care
 - Dishwashing - Automatic
- Capsules
- Liquid
- Powder
- Tablet
- Other
 - Dishwashing - Hand
 - Rinse Aid
- Fabric Care
 - Automatic Detergents
- Capsules
- Liquid
- Powder
- Tablet
- Other
 - Bleach/Fabric Brighteners
 - Conditioners & Softeners
 - Fabric Fresheners/Moth Repellents
 - Hand Detergents/Shampoos
 - Ironing Aids

- Stain/Spot Removal
- Upholstery/Carpet Care
- Washing Machine/Iron Care
- Hard Surface Care
 - All-Purpose/Multi-Purpose Surface Care
 - Bath, Shower & Tile Care
 - Bleach/Disinfectant
 - Drain Care
 - Floor Care
 - Furniture Care
 - Glass Care
 - Household Appliance Care
 - Kitchen Care
 - Metal Cleaners
- Home Storage
 - Bags & Containers
 - Disposable Plates & Cups
 - Wraps & Foils
- Paper Products
 - Facial Tissue
 - Kitchen & Multi-Purpose Paper
 - Toilet Tissue (Dry and Wet)
- Pest Control
 - Dust Mites
 - Insect Killers/Repellents
 - Rodenticides
- Toilet Care
 - Toilet (Bowl) Cleaners
 - Toilet (Bowl) Fresheners

10 Annex II Complete list of ingredients in Beauty & personal care products with claims as mentioned in the Mintel GNPD

1,2-hexanediol	acrylates/dimethylaminoethyl methacrylate copolymer	alanine
1-methylhydantoin-2-imide	acrylates/ethylhexyl acrylate copolymer	alaria esculenta (seaweed)
2,5-dioxo-4-imidazolidinyl/urea of allantoin	acrylates/hydroxyesters acrylates copolymer	albizia julibrissin (silk tree)
2-amino-4-hydroxyethylaminoanisole sulfate	acrylates/octylacrylamide copolymer	alchemilla vulgaris (lady's mantle)
2-methylresorcinol	acrylates/polytrimethylsiloxymethacrylate copolymer	alcohol
3-hexenol	acrylate copolymer	alcohol denat.
4-chlororesorcinol	acrylates/steareth-20 methacrylate copolymer	alcohols
4-terpineol	acrylates/steareth-20 methacrylate crosspolymer	aleurites moluccana
abies sibirica needle oil	acrylates/stearyl acrylate/dimethicone methacrylate copolymer	aleurites moluccanus
abrus precatorius root extract	acrylates/stearyl methacrylate copolymer	algae extract
acacia concinna	acrylates/tris (trimethylsiloxy) silylpropyl methacrylate copolymer	algin
acacia decurrens	actinidia chinensis (kiwi)	alkanna tinctoria root extract
acacia decurrens/ajobaba/sunflower seed cera/polyglyceryl-3 esters	actinidia deliciosa fruit extract	allantoin
acacia senegal gum	activated carbon (coconut shell powder)	allium sativum bulb extract
acacia seyal gum	adansonia digitata (baobab)	aloe barbadensis (aloe vera)
acer rubrum (red maple) bark extract	adansonia grandidieri (baobab)	aloe species resin
acer saccharum extract	adenosine	alpha-glucan oligosaccharide
acetic acid	adenosine phosphate	alpha-isomethyl ionone
acetone	adipic acid/fumaric acid/phthalic acid/tricyclodecane dimethanol copolymer	alpinia calcarata rhizome/root extract
acetum	adipic acid/neopentyl glycol/trimellitic anhydride copolymer	althaea officinalis (marshmallow)
acetyl carnitine hcl	aegle marmelos root extract	althaea rosea flower extract
acetyl cysteine	aesculus hippocastanum	alumina
acetyl methionine	agar	aluminium chlorohydrate
acetyl tetrapeptide-11	agastache mexicana	aluminum calcium sodium silicate
acetyl tetrapeptide-3	flower/leaf/stem extract	aluminum hydroxide
acetyl tetrapeptide-5	agate	aluminum sesquichlorohydrate
acetyl tetrapeptide-9	agave americana stem extract	aluminum starch octenylsuccinate
acetyl tributyl citrate	agave tequilana	aluminum stearate
achillea asiatica		aluminum tristearate
achillea millefolium (yarrow)		amaranthus caudatus (amaranth)
acid red 52		amazonite
acid violet 43		amber
acmella oleracea extract		amethyst powder
acorus calamus root extract		aminomethyl propanediol
acrylates copolymer		aminomethyl propanol
acrylates crosspolymer		aminopropyl dimethicone
acrylates crosspolymer-4		ammonium acrylates copolymer
acrylates/behent-25 methacrylate copolymer		ammonium
acrylates/c10-30 alkyl acrylate crosspolymer		acryloyldimethyltaurate/vp copolymer
acrylates/dimethicone copolymer		ammonium cocoyl isethionate
		ammonium glycyrrhizate
		ammonium laureth sulfate
		ammonium lauryl sulfate
		ammonium polyacryloyldimethyl taurate

amodimethicone	asiaticoside	beta-glucan
amorphophallus konjac	aspalathus linearis (rooibos)	betaine
amorphophallus	aspartic acid	beta-sitosterol
konjac/glucomannan	aspergillus/camellia sinensis leaf	betula alba (birch)
amyl cinnamal	ferment extract filtrate	bha
amyloextrin	astragalus gummifer gum	bht
amyris balsamifera bark oil	astrocaryum murumuru seed	bidens tripartita flower/leaf/stem
ananas sativus (pineapple) fruit	butter	water
extract	astrocaryum tucuma seed butter	bifida ferment lysate
anethole	aureobasidium pullulans ferment	biosaccharide gum-1
angelica archangelica root oil	extract	biosaccharide gum-4
angelica gigas	avena sativa (oat)	biotin
anhydroxylitol	avena sativa bran	biotinoyl tripeptide-1
aniba rosaeodora wood oil	avena strigosa seed extract	bis-(isostearyl/oleoyl isopropyl)
anionogenic surfactant agents	azadirachta indica	dimonium methosulfate
(potassium lauroyl glycolate)	azelaic acid	bisabolol
(<5%)	babassu oil polyglyceryl-4 esters	bis-behenyl/isostearyl/phytosteryl
anise alcohol	babassuamidopropyl betaine	dimer dilinoleyl dimer dilinoleate
anthemis nobilis	bacillus ferment	bis-diglyceryl polyacyladipate-1
anthocyanins	backhousia citriodora leaf oil	bis-diglyceryl polyacyladipate-2
anthyllis vulneraria extract	bacopa monnieri	bis-ethoxydiglycol cyclohexane
apium graveolens seed extract	bakuchiol	1,4-dicarboxylate
aqua	bambusa arundinacea	bis-ethyl(isostearyl)imidazoline)
aquafaba (cicer arietinum)	bambusa vulgaris	isostearamide
arachidic acid	bassia butyracea seed butter	bis-ethylhexyl hydroxydimethoxy
arachidyl alcohol	beer	benzylmalonate
arachidyl glucoside	beeswax	bis-ethylhexyloxyphenol
arachis hypogaea oil	behenamidopropyl dimethylamine	methoxyphenyl triazine
araucaria angustifolia seed extract	beheneth-25	bis-hydroxy/methoxy
arctium lappa (burdock)	behentrimonium chloride	amodimethicone
arctium majus root extract	behentrimonium methosulfate	bixa orellana seed extract
arctostaphylos uva-ursi	behenyl alcohol	borago officinalis
(bearberry)	behenyl behenate	boron nitride
argania spinosa (argan)	behenyl/octyldodecyl propanediol	boswellia carterii
argilla	citrate crosspolymer	boswellia serrata
arginine	bellis perennis flower extract	boswellia sp. (frankinsence)
arginine/lysine polypeptide	bentonite	brassica alcohol
arnica chamissonis flower extract	benzalkonium chloride	brassica campestris
arnica montana (arnica)	benzoic acid	brassica campestris/aleurites
aroma	benzophenone-1	fordii oil copolymer
artemisia absinthium	benzophenone-3	brassica napus seed oil
artemisia arctica flower/leaf/stem	benzophenone-4	brassica nigra seed oil
water*	benzotriazolyl dodecyl p-cresol	brassica oleracea acephala
artemisia capillaris flower extract	benzyl alcohol	brassica oleracea italica (broccoli)
artemisia umbelliformis extract	benzyl benzoate	brassicamidopropyl
artemisia vulgaris (mugwort)	benzyl cinnamate	dimethylamine
extract	benzyl glycol	brassicyl isoleucinate esylate
arundinacea root powder	benzyl pca	bromelain
ascophyllum nodosum	benzyl salicylate	buddleja davidii (butterfly bush)
ascorbic acid	bertholletia excelsa	buddleja officinalis (butterfly lilac)
ascorbyl glucoside	beta tocopherol (natural vitamin	bulnesia sarmientoi extract
ascorbyl palmitate	e)	bursera graveolens wood oil
ascorbyl tetraisopalmitate	beta vulgaris	butane
asiatic acid	beta-carotene	butea monosperma extract

buteth-3	calcium silicate	cassia angustifolia seed polysaccharide
butyl acetate	calcium sodium borosilicate	cassia hydroxypropyltrimonium chloride
butyl methoxydibenzoylmethane	calcium titanium borosilicate	castor oil (sodium castorate)
butylene glycol	calendula officinalis	castoryl maleate
butylene glycol cocoate	calluna vulgaris (heather)	cedrol
butylene glycol	calophyllum inophyllum seed oil	cedrol methyl ether
dicaprylate/dicaprate	camelina sativa seed oil	cedrus atlantica
butyloctanoic acid	camellia japonica	cedrus deodara
butyloctyl salicylate	camellia oleifera	cellulose
butylphenyl methylpropional	camellia sinensis	cellulose acetate
butyrospermum parkii (shea)	camphor	cellulose gum
c10-18 triglycerides	cananga odorata (ylang ylang)	centaurea cyanus (cornflower)
c10-40	canarium luzonicum (elemi)	centella asiatica (pennywort)
isoalkylamidopropylethyldimoniumethosulfate	candelilla cera (euphorbia cerifera)	cera microcristallina
c11-15 alketh-7	candelilla/jojoba/rice bran polyglyceryl-3 esters	ceramide ng
c11-15 pareth-40	cannabidiol	ceramide np
c12-13 alcohols	cannabis sativa	ceratonia siliqua (carob) gum
c12-13 alkyl lactate	canola	ceresin
c12-14 pareth-12	caprae lac	cereus grandiflorus (cactus)
c12-15 alkyl benzoate	capric acid	flower extract
c12-15 alkyl lactate	capryl/capramidopropyl betaine	cerevisia beer
c12-18 acid triglyceride	caprylhydroxamic acid	ceteareth-12
c12-20 alkyl glucoside	caprylic acid	ceteareth-20
c13-14 isoalkane	caprylic/capric triglyceride	cetearyl alcohol
c13-15 alkane	caprylic/capric triglyceride (coconut)	cetearyl ethylhexanoate
c14-22 alcohols	capryloyl glycerin/sebacic acid copolymer	cetearyl glucoside
c15-19 alkane	capryloyl glycine	cetearyl isononanoate
c15-23 alkane	caprylyl (capryl) glucoside (vegetable cleaner)	cetearyl nonanoate
c18-21 alkane	caprylyl glucoside	cetearyl olivate
c18-36 acid glycol ester	caprylyl glyceryl ether	cetearyl wheat straw glycosides
c18-36 acid triglyceride	caprylyl glycol	ceteth-10 phosphate
c20-22 alcohols	caprylyl methicone	ceteth-20
c20-22 alkyl phosphate	caprylyl/capryl glucoside	cetraria islandica (iceland moss)
c20-40 acid	caprylyl/capryl wheat bran/straw glycosides	cetrimonium bromide
c20-40 alcohols	capsicum annuum (pepper)	cetrimonium chloride
c24-28 alkyldimethylsiloxy	caramel	cetrimonium methosulfate
trimethylsiloxysilicate	carapa guaianensis seed oil	cetyl alcohol
c30-45 alkyl dimethicone	carbomer	cetyl dimethicone
c9-12 alkane	carboxylic acids	cetyl esters
caesalpinia sappan bark extract	cardiospermum halicacabum flower/leaf/vine extract	cetyl ethylhexanoate
caesalpinia spinosa	carica papaya	cetyl palmitate
caffeine	carnelian	cetyl peg/ppg-10/1 dimethicone
calamine	carnosine	cetyl phosphate
calcite	carrageenan (chondrus crispus)	cetyl ricinoleate
calcium alginate	carthamus tinctorius (safflower)	cetyl stearate
calcium aluminum borosilicate	carum petroselinum	cetylpyridinium chloride
calcium bentonite clay	carvone	chalcedony
calcium chloride		chamaecyparis obtusa
calcium citrate		chamomilla recutita (chamomile)
calcium gluconate		charcoal (carbon)
calcium pantothenate		chelidonium majus extract
calcium pca		chenopodium quinoa (quinoa)
calcium pyrophosphate		

chiastolite	ci 77499 (black 11)	coco-glucoside
chlorella vulgaris	ci 77713	cocoglycerides
chlorhexidine digluconate	ci 77742	cocomono
chlorophyllin-copper complex	ci 77820	coconut acid
chlorphenesin	ci 77892	coconut alcohol
chondrus crispus	cicer arietinum seed extract	coconut alkanes
chouji yu	cimicifuga racemosa root extract	coconut flower sugar
chromium hydroxide green	cinchona succirubra bark extract	coconut milk
chrysin	cinnamal	cocos nucifera (coconut)
chrysoprase	cinnamic acid	cocoyl methyl glucamide
ci 10316	cinnamomum camphora	coffea arabica (coffee)
ci 11680	cinnamomum cassia	coffea robusta
ci 12490	cinnamomum zeylanicum	collagen
ci 13015	cinnamyl alcohol	collagen amino acids
ci 14700	citral	collodion
ci 14720	citrates	colophonium
ci 15510	citric acid	commiphora abyssinica resin
ci 15985	citrine	extract
ci 16035	citronellal	commiphora myrrha
ci 16185	citronellol	copaifera officinalis resin
ci 16255	citronellyl methylcrotonate	copernicia cerifera cera
ci 17200	citrullus colocynthis seed oil	copper gluconate
ci 18965	citrullus lanatus (watermelon)	copper pca
ci 19140	citrus aurantifolia (lime)	corallina officinalis extract
ci 28440	citrus aurantium amara	coriandrum sativum (coriander)
ci 40800	citrus aurantium bergamia	corn oil (corn acid)
ci 42051	citrus aurantium dulcis (orange)	corn pla floss*^
ci 42053	citrus aurantium sinensis peel oil	corylus avellana
ci 42090	citrus bergamia peel oil expressed	cosmetic colorant
ci 45410	citrus grandis	cosmetic flavouring
ci 47005	citrus limon (lemon)	coumarin
ci 51319	citrus medica limonum	crambe maritima leaf extract
ci 60725	citrus nobilis	crambe abyssinica (abyssinian
ci 60730	citrus paradisi (grapefruit)	kale) seed oil phytosterol esters
ci 61565	citrus reticulata	creatine
ci 61570	citrus sinensis (orange)	crithmum maritimum extract
ci 61585	citrus tangerina	crocus sativus flower extract
ci 73360	citrus unshiu peel extract	croscarmellose
ci 74160	clitoria ternatea flower extract	croton lechleri (dragons blood)
ci 74260	cocamide dea	resin extract
ci 75130	cocamide mea	cryptomeria japonica leaf extract
ci 75300	cocamide mipa	cucumis melo (melon) fruit
ci 75470	cocamidopropyl	extract
ci 75810	cocamidopropyl betaine	cucumis sativus (cucumber)
ci 77002	cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine	cucurbita moschata fruit powder
ci 77007	cocamidopropyl pg-dimonium	cucurbita pepo
ci 77120	chloride phosphate	cupressus funebris wood oil
ci 77163	coccinia indica fruit extract	cupressus sempervirens (cypress)
ci 77220	cochlearia armoracia root extract	curcuma aromatica root oil
ci 77266	coco-betaine	curcuma longa (turmeric)
ci 77288	coco-caprylate	curcuma zedoaria root oil
ci 77480	coco-caprylate/caprata	cv 1706501
ci 77491	cocodimonium hydroxypropyl	cyamopsis tetragonoloba gum
ci 77492	hydrolyzed wheat protein	cyanocobalamin

cyclohexasiloxane	diethylhexyl	disodium edta
cyclomethicone	syringylidenemalonate	disodium edta-copper
cyclopentasiloxane	diglycerin	disodium hydrogen phosphate
cydonia oblonga (quince)	diheptyl succinate	dihydrate
cylindrotheca fusiformis	dihydroxyacetone	disodium laureth sulfosuccinate
(plankton)	dihydroxypropyl arginine hcl	disodium lauryl sulfosuccinate
cymbopogon citratus	dihydroxypropyl peg-5	disodium methylene
cymbopogon flexuosus	linoleammonium chloride	dinaphthalenesulfonate
cymbopogon martini	diisopropyl sebacate	disodium phosphate
cymbopogon nardus oil	diisostearoyl polyglyceryl-3 dimer	disodium pyrophosphate
cymbopogon schoenanthus	dilinooleate	disodium stearoyl glutamate
cymbopogon winterianus leaf oil	diisostearyl malate	distarch phosphate
cyperus rotundus fruit extract	dilauryl thiodipropionate	disteardimonium hectorite
cyperus scariosus root extract	dimer dilinoleyl dimer dilinoleate	distearoylethyl dimonium chloride
dalbergia sissoo	dimethicone	distearoylethyl
darutoside	dimethicone crosspolymer	hydroxyethylmonium
dasiphora fruticosa water	dimethicone peg-8 polyacrylate	methosulfate
daucus carota sativa (carrot)	dimethicone propyl pg-betaine	distearyl ether
decanal	dimethicone/methicone copolymer	distearyldimonium chloride
decyl cocoate	dimethicone/peg-10/15	dmdm hydantoin
decyl glucoside	crosspolymer	dodecane
decyl oleate	dimethicone/vinyl dimethicone	dunaliella salina extract
decylene glycol	crosspolymer	echinacea purpurea (coneflower)
dehydroacetic acid	dimethiconol	echium plantagineum seed oil
dehydroxanthan gum	dimethiconol stearate	ecklonia cava extract
delta tocopherol (natural vitamin e)	dimethyl adipate	eclipta alba
denatonium benzoate	dimethyl glutarate	eclipta prostrata (false daisy)
desmodium gangeticum root extract	dimethyl isosorbide	ectoin
dextran	dimethyl palmitamine	eichhornia crassipes extract
dextrin	dimethyl succinate	elaeis guineensis (palm)
diacetone alcohol	dimethylheptenal	elettaria cardamomum
diacetyl	dimethylimidazolidinone rice starch	emblica officinalis (amla)
diacetyl boldine	dimethylmethoxy chromanol	emerald
diaminopropionoyl tripeptide-33	diospyros kaki (kaki) leaf extract	enantia chlorantha bark extract
diammonium citrate	dipalmitoyl hydroxyproline	enteromorpha compressa extract
diamond powder	dipalmitoylethyl	epigallocatechin gallate
diazolidinyl urea	hydroxyethylmonium	epilobium angustifolium
dibutyl adipate	methosulfate	epoxidized soybean oil
dicalcium phosphate	dipentaerythryl	equisetum arvense (horsetail)
dicaprylyl carbonate	hexahydroxystearate	equisetum hiemale (horsetail)
dicaprylyl ether	dipotassium glycyrrhizate	ergocalciferol
dicetyl phosphate	dipotassium phosphate	eriophorum spissum flower/stem extract
dicetyldimonium chloride	dipropylene glycol	erythritol
dichlorobenzyl alcohol	dipropylene glycol dibenzoate	erythrulose
diethyl sebacate	dipterocarpus turbinatus balsam oil	escin
diethyl succinate	dipteryx odorata	ethanolamine
diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl	disiloxane	ethoxydiglycol
hexyl benzoate	disodium 2-sulfolaurate	ethyl acetate
diethylhexyl butamido triazone	disodium cetearyl sulfosuccinate	ethyl ascorbic acid
diethylhexyl carbonate	disodium cocoamphodiacetate	ethyl ferulate
diethylhexyl sodium	disodium coco-glucoside citrate	ethyl lactate
sulfosuccinate	disodium cocoyl glutamate	ethyl lauroyl arginate hcl
		ethyl macadamiate

ethyl vanillin	gardenia jasminoides	glyceryl stearate
ethylcellulose	gardenia tahitensis	glyceryl stearate citrate
ethylene/propylene copolymer	gaultheria procumbens	glyceryl stearate se
ethylhexyl hydroxystearate	gaultheria procumbens leaf oil	glyceryl undecylenate
ethylhexyl isononanoate	gelidium sesquipedale extract	glycine
ethylhexyl methoxycinnamate	gellan gum	glycine soja extract
ethylhexyl palmitate	genipa americana fruit extract	glycine soja germ extract
ethylhexyl salicylate	genipin	glycine soja oil
ethylhexyl stearate	gentiana lutea root extract	glycine soja oil unsaponifiables
ethylhexyl triazone	geraniol	glycine soja protein
ethylhexylglycerin	geranium maculatum extract	glycine soja seed extract
ethylparaben	geranium sibiricum extract	glycine soja sterol
etocrylene	geranyl acetate	glycogen
eucalyptus citriodora	ginkgo biloba leaf extract	glycol copolymer
eucalyptus globulus	globularia cordifolia callus culture	glycol distearate
eugenia caryophyllus (clove)	extract	glycol palmitate
eugenol	glucomannan	glycol stearate
euphorbia cerifera cera	gluconic acid	glycolic acid
euphrasia officinalis extract	gluconolactone	glycolipids
euterpe oleracea (acai)	glucose	glycoproteins
evernia furfuracea (treemoss)	glucuronic acid	glycosphingolipids
extract	glutamic acid	glycyrrhetic acid
evernia prunastri (oakmoss)	glycereth-2 cocoate	glycyrrhiza glabra leaf extract
extract	glycereth-25 pca isostearate	glycyrrhiza glabra root extract
evodia rutaecarpa fruit extract	glycereth-26	glycyrrhiza uralensis root extract
faex extract	glycereth-7 caprylate/caprata	glyoxal
fagraea berteriana flower extract	glycerin	gmelina arborea root extract
fagus sylvatica bud extract	glycerophosphocholine	gossypium herbaceum (cotton)
farnesene	glyceryl acrylate/acrylic acid	gossypium hirsutum (cotton) seed
farnesol	copolymer	extract
figus carica (fig)	glyceryl arachidonate	guaiazulene
foeniculum vulgare (fennel)	glyceryl behenate	guar hydroxypropyltrimonium
folic acid	glyceryl behenate/eicosadioate	chloride
formic acid	glyceryl caprate	hamamelis virginiana (witch
fragaria ananassa	glyceryl caprylate	hazel)
fragaria vesca juice	glyceryl caprylate (vegetable)	hbiscus sabdariffa flower powder
fragrance of vanilla and mandarin	glyceryl caprylate/caprata	hdi/trimethylol hexyllactone
fraxinus excelsior bark extract	glyceryl citrate crosspolymer	crosspolymer
fructooligosaccharides	glyceryl	hectorite
fructose	citrate/lactate/linoleate/oleate	hedera helix (ivy) leaf extract
fructosyl cocoate/oliveate	glyceryl dibehenate	hedychium coronarium root
fucus serratus extract	glyceryl distearate	extract
fucus vesiculosus (bladderwarck	glyceryl	hedychium spicatum extract
seaweed)	ethylhexanoate/stearate/adipate	helianthus annuus (sunflower)
fumaric acid	glyceryl hydroxystearate	helichrysum angustifolium flower
furcellaria lumbricalis extract	glyceryl isostearate	oil
fusanus spicatus wood oil	glyceryl laurate	helichrysum italicum flower
galactoarabinan	glyceryl linoleate	extract
galium verum extract	glyceryl linolenate	hemidesmus indicus root extract
gallic acid	glyceryl oleate	heptanol
gamma tocopherol (natural	glyceryl oleate citrate	heptapeptide-15 palmitate
vitamin e)	glyceryl polyacrylate	heptyl glucoside
garcinia mangostana	glyceryl ricinoleate	heptyl undecylenate
(mangosteen)	glyceryl rosinat	hexanal

hexanediol	hydrogenated palm glycerides	hydrolyzed starch
hexanoyl dipeptide-3 norleucine acetate	citrate	hydrolyzed triticum monococcum seed extract
hexapeptide-11	hydrogenated palm kernel glycerides	hydrolyzed vegetable protein
hexyl acetate	hydrogenated polycyclopentadiene	hydrolyzed vegetable protein pg-propyl silanetriol
hexyl cinnamal	hydrogenated polydecene	hydrolyzed wheat gluten
hexyl laurate	hydrogenated polyisobutene	hydrolyzed wheat protein
hexyl salicylate	hydrogenated rapeseed oil	hydrolyzed wheat protein pg-propyl silanetriol
hexylene glycol	hydrogenated soy polyglycerides	hydrolyzed wheat starch
hexylresorcinol	hydrogenated soybean oil	hydrolyzed yeast protein
hibiscus abelmoschus seed extract	hydrogenated starch hydrolysate	hydroxyacetophenone
hibiscus rosa-sinensis flower powder	hydrogenated stearyl olive esters	hydroxycitronellal
hibiscus sabdariffa	hydrogenated styrene/isoprene copolymer	hydroxycitronellol
himanthalia elongata (thongweed) extract	hydrogenated styrene/methyl styrene/indene copolymer	hydroxyethyl acrylate/sodium acryloyldimethyl taurate copolymer
hippophae rhamnoides (sea buckthorn)	hydrogenated tetradecenyl/methylpentadecene	hydroxyethyl ethylcellulose
histidine	hydrogenated vegetable glycerides	hydroxyethyl urea
homosalate	hydrogenated vegetable glycerides citrate	hydroxyethylcellulose
hordeum distichon extract	hydrogenated vegetable oil	hydroxymethoxyphenyl decanone
hordeum vulgare	hydrolysed adansonia digitata extract	hydroxyphenyl propamidobenzoic acid
houttuynia cordata extract	hydrolyzed agave tequilana stem extract	hydroxypropyl cyclodextrin
humulus lupulus (hop)	hydrolyzed algin	hydroxypropyl guar
hyaluronic acid	hydrolyzed beeswax	hydroxypropyl guar
hydrastis canadensis root extract	hydrolyzed caesalpinia spinosa gum	hydroxypropyltrimonium chloride
hydrated silica	hydrolyzed carrot protein	hydroxypropyl methylcellulose
hydrochloric acid	hydrolyzed ceratonia siliqua seed extract	hydroxypropyl oxidized starch pg-trimonium chloride
hydrogen dimethicone	hydrolyzed corn protein	hydroxypropyl starch phosphate
hydrogen peroxide	hydrolyzed corn starch	hydroxypropylammonium gluconate
hydrogenated acetophenone/oxymethylene copolymer	hydrolyzed corn starch octenylsuccinate	hydroxypropylcellulose
hydrogenated apricot kernel oil	hydrolyzed gardenia florida extract	hydroxypropylgluconamide
hydrogenated avocado oil/butter	hydrolyzed glycosaminoglycans	hydroxypropyltrimonium hyaluronate
hydrogenated castor oil	hydrolyzed hyaluronic acid	hydroxystearic acid
hydrogenated castor oil behenyl esters	hydrolyzed jojoba esters	hydroxystearic/linolenic/oleic polyglycerides
hydrogenated castor oil/sebacic acid copolymer	hydrolyzed kale protein	hylocereus undatus fruit extract
hydrogenated cetyl olive esters	hydrolyzed lemon protein	hypericum erectum flower/leaf/stem extract
hydrogenated coco-glycerides	hydrolyzed lepidium meyenii root	hypericum perforatum (st. john's wort/hypericum)
hydrogenated coconut oil	hydrolyzed linseed extract	hyssopus officinalis extract
hydrogenated dilinoleyl alcohol	hydrolyzed oat protein	illex paraguariensis (mate)
hydrogenated dilinoleyl alcohol	hydrolyzed pea protein	illicium verum (anise)
hydrogenated ethylhexyl olivate	hydrolyzed pearl	illite (yellow clay)
hydrogenated jojoba oil	hydrolyzed quinoa	imperata cylindrica root extract
hydrogenated jojoba wax	hydrolyzed rhodophyceae extract	indigofera tinctoria leaf extract
hydrogenated lecithin	hydrolyzed rice protein	infused
hydrogenated olive oil	hydrolyzed soy protein	inositol
hydrogenated olive oil unsaponifiables		
hydrogenated palm glyceride citrate*		
hydrogenated palm glycerides		

inulin	justicia adhatoda leaf extract	lauryl glucoside
inulin lauryl carbamate	kalanchoe daigremontiana	lauryl hydroxysultaine
iodopropynyl butylcarbamate	kaolin	lauryl lactate
ionone	kigelia africana fruit extract	lauryl laurate
ipomoea batatas (potato)	kniphofia uvaria nectar	lauryl methacrylate/glycol
iris florentina	lactic acid	dimethacrylate crosspolymer
iris germanica root extract	lactic acid/glycolic acid copolymer	lauryl olivate
iron oxide	lactitol	lauryl peg/ppg-18/18 methicone
irvingia gabonensis kernel butter	lactobacillus	lauryl peg-10
isoamyl cocoate	lactobacillus/aspergillus/prunus	tris(trimethylsiloxy)silylethyl
isoamyl laurate	mume fruit ferment filtrate	dimethicone
isoamyl p-methoxycinnamate	lactobacillus/coconut fruit juice	lavandula angustifolia (lavender)
isobutane	ferment filtrate	lavandula hybrida
isobutyl acetate	lactobacillus/dipteryx odorata	lavender oil
isoceteth-10	seed ferment filtrate	lawsonia inermis (henna)
isoceteth-20	lactobacillus/hibiscus sabdariffa	lecithin
isocetyl palmitate	flower ferment filtrate	lentinus edodes (shiitake
isocetyl stearyl stearate	lactobacillus/papaya fruit ferment	mushroom) extract
isodecyl neopentanoate	extract	leontopodium alpinum
isododecane	lactobacillus/wasabia japonica	leptospermum petersonii oil
isoeugenol	root ferment extract	leptospermum scoparium
isohexadecane	lactococcus ferment extract	branch/leaf oil
isoleucine	lactose	leuconostoc/radish root ferment
isomalt	laminaria digitata	filtrate
isomerized linoleic acid	laminaria japonica extract	levulinic acid
isononyl isononanoate	laminaria saccharina extract	lilium candidum bulb extract
isopentane	lamium album extract	limnanthes alba seed oil
isopentyldiol	lanolin	limonene
isopropyl alcohol	lapsana communis	limonium gerberi extract
isopropyl isostearate	flower/leaf/stem extract	limonium vulgare flower/leaf/stem
isopropyl lauroyl sarcosinate	larix sibirica needle extract	extract
isopropyl myristate	laurdimonium hydroxypropyl	linalool
isopropyl palmitate	hydrolyzed wheat protein	linoleic acid
isopropyl titanium triisostearate	laureth-10	linolenic acid
isostearamide mipa	laureth-12	linum usitatissimum (linseed)
isostearic acid	laureth-2	lithium magnesium sodium silicate
isostearyl alcohol	laureth-21	lithospermum erythrorhizon root
isostearyl hydroxystearate	laureth-23	extract
isostearyl isostearate	laureth-3	lithospermum officinale root
isostearyl neopentanoate	laureth-4	extract
isostearyl sebacate	laureth-4 carboxylic acid	lithothamnion calcareum extract
janina rubens extract	laureth-5 carboxylic acid	litsea cubeba
jasminum officinale (jasmine)	laureth-6 carboxylic acid	l-limonene
jasminum sambac flower extract	laureth-7	lonicera caprifolium (honeysuckle)
jatropha mahafalensis seed oil	laureth-7 citrate	lonicera japonica (honeysuckle)
jojoba alcohol	lauric acid	luffa cylindrica fruit
jojoba esters	lauroyl lysine	lychee (litsea cubeba) oil
juglans regia	lauroyl/myristoyl methyl	lycium barbarum fruit extract
juniperus chinensis (juniper)	glucamide	lycium chinense fruit extract
juniperus communis (juniper)	laurus nobilis fruit oil	lysine
juniperus mexicana	lauryl acrylate crosspolymer	lysine cocoate
juniperus phoenicea wood oil	lauryl alcohol	lysine hcl
rectified	lauryl betaine	lysolecithin
juniperus virginiana	lauryl dimethicone	macadamia integrifolia seed oil

macadamia seed oil polyglyceryl-6-mentha australis leaf extract
 esters behenate mentha piperita (peppermint)
 macadamia ternifolia seed oil mentha rotundifolia leaf extract
 macrocystis pyriferia mentha spicata
 madecassic acid mentha viridis
 madecassoside menthol
 magnesium aluminum silicate menthone glycerin acetal
 magnesium ascorbyl phosphate methyl acetate
 magnesium aspartate methyl lactate
 magnesium carbonate hydroxide menyanthes trifoliata extract
 magnesium chloride methicone
 magnesium citrate methoxy peg/ppg-7/3
 magnesium hydroxide aminopropyl dimethicone
 magnesium myristate methyl benzoate
 magnesium nitrate methyl diisopropyl propionamide
 magnesium oxide methyl gluceth-10
 magnesium palmitate methyl gluceth-20
 magnesium pca methyl glucose dioleate
 magnesium silicate methyl glucose sesquistearate
 magnesium stearate methyl hydrogenated rosinat
 magnesium sulfate methyl methacrylate crosspolymer
 magnesium sulphate eptahydrate methyl perfluorobutyl ether
 magnolia officinalis bark extract methyl perfluoroisobutyl ether
 malachite extract methyl soyate
 malic acid methyl trimethicone
 malpighia emarginata fruit extract methylcellulose
 malpighia glabra (acerola) methylchloroisothiazolinone
 malt extract methylene bis-benzotriazolyl
 maltitol tetramethylbutylphenol
 maltodextrin methylisothiazolinone
 maltol methylparaben
 maltose methylpropanediol
 malva sylvestris (mallow) metrosideros excelsa
 m-aminophenol (pohutukawa)
 mangifera indica mica
 manihot utilissima starch michelia alba flower oil
 mannitol microcitrus australasica fruit
 mannose extract
 maranta arundinacea microcrystalline cellulose
 maris aqua mimosa tenuiflora leaf extract
 maris sal mineral salts
 marrubium vulgare extract mint flavour
 mauritia flexuosa fruit oil mipa-laureth sulfate
 mel molasses extract
 melaleuca alternifolia montmorillonite
 melaleuca viridiflora leaf oil moringa oleifera
 melia azadirachta (neem) moringa pterygosperma seed
 melilotus albus flower/leaf/stem extract
 extract moroccan lava clay
 melilotus officinalis (sweet clover) morus alba (mulberry)
 melissa officinalis (balm morus nigra fruit extract
 mint/lemon balm) musa paradisiaca fruit juice
 mentha aquatica musa sapientum fruit extract
 mentha arvensis mustard seed oil

myrciaria dubia (camu camu)
 myrica cerifera fruit cera
 myrica pubescens fruit cera
 myristamidopropyl pg-dimonium
 chloride phosphate
 myristic acid
 myristica fragrans extract
 myristoyl hexapeptide-16
 myristoyl pentapeptide-17
 myristyl alcohol
 myristyl lactate
 myristyl myristate
 myroxylon pereirae oil
 myrtrimonium bromide
 myrtus communis leaf water
 n,n-bis(2-hydroxyethyl)-p-
 phenylenediamine sulfate
 nardostachys jatamansi
 nasturtium officinale (watercress)
 natriumoxydihydrat
 n-butyl alcohol
 nelumbium speciosum flower
 extract
 nelumbo nucifera
 neopentyl glycol diheptanoate
 nereocystis luetkeana extract
 n-hydroxysuccinimide
 niacin
 niacinamide
 nigella sativa
 nitrogen
 non-ionogenic surfactant agents
 (5-15%) (coco-glucoside)
 nyctanthes arbor-tristis flower
 extract
 nylon-12
 nymphaea caerulea flower extract
 nymphaea lotus flower extract
 nymphaea stellata flower extract
 oakmoss (evernia prunastri)
 extract
 ocimum basilicum
 ocimum sanctum
 ocimum tenuiflorum extract
 octadecyl di-t-butyl-4-
 hydroxyhydrocinnamate
 octenidine hcl
 octocrylene
 octylacrylamide/acrylates/butylam
 inoethyl methacrylate copolymer
 octyldodecanol
 octyldodecyl citrate crosspolymer
 octyldodecyl myristate
 octyldodecyl neopentanoate

octyldodecyl stearoyl stearate	palmitoyl grape seed extract	peg-180
o-cymen-5-ol	palmitoyl myristyl serinate	peg-2 oleamine
oenocarpus bataua fruit oil	palmitoyl tetrapeptide-7	peg-20 glyceryl laurate
oenothera biennis (evening primerose)	palmitoyl tripeptide-1	peg-20 glyceryl triisostearate
olea europaea (olive)	palmitoyl tripeptide-38	peg-20 methyl glucose sesquistearate
oleanolic acid	palmitoyl tripeptide-5	peg-20 stearate
oleic acid	palmitoyl tripeptide-7	peg-200 hydrogenated glyceryl palmate
oleic/linoleic/linolenic	panax ginseng	peg-240/hdi copolymer bis- decyltetradeceth-20 ether
polyglycerides	panicum miliaceum (millet)	peg-3 distearate
oleth-5	p-anisic acid	peg-30 dipolyhydroxystearate
oleyl erucate	panthenol	peg-32
olive oil glycereth-8 esters	panthenyl triacetate	peg-4
olive oil polyglyceryl-6 esters	pantolactone	peg-4 distearyl ether
olus oil	papain	peg-4 rapeseedamide
onosma hispidum extract	papaver rhoeas extract	peg-40
opuntia ficus indica	papaver somniferum	peg-40 castor oil
orbignya oleifera seed oil	paraffin	peg-40 hydrogenated castor oil
orbignya speciosa kernel oil	paraffinum liquidum	peg-40 sorbitan peroleate
organic almond (prunus dulcis) butter	parfum	peg-40 stearate
organic cashew (anacardium occidentale) butter	parfum (citrus aurantium (neroli light) essential oil)	peg-55 propylene glycol oleate
organic cymbopogon (lemongrass) extract and organic aloe	parfum (natural almond fragrance)	peg-6
barbadensis leaf extract	parfum (natural cherry blossom fragrance)	peg-6 caprylic/capric glycerides
organic passiflora incarnata (passion) fruit extract	parfum (natural essential oils)	peg-60 hydrogenated castor oil
organic pumpkin (cucurbita pepo) seed butter	parfum tocopherol	peg-7
organic rosmarinus officinalis (rosemary) leaf extract and	passiflora edulis	peg-7 glyceryl cocoate
organic robus ideous (rapsberyry) leaf extract	passiflora incarnata flower extract	peg-75 shea butter glycerides
origanum dictamnus	paullinia cupana	peg-75 stearate
flower/leaf/stem extract	pavlova lutheri (micro algae)	peg-8
origanum majorana	pca	peg-8/smdi copolymer
origanum vulgare	pca ethyl cocoyl arginate	peg-8/smdi palmitoyl myristyl serinate
ormenis multicaulis	pca glyceryl oleate	peg-9 cocoglycerides
oroxyllum indicum root extract	peat moss extract	peg-90
oryza sativa	pectin	peg-90m
oryzanol	peg/ppg-116/66 copolymer	pelargonium graveolens
oxidized polyethylene	peg/ppg-120/10 trimethylpropane trioleate	pelargonium roseum leaf oil
oxycoccus palustris seed oil	peg/ppg-18/18 dimethicone	pelvetia canaliculata extract
ozokerite	peg-10 dimethicone	pentaclethra macroloba seed oil
paeonia lactiflora (peonia)	peg-10 isostearate	pentadecalactone
paeonia officinalis flower extract	peg-100 stearate	pentaerythrityl distearate
paeonia suffruticosa root extract	peg-12	pentaerythrityl stearate/caprate/caprylate/adipat e
palm kernel acid	peg-12 dimethicone	pentaerythrityl
palmaria palmata extract	peg-120 methyl glucose dioleate	tetracaprylate/tetracaprate
palmitamidopropyltrimonium chloride	peg-120 methyl glucose tiroleate	pentaerythrityl tetra-di-t-butyl hydroxyhydrocinnamate
palmitic acid	peg-120 methyl glucose trioleate	pentaerythrityl tetraisostearate
palmitic/stearic triglyceride	peg-14m	pentasodium pentetate
	peg-150 distearate	pentasodium triphosphate
	peg-150 pentaerythrityl tetrastearate	pentylene glycol
	peg-150 stearate	
	peg-18 glyceryl oleate/cocoate	

perfluorohexylethyl triethoxysilane	pisum sativum (pea)	polyglyceryl-3 diisostearate
perilla frutescens leaf extract	plankton extract	polyglyceryl-3 distearate
perilla ocymoides	plantago lanceolata (plantain)	polyglyceryl-3 methylglucose distearate
perlite	plantago major	polyglyceryl-3 palmitate
persea gratissima (avocado)	plantago psyllium	polyglyceryl-3 pca
petrolatum	platonina insignis seed butter	polyglyceryl-3 polyricinoleate
petroselinum crispum extract	plukenetia volubilis seed oil	polyglyceryl-3 polyricinoleate
peucedanum graveolens extract	plumeria alba flower extract	polyglyceryl-3 rice branate
phaseolus radiatus seed extract	plumeria rubra flower extract	polyglyceryl-3 ricinoleate
phellinus linteus extract	pogostemon cablin	polyglyceryl-3 stearate
phellodendron amurense bark extract	polianthes tuberosa extract	polyglyceryl-3 stearate se
phenethyl alcohol	poloxamer 101	polyglyceryl-3-polyricinoleate (vegetable)
phenoxyethanol	poloxamer 122	polyglyceryl-4 caprate
phenyl trimethicone	poloxamer 124	polyglyceryl-4 caprylate
phenylalanine	poloxamer 184	polyglyceryl-4 cocoate
phenylbenzimidazole sulfonic acid	poloxamer 188	polyglyceryl-4
phenyllactic acid	polyacrylamide	diisostearate/polyhydroxystearate /sebacate
phenylpropanol	polyacrylate crosspolymer-11	polyglyceryl-4 isostearate
phosphatidylglycerol	polyacrylate crosspolymer-6	polyglyceryl-4 laurate
phospholipids	polyacrylate-13	polyglyceryl-4 laurate/sebacate
phosphoric acid	polyamide-8	polyglyceryl-4 laurate/succinate
phragmites kharka	polybutene	polyglyceryl-4 oleate
phthalic anhydride/glycerin/glycidyl decanoate copolymer	polyester-37	polyglyceryl-6 behenate
phthalic anhydride/trimellitic anhydride/glycols copolymer	polyester-5	polyglyceryl-6 caprylate
phyllanthus emblica (indian gooseberry)	polyethylene	polyglyceryl-6 caprylate/caprate
phyllostachys bambusoides extract	polyethylene terephthalate	polyglyceryl-6 dioleate
phyllostachys nigra extract (black bamboo)	polyglycerin-10	polyglyceryl-6 distearate
phytantriol	polyglycerin-3	polyglyceryl-6 laurate
phytic acid	polyglycerin-6	polyglyceryl-6 oleate
phytosterols	polyglyceryl-10 dioleate	polyglyceryl-6 palmitate/succinate
phytosteryl isostearate	polyglyceryl-10	polyglyceryl-6 pentaoleate
picea abies (spruce)	eicosanedioate/tetradecanedioate	polyglyceryl-6 polyhydroxy stearate
picea obovata needle extract	polyglyceryl-10	polyglyceryl-6 polyricinoleate
pichia ferment lysate filtrate	heptahydroxystearate	polyglyceryl-6 ricinoleate
pigment red 101	polyglyceryl-10 isostearate	polyglyceryl-6 stearate
pigment yellow 42	polyglyceryl-10 laurate	polygonatum multiflorum rhizome/root extract
pimpinella anisum	polyglyceryl-10 myristate	polygonium multiflorum (ho hou wu)
pinus cembra twig leaf oil	polyglyceryl-10 stearate	polygonum tinctorium leaf extract
pinus palustris leaf extract	polyglyceryl-2 caprate	polyhydroxystearic acid
pinus pinaster	polyglyceryl-2 diisostearate	polyimide-1
pinus sibirica	polyglyceryl-2	polyisobutene
pinus strobus (white pine)	dipolyhydroxystearate	polylysine
pinus sylvestris	polyglyceryl-2 isostearate/dimer	polymethylsilsesquioxane
piper longum fruit extract	dilinoleate copolymer	polypropylene
piper nigrum (black pepper)	polyglyceryl-2 triisostearate	polypropylsilsesquioxane
piroctone olamine	polyglyceryl-3 beeswax	polyquaternium-10
pistacia lentiscus gum	polyglyceryl-3 caprate	polyquaternium-11
	polyglyceryl-3	polyquaternium-116
	caprate/caprylate/succinate	polyquaternium-37
	polyglyceryl-3 caprylate	
	polyglyceryl-3 cetyl ether	
	olive/succinate	
	polyglyceryl-3 cocoate	
	polyglyceryl-3 dicitrate/stearate	

polyquaternium-39	potassium palmitate	prunus spinosa
polyquaternium-4	potassium palmitoyl hydrolyzed	pseudoalteromonas ferment
polyquaternium-47	wheat protein	extract
polyquaternium-6	potassium shea butterate	pseudozyma epicola (apricot
polyquaternium-7	potassium sorbate	kernel oil)
polysilicone-11	potassium stearate	pseudozyma epicola/camellia
polysilicone-15	potassium tartrate	sinensis seed oil ferment extract
polysilicone-19	pouteria sapota (mamey sapote)	filtrate
polysorbate 20	ppg-1 trideceth-6	psidium guajava fruit extract
polysorbate 60	ppg-12/smdi copolymer	pteridium aquilinum extract
polysorbate 65	ppg-14 butyl ether	pterocarpus soyauxii wood extract
polysorbate 80	ppg-15 stearyl ether	pueraria lobata root extract
polyurethane-11	ppg-2 hydroxyethyl cocamide	pullulan
polyurethane-34	ppg-2 hydroxyethyl	pumice
polyvinyl alcohol	coco/isostearamide	punica granatum
polyvinyl butyral	ppg-20 methyl glucose ether	pure magnesium salt minerals
polyvinyl stearyl ether	ppg-25-laureth-25	pvm/ma copolymer
pongamia glabra seed oil	ppg-26-buteth-26	pvm/ma decadiene crosspolymer
pongamol	ppg-2-deceth-30	pvp
poria cocos extract	ppg-3 benzyl ether myristate	pyridoxine hcl
porphyra umbilicalis extract	ppg-5-ceteth-20	pyrus communis (pear)
portulaca oleracea extract	ppg-6	pyrus cydonia (quince)
portulaca pilosa extract	ppg-8-ceteth-20	pyrus malus
postelsia palmaeformis thallus	ppg-9	pyruvic acid
extract	p-phenylenediamine	quartz
potassium alum	premna serratifolia root extract	quaternium-22
potassium azeloyl diglycinate	preservative	quaternium-80
potassium benzoate	preservatives and antimicrobial	quaternium-87
potassium carbonate	agents	quaternium-90
potassium cetyl phosphate	proline	quaternium-91
potassium chloride	propane	quercus robur
potassium citrate	propanediol	quillaja saponaria
potassium cocoate	propanediol dicaprylate	raphanus sativus (radish)
potassium cocoyl glycinate	propolis	raspberry ketone
potassium hempate (saponified	propyl acetate	rebaudioside a
hemp oil)	propyl gallate	red 6 (ci 15850)
potassium hyaluronate	propylene carbonate	red 7 (ci 15850)
potassium hydrolyzed	propylene glycol	rehydrolyzed jojoba esters
polygamma-glutamate	propylene glycol dibenzoate	retinol
potassium hydroxide	propylene glycol	retinyl palmitate
potassium jojobate	dicaprylate/dicaprate	rhamnose
potassium kernelate (saponified	propylene glycol isostearate	rheum rhabarbarum (rhubarb)
palm kernel oil)	propylheptyl caprylate	rhizobian gum
potassium lactate	propylparaben	rhodiola rosea root extract
potassium laurate	prostanthera incisa leaf extract	rhododendron anthopogon
potassium laureth-4 carboxylate	prunus amygdalus dulcis	flower/leaf extract
potassium lauryl sulfate	prunus armeniaca (apricot)	rhododendron ferrugineum
potassium metabisulfite	prunus avium	rhus succedanea fruit cera
potassium nitrate	prunus cerasus flower extract	rhus verniciflua peel cera
potassium oleate	prunus domestica	rhus verniciflua peel cera/rhus
potassium olivate	prunus dulcis (almond)	succedanea fruit cera
potassium olivate/cocoate	prunus persica (peach)	ribes nigrum (black currant)
potassium palm kernelate	prunus serotina (wild cherry)	ribose
(saponified palm kernel oil)	prunus serrulata flower extract	ricinus communis (castor)

rosa canina (rosehip)	sclerocarya birrea seed oil	sodium caproyl/lauroyl lactylate (plant/salt complex)
rosa centifolia	sclerotium gum	sodium carbonate
rosa damascena (rose)	scutellaria baicalensis root extract	sodium carboxymethyl betaglucan
rosa gallica flower extract	sd alcohol 40-b	sodium carrageenan
rosa moschata	selaginella lepidophylla (rose of jericho) extract	sodium castorate
rosa rubiginosa seed oil	serica powder	sodium cetearyl sulfate
rosa rugosa flower oil	serine	sodium chloride
rosmarinus officinalis	sesamum indicum (sesame)	sodium citrate
rosmarinyl glucoside	shea butter ethyl esters	sodium coceth sulfate
royal jelly	shorea robusta resin	sodium cocoa butterate
rubia cordifolia root extract	shorea stenoptera seed butter	sodium cocoamphoacetate
rubus arcticus fruit extract	sh-polypeptide-69	sodium cocoate
rubus chamaemorus (cloudberry)	sida cordifolia extract	sodium coco-sulfate
rubus fruticosus (blackberry)	sideritis syriaca extract	sodium cocoyl apple amino acids
rubus idaeus	sigesbeckia orientalis extract	sodium cocoyl glutamate
rubus villosus (blackberry) leaf extract	silanetriol	sodium cocoyl glycinate
ruscus aculeatus root extract	silica	sodium cocoyl hydrolyzed pea protein
saccharide isomerate	silica dimethyl silylate	sodium cocoyl hydrolyzed wheat protein
saccharin	silica silylate	sodium cocoyl isethionate
saccharomyces cerevisiae (yeast) extract/ferment/ferment filtrate/ferment lysate	silver chloride	sodium cocoyl sarcosinate
filtrate/copper ferment	silver citrate	sodium cocoyl/olivoyl hydrolyzed oat protein
/iron ferment/magnesium ferment/silicon ferment/zinc ferment	silybum marianum	sodium coffee seedate
saccharum officinarum extract	simmondsia chinensis	sodium dehydroacetate
safflower oil/palm oil	siraitia grosvenorii fruit extract	sodium dihydrogen phosphate dihydrate
aminopropanediol esters	sisymbrium irio seed oil	sodium dilauramidoglutamide lysine
salicornia herbacea extract	snowflake shine powder	sodium erythorbate
salicylic acid	sodium acetate	sodium fluoride
salix alaxensis	sodium acetylated hyaluronate	sodium gluceptate
salix alba	sodium acrylate/sodium acryloyldimethyl taurate copolymer	sodium gluconate
salix nigra bark extract	sodium acrylates copolymer	sodium glutamate
salix purpurea bark extract*	sodium acrylates	sodium glycerophosphate
salvadora persica stem extract	crosspolymer-2	sodium glycolate
salvia hispanica	sodium almondate (sweet almond oil)	sodium hyaluronate
salvia officinalis (sage)	sodium anisate	sodium hyaluronate (tri-hyaluronan complex)
salvia sclarea	sodium ascorbate	sodium hyaluronate crosspolymer
sambucus nigra (elder)	sodium ascorbyl phosphate	sodium hydroxide
santalum acuminatum fruit extract	sodium avocadoate	sodium hydroxymethylglycinate
santalum album (sandalwood)	sodium bassasuate (saponified babassu oil)	sodium hydroxypropyl starch phosphate
santalum spicata wood oil	sodium beeswax	sodium hydroxypropylsulfonate
sapindus mukorossi	sodium benzoate	laurylglucoside crosspolymer
sapindus trifoliatus (soapberry)	sodium benzotriazolyl butylphenol sulfonate	sodium isethionate
saponaria officinalis (soapwort)	sodium bicarbonate	sodium isostearoyl lactylate
saururus chinensis extract	sodium c12-18 alkyl sulfate	sodium lactate
scenedesmus deserticola ferment extract	sodium c14-15 olefin sulfonate	sodium laneth-40 maleate/styrene sulfonate copolymer
schinus terebinthifolia	sodium c14-16 olefin sulfonate	sodium laurate
schizandra sphenanthera fruit extract	sodium caproyl prolinatate	
	sodium caproyl/lauroyl lactylate	

sodium laureth sulfate	sodium stearoyl lactylate	stearamidopropyl dimethylamine
sodium laureth-11 carboxylate	sodium sulfate	steareth-2
sodium laureth-12 sulfate	sodium sulfite	steareth-20
sodium laureth-5 carboxylate	sodium	steareth-21
sodium lauroyl glutamate	sunflowerseedamphoacetate	steareth-4
sodium lauroyl glycinate	sodium sunflowerseedate	steareth-6
sodium lauroyl isethionate	sodium surfactin	stearic acid
sodium lauroyl lactylate	sodium thiosulfate	stearoxypropyl dimethylamine
sodium lauroyl methyl isethionatesolanum indicum root extract	solanum lycopersicum (tomato)	stearoyl inulin
sodium lauroyl sarcosinate	solanum lycopersicum (tomato)	steatrimonium chloride
sodium lauryl glucose carboxylatefruit extract	fruit extract	stearyl alcohol
sodium lauryl glutamate	solanum melongena fruit extract	stearyl behenate
sodium lauryl sulfate	solanum xanthocarpum root	stearyl caprylate
sodium lauryl sulfoacetate	extract	stearyl dimethicone
sodium laurylglucosides	soluble collagen	stearyl glycyrrhetinate
hydroxypropylsulfonate	solum diatomeae	stearyl heptanoate
sodium levulinate	sophora flavescens root extract	stearyl stearate
sodium linoleate	sorbeth-30 tetraisostearate	stellaria media extract
sodium magnesium fluorosilicate	sorbic acid	stereospermum suaveolens root
sodium mango butterate	sorbitan caprylate	extract
sodium metabisulfite	sorbitan isostearate	stevia (rebiana)
sodium methyl cocoyl taurate	sorbitan laurate	stevia rebaudiana leaf/stem
sodium methyl isethionate	sorbitan oleate	extract
sodium methyl lauroyl taurate	sorbitan olivate	stevioside
sodium methyl oleoyl taurate	sorbitan sesquicaprylate	styrax benzoin (benzoin)
sodium methylparaben	sorbitan sesquiisostearate	styrax tonkinensis (benzoin)
sodium monofluorophosphate	sorbitan sesquioleate	styrene/acrylates copolymer
sodium myreth sulfate	sorbitan stearate	succinic acid
sodium myristate	sorbitan tristearate	succinoglycan
sodium nitrate	sorbitol	sucrose
sodium oleate	sorbitol/hydrogenated starch	sucrose acetate isobutyrate
sodium oleoyl sarcosinate	hydrolysate	sucrose cocoate
sodium olivate	sorbitol/sebacic acid copolymer	sucrose dilaurate
sodium palm kernelate	behenate	sucrose distearate
sodium palmate	soy acid	sucrose laurate
sodium palmitate	soy amino acids	sucrose palmitate
sodium pca	soy isoflavones	sucrose polystearate
sodium phosphate	sphingomonas ferment extract	sucrose stearate
sodium phytate	spilanthus acmella flower extract	sucrose trilaurate
sodium polyacrylate	spindus mukorossi (reetha fruit)	sulfated castor oil
sodium polyacrylate starch	spiraea ulmaria	sulfuric acid
sodium polyacryloyldimethyl	spirulina maxima extract	sunfloweroyl methylglucamide
taurate	spirulina platensis (spirulina	superoxide dismutase
sodium polyitaconate	algae)	swertia japonica extract
sodium riboflavin phosphate	squalane	symphytum officinale
sodium ricinoleate	squalene	synthetic beeswax
sodium saccharin	sr-hydrozoan polypeptide-1	synthetic fluorphlogopite
sodium salicylate	sr-spider polypeptide-1	synthetic sapphire
sodium seabuckthornseedate	starch hydroxypropyltrimonium	synthetic wax
sodium sesameseedate	chloride	syzygium aromaticum bark
sodium shea butterate	stearalkonium bentonite	extract
sodium silicate	stearalkonium chloride	tabebuia impetiginosa leaf extract
sodium stearate	stearalkonium hectorite	tagetes minuta flower oil
sodium stearoyl glutamate	stearamide amp	talc

taraxacum officinale (dandelion)	trideceth-10	urtica dioica (nettle)
tartaric acid	trideceth-12	urtica urens leaf extract
tasmannia lanceolata	trideceth-3	usnea barbata (lichen) extract
taurine	trideceth-6	v3161a
t-butyl alcohol	trideceth-7	v3767a
tephrosia purpurea seed extract	trideceth-8	vaccinium macrocarpon
terminalia bellerica fruit extract	trideceth-9	vaccinium myrtillus (blueberry)
terminalia chebula fruit extract	tridecyl trimellitate	vaccinium myrtillus (myrtle)
terminalia ferdinandiana fruit extract	triethanolamine	valeriana celtica (speick)
tetrahexyldecyl ascorbate	triethoxycaprylylsilane	valine
tetrahydroxypropyl ethylenediamine	triethoxysilylethyl polydimethylsiloxyethyl dimethicone	vanilla planifolia (vanilla)
tetramethyl acetyloctahydronaphthalenes	triethyl citrate	vanillin
tetrapotassium pyrophosphate	triethylene glycol	verbascum thapsus extract
tetrasodium	triethylhexanoin	verbena officinalis
tetrasodium disuccinoyl cystine	trifolium pratense (clover)	vetiveria zizanioides
tetrasodium edta	trigonella foenum graecum	vinegar extract (apple cider)
tetrasodium etidronate	triheptanoin	vinyl dimethicone/methicone silsesquioxane crosspolymer
tetrasodium glutamate diacetate	trihydroxystearin	viola tricolor extract
tetrasodium iminodisuccinate	trimethyl pentanyl diisobutyrate	vitamins
tetrasodium pyrophosphate	trimethylpentanediol/adipic acid/glycerin crosspolymer	vitis vinifera
theobroma cacao (organic cocoa)	trimethylpentanediyl dibenzoate	vp/dmapa acrylates copolymer
theobroma grandiflorum seed butter	trimethylsiloxy silicate	vp/eicosene copolymer
threonine	tripeptide-29	vp/hexadecene copolymer
thymol	tris(tetramethylhydroxypiperidinolwaxes) citrate	vp/va copolymer
thymus vulgaris (thyme)	trisiloxane	wasabia japonica root extract
tilia cordata (linden)	trisodium edta	waxes
tilia tomentosa	trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate	wheat amino acids
tin oxide	trisodium hedta	wine extract
titanium dioxide	trisodium phosphate	withania somnifera root extract
tocopherol	tristearin	xanthan gum
tocopheryl acetate	tritricum aestivum germ oil	ximenia perrieri seed oil
tocopheryl retinoate	tritricum vulgare	xylytol
tocotrienols	tromethamine	xylytolglucoside
tosylamide/epoxy resin	tropaeolum majus (indian cress) extract	zea mays
totarol	tropolone	zeolite
tourmaline	turpentine	zinc chloride
trachyspermum ammi fruit extract	turquoise	zinc citrate
trehalose	tussilago farfara (coltsfoot)	zinc coceth sulfate
tremella fuciformis	ubiquinone	zinc gluconate
tri(polyglyceryl-3/lauryl) hydrogenated trilinoleate	ulmus davidiana root extract	zinc lactate
triacetin	undaria pinnatifida extract	zinc laurate
tribehenin	undecane	zinc neodecanoate
tribulus terrestris root extract	undecyl alcohol	zinc oxide
tributyl citrate	undecylenic acid	zinc pca
tricalcium phosphate	undecylenoyl glycine	zinc phenolsulfonate
tricaprylin	uraria picta	zinc phenolsulfonate
tricitateareth-4 phosphate	urea	zinc ricinoleate
tridecane		zinc stearate
		zinc sulfate
		zingiber officinale
		zizyphus joazeiro bark extract
		zizyphus jujuba leaf extract

11 Annex III Complete list of ingredients in Beauty & personal care products without claims as mentioned in the Mintel GNPD

1,2-hexanediol	aesculus hippocastanum bark extract	arctium lappa root extract
1-methylhydantoin-2-imide	agar	argania spinosa kernel oil
2-benzylheptanol	alanine	arginine
2-bromo-2-nitropropane-1,3-diol	albizia julibrissin flower extract	arnica montana flower extract
2-oleamido-1,3-octadecanediol	alchemilla vulgaris extract	aroma
acacia decurrens	alcohol	artemisia princeps leaf extract
acacia senegal gum	alcohol denat.	arum maculatum root extract
acanthopanax senticosus root extract	alcohols	ascorbic acid
acer saccharum extract	aleurites moluccanus	ascorbyl glucoside
acetic acid	algae extract	ascorbyl palmitate
acetum	algin	asiaticoside
acetyl glucosamine	allantoin	aspalathus linearis extract
acetyl hexapeptide-8	allyl stearate/va copolymer	aspartic acid
acetyl octapeptide-3	aloe barbadensis	astrocaryum murumuru seed butter
acetyl tetrapeptide-3	aloe vera	avena sativa (oat)
acetyl tributyl citrate	alpha-isomethyl ionone	avena sativa bran
acetyl trifluoromethylphenyl valylglycine	alumina	bambusa arundinacea stem extract
acid orange 24	aluminium chlorohydrate	bambusa vulgaris
acid orange 7	aluminum benzoate	beeswax
acid red 52	aluminum calcium sodium silicate	behenamidopropyl
acid violet 43	aluminum hydroxide	dimethylamine
acid yellow 3	aluminum starch	behentrimonium chloride
acrylamide/ammonium acrylate copolymer	octenylsuccinate	behentrimonium methosulfate
acrylamide/sodium acryloyldimethyltaurate copolymer	aluminum zirconium tetrachlorohydrate gly	behenyl alcohol
acrylates copolymer	aminomethyl propanediol	behenyl behenate
acrylates crosspolymer-4	aminomethyl propanol	behenyl/octyldodecyl propanediol citrate
acrylates/beheneth-25 methacrylate copolymer	aminopropyl ascorbyl phosphate	crosspolymer
acrylates/c10-30 alkyl acrylate crosspolymer	ammonium	bentonite
acrylates/dimethicone copolymer	acryloyldimethyltaurate/vp copolymer	benzoic acid
acrylates/ethylhexyl acrylate copolymer	ammonium fluoride	benzophenone-1
acrylonitrile/methyl methacrylate/vinylidene chloride copolymer	ammonium hydroxide	benzophenone-2
adenosine	ammonium polyacryloyldimethyl taurate	benzyl acetate
adipic acid/neopentyl glycol/trimellitic anhydride copolymer	amodimethicone	benzyl alcohol
	amorphophallus konjac	benzyl benzoate
	amyl cinnamal	benzyl cinnamate
	anhydroxylitol	benzyl salicylate
	anise alcohol	beta-carotene
	anthemis nobilis	betaine
	aqua	betula alba leaf extract
	arachidyl alcohol	bht
	arbutin	biosaccharide gum-1
		biosaccharide gum-4
		bisabolol
		bis-aminopropyl dimethicone

bis-cetearyl amodimethicone	candelilla cera	ci 15985
bis-diglyceryl polyacyladipate-2	cannabis sativa	ci 16035
bis-diisopropanolamino-pg-propyl dimethicone/bis-isobutyl peg-14 copolymer	canola oil	ci 16255
bis-ethylhexyloxyphenol methoxyphenyl triazine	caprae lac	ci 17200
bis-peg/ppg-14/14 dimethicone	capric acid	ci 18965
bis-peg-18 methyl ether dimethyl silane	caprylhydroxamic acid	ci 19140
bis-stearyl dimethicone	caprylic acid	ci 28440
borago officinalis seed oil	caprylic/capric glycerides	ci 42051
brassica campestris	caprylic/capric triglyceride	ci 42053
brassica oleracea capitata (cabbage) leaf extract	capryloyl glycine	ci 42090
brassica oleracea italica (broccoli) extract	capryloyl salicylic acid	ci 47005
brassicamidopropyl dimethylamine	caprylyl glycol	ci 60725
butane	caprylyl/capryl glucoside	ci 60730
butyl acetate	caramel	ci 73360
butyl	carbomer	ci 73900
methoxydibenzoylmethane	carrageenan	ci 73915
butylene glycol	cedrus atlantica bark oil	ci 74160
butylene glycol	cellulose	ci 77007
dicaprylate/dicaprate	cellulose gum	ci 77120
butyloctanol	centaurea cyanus	ci 77266
butylphenyl methylpropional	centella asiatica	ci 77491
butyrospermum parkii (shea)	cera microcristallina	ci 77492
c10-18 triglycerides	ceramide ap	ci 77499 (black 11)
c11-15 alketh-7	ceramide eop	cinnamal
c12-15 alkyl benzoate	ceramide ng	cinnamomum camphora
c13-15 alkane	ceramide np	linalooliferum wood oil
c14-28 alkyl acid	ceratonia siliqua (carob) gum	cinnamyl alcohol
c14-28 isoalkyl acid	ceresin	citral
c15-19 alkane	cetareth-12	citrates
c30-45 alkyldimethylsilyl polypropylsilsesquioxane	cetareth-20	citric acid
caffeine	cetareth-25	citronellol
calcium aluminum borosilicate	cetareth-33	citrus aurantifolia
calcium chloride	cetearyl alcohol	citrus aurantium amara
calcium gluconate	cetearyl glucoside	citrus aurantium bergamia fruit oil
calcium lactate	cetearyl oivate	oil
calcium pantothenate	cetrimonium chloride	citrus aurantium dulcis (orange)
calcium sodium borosilicate	cetrimonium methosulfate	citrus bergamia peel oil expressed
calcium titanium borosilicate	cetyl alcohol	citrus junos fruit extract
calendula officinalis	cetyl esters	citrus limon fruit extract
calophyllum inophyllum seed oil	cetyl ethylhexanoate	citrus medica limonum
camellia japonica seed oil	cetyl hydroxyethylcellulose	citrus nobilis
camellia oleifera seed oil	cetyl palmitate	citrus paradisi fruit extract
camellia sinensis	cetyl stearate	citrus reticulata fruit extract
camphor	cetylpyridinium chloride	citrus unshiu peel extract
cananga odorata flower oil	chamomilla recutita flower extract	cocamide dea
	charcoal powder	cocamide mea
	chlorhexidine digluconate	cocamide mipa
	chlorphenesin	cocamidopropyl betaine
	cholesterol	cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine
	chondrus crispus	cocamidopropyl pg-dimonium chloride phosphate
	ci 14700	
	ci 14720	
	ci 15510	

coco-betaine	diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl	drometrizole trisiloxane
coco-caprylate	hexyl benzoate	ectoin
coco-caprylate/caprato	diethylhexyl butamido triazone	edta
cocodimonium hydroxypropyl	diethylhexyl	empetrum nigrum fruit juice
hydrolyzed keratin	syringylidenemalonate	emulsifying wax
coco-glucoside	diglycerin	equisetum arvense (horsetail)
coconut acid	diisopropyl sebacate	extract
coconut alcohol	diisostearoyl polyglyceryl-3	erythritol
coconut alkanes	dimer dilinoleate	esculin
cocos nucifera fruit	diisostearyl malate	ethoxydiglycol
cocos nucifera fruit extract	dilinoleic acid/butanediol	ethyl acetate
cocos nucifera oil	copolymer	ethyl ascorbic acid
cocoyl hydrolyzed collagen	dimethicone	ethyl ester of hydrolyzed silk
cocoyl hydrolyzed keratin	dimethicone crosspolymer	ethyl hexanediol
coffea arabica fruit powder	dimethicone/divinyldimethicone	ethyl macadamiate
collagen	/silsesquioxane crosspolymer	ethyl vanillin
collodion	dimethicone/peg-10/15	ethylene distearamide
colloidal oatmeal	crosspolymer	ethylene/acrylic acid copolymer
colophonium	dimethicone/vinyl dimethicone	ethylene/propylene copolymer
commiphora myrrha resin	crosspolymer	ethylene/va copolymer
extract	dimethiconol	ethylenediamine/stearyl dimer
copaifera officinalis resin	dimethyl ether	dilinoleate copolymer
copernicia cerifera cera	dimethylsilanol hyaluronate	ethylhexyl cocoate
coriandrum sativum (coriander)	dipalmitoylethyl	ethylhexyl isononanoate
seed oil	hydroxyethylmonium	ethylhexyl methoxycinnamate
cosmetic flavouring	methosulfate	ethylhexyl palmitate
coumarin	dipentaerythrityl	ethylhexyl salicylate
creatine	hexahydroxystearate/hexastear	ethylhexyl triazone
crocus sativus flower extract	ate/hexarosinate	ethylhexylglycerin
cucurbita maxima seed extract	dipentaerythrityl	ethylparaben
cucurbita pepo fruit extract	tetrahydroxystearate/tetraisost	etidronic acid
curcuma longa (turmeric) root	earate	eucalyptol
extract	dipeptide diaminobutyroyl	eucalyptus citriodora leaf
cyamopsis tetragonoloba gum	benzylamide diacetate	extract
cyclodextrin	dipeptide-15	eucalyptus globulus
cyclohexasiloxane	dipotassium glycyrrhizate	eugenol
cyclopentasiloxane	dipropylene glycol	euterpe oleracea sterols
cymbopogon martini herb oil	dipropylene glycol dibenzoate	faex extract
cymbopogon schoenanthus oil	disodium cocoamphodiacetate	farnesol
d260471/1	disodium cocoyl glutamate	fraxinus excelsior bark extract
daucus carota sativa	disodium distyrylbiphenyl	freesia refracta extract
decyl glucoside	disulfonate	fuller's earth
decyl oleate	disodium edta	fumaric acid
dehydroacetic acid	disodium laureth sulfosuccinate	galactoarabinan
dextran	disodium lauryl sulfosuccinate	gamma-nonolactone
dextrin	disodium phosphate	gardenia florida fruit extract
diacetone alcohol	disodium stearoyl glutamate	gardenia tahitensis flower
diaminopyrimidine oxide	distarch phosphate	gellan gum
diazolidinyl urea	disteardimonium hectorite	geraniol
dibutyl adipate	distearoylethyl dimonium	glucomannan
dicalcium phosphate	chloride	gluconic acid
dicaprylyl carbonate	distearyldimonium chloride	gluconolactone
dicaprylyl ether	disunfloweroylethyl dimonium	glutamic acid
dicetyldimonium chloride	chloride	glycereth-2 cocoate

glycereth-26	hydrogenated olive oil	hydroxypropyl oxidized starch
glycerin	unsaponifiables	pg-trimonium chloride
glyceryl acrylate/acrylic acid	hydrogenated palm glycerides	hydroxypropyl starch
copolymer	hydrogenated palm glycerides	phosphate
glyceryl behenate	citrate	hydroxypropylcellulose
glyceryl caprylate	hydrogenated palm oil	hydroxypropyltrimonium
glyceryl dibehenate	hydrogenated poly(c6-14	hydrolyzed rice
glyceryl oleate	olefin)	protein/siloxysilicate
glyceryl oleate citrate	hydrogenated polydecene	hydroxystearic acid
glyceryl polymethacrylate	hydrogenated polyisobutene	hypericum perforatum extract
glyceryl stearate	hydrogenated rapeseed oil	illicium verum (anise) fruit
glyceryl stearate citrate	hydrogenated soybean oil	extract
glyceryl stearate se	hydrogenated starch	imidazolidinyl urea
glyceryl undecylenate	hydrolysate	inulin
glycine	hydrogenated	iodopropynyl butylcarbamate
glycine soja oil	styrene/butadiene copolymer	iron oxide
glycine soja protein	hydrogenated styrene/methyl	irvingia gabonensis kernel
glycine soja seed extract	styrene/indene copolymer	butter
glycol distearate	hydrogenated vegetable oil	isobutane
glycol montanate	hydrolyzed collagen	isocetyl stearate
glycol stearate	hydrolyzed corn starch	isododecane
glycolic acid	hydrolyzed hyaluronic acid	isoeugenol
glycoproteins	hydrolyzed keratin	isohexadecane
glycyrrhiza glabra root extract	hydrolyzed rhodophyceae	isoleucine
glycyrrhiza inflata root extract	extract	isomerized linoleic acid
glyoxylic acid	hydrolyzed rice protein	isononyl isononanoate
gossypium herbaceum seed oil	hydrolyzed silk	isopentane
gossypium hirsutum (cotton)	hydrolyzed silk pg-propyl	isopropyl alcohol
extract	methylsilanediol	isopropyl isostearate
guar hydroxypropyltrimonium	hydrolyzed soy protein	isopropyl lauroyl sarcosinate
chloride	hydrolyzed sweet almond	isopropyl myristate
hamamelis virginiana (witch	protein	isopropyl palmitate
hazel)	hydrolyzed vegetable protein	isopropyl titanium triisostearate
hdi/trimethylol hexyllactone	pg-propyl silanetriol	isostearic acid
crosspolymer	hydrolyzed wheat protein	isostearyl isostearate
hectorite	hydroxyacetophenone	isostearyl neopentanoate
helianthus annuus	hydroxyapatite	jasminum officinale (jasmine)
hexapeptide-11	hydroxycitronellal	flower extract
hexyl cinnamal	hydroxyethyl acrylate/sodium	jojoba esters
hexylene glycol	acryloyldimethyl taurate	jojoba wax peg-120 esters
hibiscus sabdariffa	copolymer	juniperus communis
hippophae rhamnoides	hydroxyethylcellulose	juniperus sibirica needle
histidine	hydroxyethylpiperazine ethane	extract
homosalate	sulfonic acid	juniperus virginiana
hordeum vulgare extract	hydroxyisohexyl 3-cyclohexene	kaolin
houttuynia cordata extract	carboxaldehyde	keratin amino acids
hyaluronic acid	hydroxyphenyl	krameria triandra root extract
hydrated silica	propamidobenzoic acid	lactic acid
hydrogenated castor oil	hydroxyproline	lactis proteinum
hydrogenated coco-glycerides	hydroxypropyl guar	lactose
hydrogenated ethylhexyl	hydroxypropyl guar	laminaria saccharina extract
olivate	hydroxypropyltrimonium	lamium album flower extract
hydrogenated jojoba oil	chloride	lanolin
hydrogenated lecithin	hydroxypropyl methylcellulose	lanolin alcohol

lanolin cera	magnesium stearate	nymphaea alba flower extract
lanthanum chloride	magnesium sulfate	octadecyl di-t-butyl-4-
laureth-21	magnolia officinalis bark	hydroxyhydrocinnamate
laureth-23	extract	octenidine hcl
laureth-4	malic acid	octocrylene
laureth-5 carboxylic acid	maltodextrin	octyldodecanol
laureth-7	maltol	octyldodecyl citrate
laureth-9	maltooligosyl glucoside	crosspolymer
lauric acid	manihot utilisima starch	octyldodecyl pca
lauroyl lysine	mannitol	octyldodecyl stearyl stearate
laurtrimonium chloride	maris aqua	o-cymen-5-ol
laurus nobilis leaf oil	maris limus extract	olaflur
lauryl glucoside	maris sal	olea europaea (olive)
lauryl hydroxysultaine	mauritia flexuosa fruit oil	oleic acid
lauryl lactyl lactate	medicago sativa (alfalfa)	oleoyl tyrosine
lauryl peg-9	mel	oleyl alcohol
polydimethylsiloxoethyl	melaleuca alternifolia	olive oil polyglyceryl-6 esters
dimethicone	melia azadirachta seed oil	olus oil
lavandula angustifolia	melissa officinalis leaf extract	onopordum acanthium
(lavender)	mentha aquatica leaf extract	flower/leaf/stem extract
lavandula hybrida oil	mentha arvensis	opuntia ficus-indica (cactus)
lavandula officinalis extract	mentha piperita (peppermint)	opuntia ficus-indica extract
lecithin	mentha rotundifolia leaf extract	orbignya oleifera seed oil
lepidium sativum sprout extract	menthol	oryza sativa
leptospermum petersonii oil	menthone glycerin acetal	oryzanol
leuconostoc/radish root	menthyl acetate	ostrea shell extract
ferment filtrate	methyl salicylate	oxothiazolidinecarboxylic acid
levulinic acid	methyl trimethicone	ozokerite
limnanthes alba seed oil	methylchloroisothiazolinone	paeonia officinalis flower
limonene	methylheptyl isostearate	extract
limus	methylisothiazolinone	paeonia suffruticosa root
linalool	methylparaben	extract
linoleic acid	methylpropanediol	palmitic acid
linolenic acid	methylsilanol/silicate	palmitoyl hexapeptide-12
linum usitatissimum	crosspolymer	palmitoyl tetrapeptide-7
l-limonene	mica	palmitoyl tripeptide-1
lonicera caprifolium	microcrystalline cellulose	panax ginseng root extract
(honeysuckle)	mint flavour	pancratium maritimum extract
lonicera japonica (honeysuckle)	mipa-laureth sulfate	p-anisic acid
lophanthus anisatus extract	monarda didyma leaf extract	panthenol
luffa cylindrica seed oil	myristic acid	panthenyl hydroxypropyl
macadamia ternifolia seed oil	myristyl myristate	steardimonium chloride
madecassoside	myrtrimonium bromide	panthenyl triacetate
magnesium aluminum silicate	nacre powder	pantolactone
magnesium ascorbyl phosphate	n-butyl alcohol	papaver somniferum seed
magnesium chloride	nelumbium speciosum	paraffin
magnesium chloride	nelumbo nucifera flower extract	paraffinum liquidum
(hexhydrate)	neopentyl glycol diheptanoate	parfum
magnesium citrate	niacinamide	pca
magnesium laureth sulfate	nigella sativa seed oil	pearl powder
magnesium myristate	nylon	pectin
magnesium nitrate	nylon-12	peg/ppg/polybutylene glycol-
magnesium pca	nylon-611/dimethicone	8/5/3 glycerin
magnesium silicate	copolymer	peg/ppg-18/18 dimethicone

peg-10 dimethicone	perilla frutescens leaf extract	polyhydroxystearic acid
peg-100	perlite	polyisobutene
peg-100 stearate	persea gratissima oil	polymethyl methacrylate
peg-115m	petrolatum	polymethylsilsesquioxane
peg-12 dimethicone	phalaenopsis amabilis extract	polymethylsilsesquioxane/trime
peg-120 methyl glucose	phenethyl alcohol	thylsiloxysilicate
dioleate	phenoxyethanol	polypropylsilsesquioxane
peg-150 distearate	phenyl trimethicone	polyquaternium-10
peg-150 pentaerythrityl	phenylalanine	polyquaternium-39
tetrastearate	phenylbenzimidazole sulfonic	polyquaternium-7
peg-150/decyl alcohol/smdi	acid	polysilicone-11
copolymer	phenylethyl resorcinol	polysilicone-15
peg-160m	phenylpropanol	polysilicone-28
peg-18 glyceryl oleate/cocoate	phospholipids	polysorbate 20
peg-180m	phosphoric acid	polysorbate 60
peg-2 stearate	phyllanthus emblica fruit	polysorbate 80
peg-20 stearate	extract	polyurethane-35
peg-200 glyceryl stearate	phytic acid	polyvinyl laurate
peg-200 hydrogenated glyceryl	phytosphingosine	pongamia glabra seed oil
palmate	phytosteryl/octyldodecyl	pongamol
peg-2m	lauroyl glutamate	populus tremuloides bark
peg-3 distearate	pinus sibirica seed oil	extract
peg-30 glyceryl stearate	pinus sylvestris leaf extract	potassium acesulfame
peg-32	piper nigrum fruit oil	potassium cetyl phosphate
peg-4	piroctone olamine	potassium chloride
peg-4 dilaurate	plantago major leaf extract	potassium cocoate
peg-4 laurate	pogostemon cablin	potassium hydroxide
peg-4 rapeseedamide	poloxamer 101	potassium isostearate
peg-40 castor oil	poloxamer 124	potassium laurelate
peg-40 hydrogenated castor oil	poloxamer 184	potassium nitrate
peg-400/1,4-butanediol/smdi	poloxamer 407	potassium olivate
copolymer	poly c10-30 alkyl acrylate	potassium palmitate
peg-45m	polybutene	potassium sorbate
peg-50 shea butter	polyepsilon-lysine	ppg-15 stearyl ether
peg-55 propylene glycol oleate	polyester	ppg-17/ipdi/dmpa copolymer
peg-6	polyester-37	ppg-2 hydroxyethyl cocamide
peg-6 caprylic/capric glycerides	polyethylene	ppg-26-buteth-26
peg-60 hydrogenated castor oil	polyglycerin-3	ppg-3 benzyl ether myristate
peg-7 glyceryl cocoate	polyglyceryl-10 laurate	ppg-5-ceteth-20
peg-7 propylheptyl ether	polyglyceryl-2 caprate	ppg-6
peg-8	polyglyceryl-2	ppg-9
peg-8 dimethicone	dipolyhydroxystearate	proline
peg-8 laurate	polyglyceryl-2 triisostearate	propane
peg-9m	polyglyceryl-3 caprate	propanediol
pelargonium graveolens flower	polyglyceryl-3 diisostearate	propolis extract
oil	polyglyceryl-3 oleate	propyl gallate
pentaerythrityl tetra-di-t-butyl	polyglyceryl-3 palmitate	propylene carbonate
hydroxyhydrocinnamate	polyglyceryl-3 polyricinoleate	propylene glycol
pentaerythrityl	polyglyceryl-4 caprate	propylene glycol
tetraethylhexanoate	polyglyceryl-4 caprylate	dicaprylate/dicaprate
pentaerythrityl tetraisostearate	polyglyceryl-4 isostearate	propylheptyl caprylate
pentasodium pentetate	polyglyceryl-4	propylparaben
pentasodium triphosphate	laurate/succinate	prunus amygdalus dulcis
pentylene glycol	polyglyceryl-6 polyricinoleate	prunus armeniaca

prunus persica	silica	sodium lauryl sulfate
prunus spinosa fruit juice	silica silylate	sodium levulinate
pseudozyma epicola/camellia	silk amino acids	sodium metabisulfite
sinensis seed oil ferment	simethicone	sodium methyl cocoyl taurate
extract filtrate	simmondsia chinensis seed oil	sodium methyl oleoyl taurate
pumice	sine adipe lac	sodium methylparaben
punica granatum	sodium acetate	sodium monofluorophosphate
pvm/ma copolymer	sodium acrylate/sodium	sodium myreth sulfate
pvp	acryloyldimethyl taurate	sodium oleate
pyridoxine hcl	copolymer	sodium olivate
pyrus malus fruit extract	sodium anisate	sodium palm kernelate
quaternium-18	sodium ascorbyl phosphate	sodium palmate
quaternium-80	sodium benzoate	sodium palmitate
quaternium-87	sodium bicarbonate	sodium pca
quaternium-91	sodium bisulfite	sodium peg-7 olive oil
raphanus sativus (radish) seed	sodium c14-16 olefin sulfonate	carboxylate
extract	sodium castorate	sodium phosphate
rayon	sodium cetearyl sulfate	sodium phytate
rebaudioside a	sodium chloride	sodium polyacrylate
red 7 (ci 15850)	sodium citrate	sodium polyacrylate starch
retinyl palmitate	sodium cocoamphoacetate	sodium polymethacrylate
rhizobian gum	sodium cocoate	sodium pyruvate
rhodiola rosea root extract	sodium coco-sulfate	sodium saccharin
rhus succedanea fruit cera	sodium cocoyl glutamate	sodium salicylate
ricinus communis (castor)	sodium cocoyl hydrolyzed silk	sodium starch octenylsuccinate
rosa canina	sodium cocoyl isethionate	sodium stearate
rosa damascena	sodium cocoyl methyl	sodium stearoyl glutamate
rosmarinus officinalis	isethionate	sodium stearoyl lactylate
rubus idaeus seed oil	sodium dehydroacetate	sodium sulfate
saccharide isomerate	sodium fluoride	sodium xylenesulfonate
saccharin	sodium gluconate	solum diatomeae
saccharum officinarum extract	sodium hempsedate	sorbic acid
salicylic acid	sodium hexametaphosphate	sorbitan caprylate
salicyloyl phytosphingosine	sodium hyaluronate	sorbitan isostearate
salix nigra bark extract	sodium hydroxide	sorbitan laurate
salvia hispanica seed oil	sodium hydroxypropyl starch	sorbitan oleate
salvia officinalis water	phosphate	sorbitan olivate
salvia sclarea extract	sodium isethionate	sorbitan palmitate
santalum album (sandalwood)	sodium isostearate	sorbitan sesquicaprylate
sarcosine	sodium isostearoyl lactylate	sorbitan stearate
schisandra chinensis extract	sodium lactate	sorbitol
sclerocarya birrea seed oil	sodium laurate	soy amino acids
scutellaria baicalensis root	sodium laureth sulfate	squalane
extract	sodium lauroamphoacetate	stannous fluoride
sd alcohol 39-c	sodium lauroyl aspartate	starch hydroxypropyltrimonium
sd alcohol 40-b	sodium lauroyl glutamate	chloride
serica powder	sodium lauroyl glycinate	stearalkonium bentonite
sericin	sodium lauroyl isethionate	stearalkonium hectorite
serine	sodium lauroyl lactylate	stearamide amp
sesamum indicum (sesame)	sodium lauroyl methyl	stearamidopropyl
shea butter peg-8 esters	isethionate	dimethylamine
sigesbeckia orientalis (st. paul's	sodium lauroyl sarcosinate	steardimonium hydroxypropyl
wort) extract	sodium lauryl glucose	hydrolyzed keratin
silanetriol	carboxylate	steareth-2

steareth-20	trideceth-10	vitreoscilla ferment
steareth-21	trideceth-12	vp/eicosene copolymer
steareth-6	trideceth-3	vp/va copolymer
stearic acid	trideceth-6	waxes
stearoxypropyl dimethylamine	trideceth-9	wheat amino acids
steartrimonium chloride	tridecyl trimellitate	whey protein
stearyl alcohol	triethanolamine	xanthan gum
stearyl stearate	triethoxycaprylylsilane	xylitol
styrene/acrylates copolymer	triethoxysilylethyl	xylitylglucoside
styrene/acrylates/ammonium	polydimethylsiloxyethyl	yucca schidigera root extract
methacrylate copolymer	dimethicone	zb hydrolysed wheat proteins
styrene/butadiene copolymer	triethyl citrate	powder (100%) (wm <3.500
succinic acid	triethylene glycol	da)
sucralose	triethylhexanoin	zea mays
sucrose	trifolium pratense (clover)	zinc chloride
sucrose acetate isobutyrate	flower extract	zinc lactate
sucrose cocoate	trihydroxystearin	zinc oxide
sucrose palmitate	trimethyl pentanyl	zinc pca
sucrose polystearate	diisobutyrate	zinc phosphate
sucrose stearate	trimethyl pentaphenyl	zinc stearate
sunflower seed oil glycerides	trisiloxane	zinc sulfate
sweet almond oil polyglyceryl-6	trimethylpentanediol/adipic	zingiber officinale root extract
esters	acid/glycerin crosspolymer	
symphytum officinale leaf	trimethylsiloxyphenyl	
extract	dimethicone	
synthetic beeswax	trimethylsiloxy silicate	
synthetic fluorphlogopite	tripeptide-29	
synthetic wax	tris(tetramethylhydroxypiperidi	
talc	no) citrate	
tartaric acid	trisodium edta	
t-butyl alcohol	trisodium ethylenediamine	
tea-dodecylbenzenesulfonate	disuccinate	
tea-sulfate	trisodium phosphate	
terminalia ferdinandiana fruit	triticum vulgare	
extract	tromethamine	
tetrapotassium pyrophosphate	tropolone	
tetrasodium edta	tuber melanosporum extract	
tetrasodium etidronate	ubiquinone	
tetrasodium glutamate	undecane	
diacetate	undecylenic acid	
tetrasodium pyrophosphate	undecylenoyl glycine	
theobroma cacao seed butter	urea	
threonine	urtica dioica (nettle)	
thymol	vaccinium macrocarpon fruit	
thymus vulgaris herb extract	extract	
tin oxide	vaccinium myrtillus fruit extract	
titanium dioxide	valine	
tocopherol	vanilla planifolia fruit extract	
tocopheryl acetate	vinyl	
trehalose	caprolactam/vp/dimethylamino	
tremella fuciformis extract	ethyl methacrylate copolymer	
tribehenin	vinyl dimethicone/methicone	
tricaprylin	silsesquioxane crosspolymer	
tridecane	vitis vinifera	

Published by:

**National Institute for Public Health
and the Environment, RIVM**

P.O. Box 1 | 3720 BA Bilthoven

The Netherlands

www.rivm.nl/en

February 2024

Committed to
health and sustainability